

# Report on the review of The ILO Decent Work Country Programme: Cambodia 2008–2010

Cambodia





Report on the review of

# **The ILO Decent Work Country Programme: Cambodia 2008–2010**

Copyright © International Labour Organization 2011  
First published 2011

Publications of the International Labour Office enjoy copyright under Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. Nevertheless, short excerpts from them may be reproduced without authorization, on condition that the source is indicated. For rights of reproduction or translation, application should be made to ILO Publications (Rights and Permissions), International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland, or by email: [pubdroit@ilo.org](mailto:pubdroit@ilo.org). The International Labour Office welcomes such applications.

Libraries, institutions and other users registered with reproduction rights organizations may make copies in accordance with the licences issued to them for this purpose. Visit [www.ifro.org](http://www.ifro.org) to find the reproduction rights organization in your country.

---

ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific

Report on the review of the ILO Decent Work Country Programme Cambodia 2008-2010 / ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific. – Bangkok: ILO, 2011  
ix, 83 p.

ISBN: 978-92-2-125551-2

ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific

decent work / technical cooperation / ILO Programme / programme evaluation / Cambodia

13.01.1

*ILO Cataloguing in Publication Data*

---

The designations employed in ILO publications, which are in conformity with United Nations practice, and the presentation of material therein do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the International Labour Office concerning the legal status of any country, area or territory or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers.

The responsibility for opinions expressed in signed articles, studies and other contributions rests solely with their authors, and publication does not constitute an endorsement by the International Labour Office of the opinions expressed in them.

Reference to names of firms and commercial products and processes does not imply their endorsement by the International Labour Office, and any failure to mention a particular firm, commercial product or process is not a sign of disapproval.

ILO publications and electronic products can be obtained through major booksellers or ILO local offices in many countries, or direct from ILO Publications, International Labour Office, CH-1211 Geneva 22, Switzerland, or ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific, 11<sup>th</sup> Floor, United Nations Building, Rajdamnern Nok Avenue, Bangkok 10200, Thailand, or by email: [BANGKOK@ilo.org](mailto:BANGKOK@ilo.org). Catalogues or lists of new publications are available free of charge from the above address, or by email: [pubvente@ilo.org](mailto:pubvente@ilo.org)

Visit our website: [www.ilo.org/publns](http://www.ilo.org/publns)

---

Printed in Thailand

# PREFACE

---

The Country Programme Reviews (CPRs) are management tools managed and coordinated by the Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (RO-Asia and the Pacific) in consultation with Country Offices who are in charge of designing and delivering Decent Work Country Programmes (DWCPs). As such, they are a participatory self-evaluation tool used to review the design of a country programme, examine recent performance against stated outcomes, determine what has been achieved, whether outputs are being converted into expected outcomes, and whether the strategies being used are effective and efficient.

The CPR constitutes an additional level of effort above what is required for annual progress reports, because it is to be carried out with the participation of ILO constituents and other UN and national partners, as appropriate. It enables constituents and other agencies to review the ILO's performance in delivering planned outputs and supporting the achievement of outcomes. It also provides a means for gathering feedback from our partners regarding collaboration and coherence within a larger multi-agency context.

The CPR focuses on the outcomes and guiding strategies of the DWCP to identify where and how improvements can be made. It enables constituents and partners to consider future strategies and actions. The CPRs also expose constituents and ILO staff to the concepts and practice of results-based management in country programmes, and enhance national ownership of the review process.

The review of the DWCP for Cambodia was requested by the ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao People's Democratic Republic (CO-Bangkok). It took place between January and March 2011. It was managed by the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Officer of the RO-Asia and the Pacific and jointly conducted by the Regional Programming Services Unit and an external evaluator. Extensive and participatory consultations were held throughout the process, including the organization of the scoping mission by the Regional Monitoring and Evaluation Officer to meet with ILO staff and tripartite constituents in Cambodia, the preparation of terms of references, and the consultations with partners and key stakeholders, the tripartite stakeholders' workshop, and the solicitation from key stakeholders and constituents of inputs to the draft report. Substantive inputs were also provided by ILO experts from the CO-Bangkok and the Decent Work Technical Support Team in Bangkok.

I wish to express my appreciation to the CO-Bangkok for initiating and supporting the CPR, and to our Cambodian tripartite constituents in their active participation in the process, to the authors, Mr Paul Cunningham, Mr Oktavianto Pasaribu and Ms Pamornrat Pringsulaka, for conducting the review and preparing the report, and to all concerned who contributed to the review process and the report. I believe that the conclusions, recommendations and lessons learned will be useful for ILO units concerned both at headquarters and field levels and in particular CO-Bangkok, ILO tripartite constituents and partners, policy-makers, researchers, other UN agencies in our joint efforts to make better progress towards achieving decent work goals in Cambodia.

Considering DWCP as the main instrument for ILO cooperation with member States throughout the world, I hope that this review report will contribute to the generation of knowledge on how to strategically design, implement the DWCP, and to make progress towards the realization of the Asian Decent Work Decade, 2006-2015.

Sachiko Yamamoto  
Regional Director  
Asia and the Pacific



# CONTENTS

<b>PREFACE</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>ABBREVIATIONS</b>	<b>ix</b>
<b>1. INTRODUCTION AND METHODOLOGY</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>2. COUNTRY CONTEXT</b>	<b>2</b>
2.1 Overview	2
2.2 The Decent Work Country Programme 2008–2010 in Cambodia	4
<b>3. FINDINGS ON THE APPROPRIATENESS AND ADEQUACY OF THE PROGRAMME DESIGN, OUTREACH/PARTNERSHIP AND IMPLEMENTING PERFORMANCE</b>	<b>7</b>
3.1 The role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage and UN partnership approach	7
3.2 Tripartite participation and partnership	8
3.3 The focus and coherence of programme's design and strategies	10
3.4 Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO's contributions and support at national level	11
3.5 The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO programme in Cambodia	13
3.6 Knowledge management and sharing	15
<b>4. ASSESSMENT OF PROGRESS MADE TOWARDS DWCP OUTCOMES</b>	<b>17</b>
4.1 Priority area A: Employment and skills development strategies for productive employment	17
4.2 Priority area B: Labour governance and rights	20
4.3 Priority area C: Social protection enhanced for targeted groups	26
4.4 Predefined outcomes	28
<b>5. PRELIMINARY SUGGESTIONS ON THE PRIORITY AREAS AND THEMES FOR THE DWCP 2011–2015</b>	<b>32</b>
<b>6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	<b>34</b>
<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>39</b>
ANNEX I Terms of reference	40
ANNEX II Mapping of country programme outcomes	52
ANNEX III Persons consulted	54
ANNEX IV Progress towards outcomes	58
ANNEX V Plenary feedback on the preliminary findings during the DWCP review workshop	79
ANNEX VI Suggested priority areas and themes/issues for the DWCP 2011–2015 from the review workshop	81

**LIST OF TABLES**

3.1.	Budget breakdown by DWCP outcome (2008–2010)	12
4.1	Progress against indicators related to DWCP outcomes (outcomes 1–4)	31
5.1	Examples of outputs provided to groups by priority area	32
5.2	Priority areas suggested by groups	32
5.3	Emerging (potential) consensus on priority areas (based on the groups' outputs)	33
6.1	Performance scores for the DWCP reviews 2007 and 2010	37
6.2	Summary of progress towards DWCP indicators	38



# EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The objective of the Decent Work country programme review 2008–2010 is to reflect and analyse lessons learned on how the International Labour Organization (ILO) could improve the effectiveness of its operations in the next Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Cambodia. Following a desk review of documents and two days of meetings with ILO staff in the Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (RO-Asia and the Pacific), the Decent Work Team for East and South-East Asia and the Pacific (DWT-Bangkok) and Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao People's Democratic Republic (CO-Bangkok),<sup>1</sup> the three members of the review team spent six working days conducting semi-structured interviews with a range of programme actors in Phnom Penh. The analytical framework applied was based on the assessment criteria prescribed by the review team's terms of reference. Preliminary findings and recommendations were presented at the end of the team's Phnom Penh visit in a review workshop, in which participants provided feedback and, through group work, developed initial suggestions on the priorities and themes for the DWCP 2011–2015.

## Findings on the appropriateness and adequacy of the programme design, outreach/partnership and implementing performance:

*The role and relevance of the ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage and the UN partnership approach*

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as satisfactory.

*Tripartite participation and partnership*

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately unsatisfactory.

**Recommendation 1:** Continue to support the process of establishing the inter-ministerial coordination committee that has been discussed. As an interim measure, establish a temporary tripartite advisory body.

**Recommendation 2:** Make additional efforts to fully engage constituents and other actors from the *beginning* of the process to develop the next DWCP. Document the process thoroughly, so that lessons can be drawn by the next DWCP review.

*The focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies*

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately satisfactory.

**Recommendation 3:** The ILO, together with tripartite constituents and other actors, should try to develop priority areas and, especially, outcomes for the next DWCP that are more focused and contextualized.

**Recommendation 4:** The next DWCP should follow ILO guidance in terms of the number of outcomes, but the review team recognizes that ILO global programme and budgeting systems impose some constraints.<sup>2</sup>

**Recommendation 5:** The next DWCP needs to ensure that gender issues are considered in depth at each stage of the design process and that specific actions and targets are included in the final DWCP design. Gender sensitivity/responsiveness training should be provided for all ILO country office staff and technical specialists.

*Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO contributions and support at the national level*

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately satisfactory.

**Recommendation 6:** Monitoring and evaluation systems need to be significantly improved for the next DWCP, a requirement that is in turn closely linked with the design of the DWCP.

1 The ILO Country Offices for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao People's Democratic Republic are all located in Bangkok, as is the sole Country Director for all three countries.

2 The ILO recommends no more than three outcomes per priority area; for the 2010–2011 biennium, there are 11 Country programme outcomes for three priority areas. A relevant issue here is that for a country office initiative to be "visible" to ILO headquarters (notably for funding purposes) in the form of a programme and budget indicator, a corresponding country programme outcome has to be created. This has been one factor behind the increase in the number of outcomes to 11 (plus three predefined outcomes).

**Recommendation 7:** A risk assessment and risk management strategy should be incorporated into the next DWCP as well as the next version of the DWCP guidelines.

*The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO programme in Cambodia*  
Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately satisfactory.

**Recommendation 8:** The systematic exchange of information on a periodic basis between technical specialists (through regular meetings) should be facilitated by the country and/or regional offices.

**Recommendation 9:** Given that it is highly unlikely that an in-country country office will be established, ILO must ensure that the National Coordinator and the Joint Project Office have adequate (additional) financial resources to perform programmatic and administrative coordinating functions.

**Recommendation 10:** Develop a work organigram for CO-Bangkok and the Joint Project Office and share it among all ILO staff and constituents.

*Knowledge management and sharing*

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately unsatisfactory.

**Recommendation 11:** Linked to the improvements in overall country programme coordination and DWCP monitoring and evaluation already suggested, efforts should be made (in collaboration with programme actors) to feed the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) findings into the knowledge base more systematically. Efforts should also be made to disseminate knowledge more effectively among DWCP actors, including the UN Country Team and, where appropriate, more broadly (a quarterly newsletter was suggested).

**Recommendation 12:** The ILO should develop a communications strategy specifically focused on the DWCP. More generally, the ILO should use its significant achievements in Cambodia as the basis for a campaign to raise its public profile.

**Recommendation 13:** Consider translating certain sections of the ILO Cambodia website into Khmer and provide links to Khmer language versions of publications and other documents.

The overall average performance rating for the DWCP 2008–2010 was moderately satisfactory, which is the same as the rating awarded by the 2007 biennial country programme review. However, the 2007 review used a different methodology and thus the results of the two reviews are not strictly comparable.

## Findings regarding progress towards DWCP outcomes

Section 4 of this report presents an assessment of progress towards the DWCP outcomes, assigning scores to each outcome on the basis of criteria specified in the terms of reference.

Progress could not be rigorously assessed because of the problems concerning DWCP M&E and due to the limited time available for the review. Additionally, outcome scores can be significantly influenced by factors external to ILO activities; for example, the cutting of funding by a donor can reduce an outcome's overall score (due to a low score for resource adequacy) for reasons unconnected with the quality of ILO work. For these reasons, the team leader considers the scores to be highly subjective and of limited utility.

**Recommendation 14:** The approach prescribed in the terms of reference for assessing progress towards DWCP outcomes should be revised. If it is mandatory to continue with some type of scoring system, it should at a minimum distinguish between the performance of the ILO (regarding factors within its control) and the influence of external factors (beyond ILO control). At present, the overall score for each outcome conflates these factors.

# ABBREVIATIONS

ACT/EMP	The Bureau for Employers' Activities of the ILO
ADB	Asian Development Bank
APHEDA	Australian People for Health, Education and Development Abroad
ASEAN	Association of Southeast Asian Nations
CAMFEBA	Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations
CARD	Council for Agricultural and Rural Development
CBA	collective bargaining agreements
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CISP	Creative Industries Support Programme
CMDGs	Cambodia Millennium Development Goals
CO-Bangkok	ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao People's Democratic Republic
CTA	Chief Technical Adviser
DANIDA	Danish International Development Agency
DWCP	Decent Work Country Programme
DWT	Decent Work Technical Support Team
DWT-Bangkok	ILO DWT for East and South-East Asia and the Pacific
EEOW	ILO-Japan Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women
EFA	Education for All
EIIP	Employment-Intensive Investment Programme
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
GIZ	German Society for International Cooperation (Deutsche Gesellschaft für Internationale Zusammenarbeit)
HIV/AIDS	human immunodeficiency virus and acquired immune deficiency syndrome
IEC	information, education and communication
ILO	International Labour Organization
INCLUDE	Inclusion for People with Disabilities
IPEC	International Programme to Eliminate Child Labour
ITP	Support to Indigenous Peoples
JPO	Joint Project Office
LDRP	Labour Dispute Resolution Project
MAP	Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work in Developing Countries
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MIME	Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy
MOEYS	Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport
MOLVT	Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training
MOU	memorandum of understanding
MRD	Ministry of Rural Development
MSI	Marie Stopes International
NEA	National Employment Agency
NGO	non-governmental organization
NSDP	National Strategic Development Plan
NSPS	National Social Protection Strategy
NSSF	National Social Security Fund
NZAID	New Zealand Agency for International Development
OSH	occupational safety and health
P&B	programme and budget
RB	regular budget
RBSA	Regular Budget Supplementary Account
RBTC	regular budget for technical cooperation
Rectangular Strategy	Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency
RO-Asia and the Pacific	Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific
SMM-IP	Strategic Management Module-Implementation Plan
TICW	Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women
TOR	terms of reference
TRIANGLE	Tripartite Action to Protect Migrants within and from the Greater Mekong Subregion from Labour Exploitation
TVET	technical and vocational education and training
TVTC	technical and vocational training centres
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNESCO	United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization
UNIFEM	United Nations Development Fund for Women, now UN Women
WEDGE	Women Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality Project
WISCON	Work Improvement in Small Construction Sites
WISH	Work Improvement for Safe Home
XBTC	extra-budgetary resources for technical cooperation



# 1. INTRODUCTION AND METHODOLOGY

---

## Objective

The objective of the review is to provide an opportunity for reflection and lesson learning regarding how the ILO could improve the effectiveness of its operations in the next Decent Work Country Programme (DWCP) for Cambodia (see terms of reference in Annex I).

## Scope

The scope of the review encompassed two main components. The first involved “a review of the appropriateness and adequacy of the programme design, outreach/partnership and implementation performance”. The second was “an operational assessment to report on progress being made on tangible outcomes directly resulting from ILO contributions”. The time period covered by the review was January 2008 to December 2010.

## Methodology

The review team consisted of Paul Cunningham (independent consultant and team leader), Pamornrat Pringsulaka and Oktavianto Pasaribu (Monitoring and Evaluation (M&E) Officer and Programme Analyst, respectively, in the ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific (RO-Asia and the Pacific)). Following a desk review of key documents and two days of meetings with ILO staff in the RO-Asia and the Pacific and the ILO Country Office for Thailand, Cambodia and Lao People's Democratic Republic (CO-Bangkok) the team spent six working days conducting semi-structured interviews with a range of programme actors in Phnom Penh. The analytical framework applied was based on the assessment criteria prescribed by the review team's TOR (Annex I) which also shaped the format for sections 3 and 4 of this report. Preliminary findings and recommendations were presented at the end of the team's Phnom Penh visit in a workshop attended by around 50 stakeholder representatives, who provided feedback (Annex IV). Through facilitated group work, the representatives developed initial suggestions for priorities and themes for the DWCP 2011–2015 (section 5 and Annex VI). All the activities provided input to this review report, which was circulated to all programme actors for feedback prior to finalizing.

## Constraints

The main constraint in conducting the review was the limited time available for interviews and document review. The ILO programme in Cambodia is relatively large and encompasses a range of sectors and actors. Rigorously reviewing each of the 14 outcomes and their constituent projects was impossible. For this reason, the team leader considers the scores assigned to the outcomes in section 4 and Annex IV of this report to be highly subjective and of limited utility.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The review team members are not unanimous in their view concerning the constraints of the methodology of the country programme review. The team leader believes that the scores imply a degree of rigour that simply cannot be justified given the various constraints to the review process, and all readers of the report need to be made aware of this so that they can judge the contents accordingly. The members of the review team think, however, that the scores should be used as a relative indication of the areas that may need the most attention or improvement in ILO management rather than as an absolute comparison.

## 2. CONTEXT

### 2.1 Overview

#### *Economic situation*

Following three decades of conflict that only ended in 1993, Cambodia has made significant developmental progress. Having experienced years of strong economic growth (averaging 9.3 per cent in the decade to 2007), the country was hit hard, however, by the global economic crisis due to the undiversified nature of its economy, which relies largely on garment exports, tourism and agriculture. Economic recovery is now underway, with growth forecasted to reach only 6 per cent in 2011 (World Bank, 2010).

Cambodia's exports are overwhelmingly dominated by garments, which account for approximately 70 per cent of total export value and are predominantly focused on the United States and European Union markets. In 2008, garment exports amounted to US\$2.98 billion, up from US\$2.87 billion in 2007. In last quarter 2008, however, the impacts of the global economic crisis became apparent, and in 2009, Cambodia's garment exports contracted by 18.9 per cent. US Trade Department statistics show that the Cambodian garment sector was among the worst affected in the Asia-Pacific region (ILO, 2010a). By November 2009, around 23 per cent of factories had closed, with those remaining open often operating at only 60–70 per cent capacity. According to the Cambodian Ministry of Commerce (cited in ILO, 2010b), the factory closures led to the lay-off of 75,500 workers, or 21 per cent of the total workforce. Because the majority of garment workers are women migrating from poor rural areas, the impacts of the global economic crisis affected some of the most vulnerable members of society. Preliminary results of several studies suggest that garment workers were forced to adopt undesirable coping strategies (such as reducing expenditure on food and healthcare) during the crisis.

In line with the broader economy, signs of recovery in the garment industry have recently emerged. Data from last quarter 2009 and early January 2010 indicate that the numbers of factories and workers were stabilizing; in January 2010, for the first time since December 2008, garment exports slightly increased (7.3 per cent) year-on-year (ILO, 2010a). The European Union's Everything But Arms initiative, which provides duty-free and quota-free access for exports - with the exception of armaments - from least developed countries has had a role in enabling the Cambodian garment industry to increase its exports to the European Union.

The overall operating environment for investors in Cambodia remains challenging: foreign direct investment is recovering at a slower rate than the overall economy (World Bank, 2010), discouraged by poor and inconsistently applied regulations and customs processes as well as high domestic electricity prices. In terms of further economic diversification, agriculture has significant potential but is currently constrained by low levels of productivity as well as considerable natural resource management issues.

#### *Government development strategy*

The National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP) is the primary operational document for the development strategy of the Royal Government of Cambodia. The NSDP is the roadmap for implementing the Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency, which is the socio-economic policy agenda that brings together elements from the Cambodia Millennium Development Goals (CMDGs), the Socio-Economic Development Plan (a localized Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper), the Ministry of Women's Affairs Five-Year Strategic Plan 2009–2013 (Neary Rattanak III) and various sector strategies and programmes. The NSDP Update (2009–2013) was prepared to synchronize the NSDP with the term of the Parliament's fourth legislature and to ensure that the actions envisaged took into account the impact of the global economic crisis on the Cambodian economy. Through the NSDP, the Government places significant emphasis on government ownership and leadership of its development agenda. In line with the Paris Declaration on Aid Effectiveness and the Accra Agenda for Action, the Ministry of Planning's home page states that "Government and external development partners are expected to strictly adhere to the priorities set out in the NSDP".

According to the most recent Human Development Index, Cambodia ranks 137<sup>th</sup> of 182 countries assessed (UNDP, 2009). The updated NSDP targets economic growth at 6 per cent a year and gross domestic product per capita at US\$981 by 2013 (up from US\$738 in 2008). According to Cambodia's Millennium Development Goals Monitoring Update Report, prepared by the Ministry of Planning (September 2010), the country has made substantial progress towards achieving its MDGs in many areas. However, high rates of broad-based economic growth and pro-poor policies will be crucial to realize the Government's goal of reducing the poverty rate (which was 30 per cent in 2008) to 19.5 per cent by 2015 (World Bank, 2010) as well as addressing the problem of increasing inequality. To help, private sector development has become a priority for the Government, as the NSDP makes clear: "For the Royal Government, the most formidable development challenge has been and continues to be the development of the private sector, which is the engine of economic growth to achieve reduction of poverty and improve the livelihoods and quality of life of the rapidly growing Cambodian population."

## *Issues related to the Decent Work Agenda*

Drawing on the 1998 and 2008 census results and augmented by data from the World Bank, line ministries and other sources, *Labour and Social Trends in Cambodia 2010* (NIS/ILO, 2010) provides significant insights into the challenges confronting the Government. Those that are relevant to the mandate of the ILO include the following:

- Cambodia has a young population, with 22.3 per cent aged between 15 and 24 years and one third younger than 14 years (the latter represents a wave of young people who will soon begin entering the job market). Creating opportunities for decent work for young people should be a major priority.
- Around 83 per cent of the employed population (85.9 per cent of women) are in some form of vulnerable employment, one of the highest rates in the Asia-Pacific region. This is in a context in which social protection is very limited or non-existent; for example, many garment workers were forced to rely on detrimental coping mechanisms in response to the impact of the global economic crisis (reducing food and health care expenditure). This highlights the need for comprehensive social protection because informal coping mechanisms are not adequate and risk trapping individuals in a downward spiral of impoverishment.
- The poverty rate remains high even though unemployment rates are low (1.6 per cent) and falling. This raises questions over the quality of jobs, particularly given the large proportion of workers in vulnerable employment.
- Although the gender gap in labour force participation is shrinking (from a 16.8 percentage point difference in 1998 to 12.1 per cent in 2008), the women's unemployment rate is higher than the men's (1.3 per cent compared with 0.8 per cent for 25–64 year olds) and a larger proportion of women workers are illiterate.
- Productivity levels remain among the lowest in the ASEAN region, and raising them should be a priority. The impacts of the global economic crisis have starkly highlighted the need to increase productivity and improve competitiveness in the garment industry while maintaining decent working conditions, thus potentially building momentum for reforms.
- The industrial relations system is still quite young, with unions only beginning to emerge in the mid-1990s. Unions remain fragmented: there are currently 42 union federations and five confederations in total, with 28 federations in the garment industry alone. Strikes and disputes characterize industrial relations in the country, which is partly a result of both unions and employers lacking the skills and tools to resolve disputes prior to strike action. With the gradual development of mechanisms for conciliation, arbitration and collective bargaining as well as legal reforms, industrial relations have in general been improving in the garment sector (with the notable exception of the disputes over the setting of the minimum wage in 2010). Need for updating the labour law and further building up capacities among employers and unions remains.

Data is still lacking on certain issues, including the informal economy in general as well as more specific topics, such as underemployment and earnings. The last *Labour Force Survey* was conducted in 2001, but one is planned for 2011 (with ILO involvement). Finally, there remain major concerns regarding the protection of human rights,



freedom of association, the right to collective bargaining, the independence and neutrality of Cambodian legal and judicial processes and the protection of natural resources (especially for rural populations and indigenous peoples) (see, for example, Licadho, 2007).

## 2.2 The Decent Work Country Programme 2008–2010 in Cambodia

In November 2007, a biennial country programme review was conducted to review the DWCP 2006–2007. During the consultation workshop to present the review findings, the tripartite constituents and other participants confirmed that the existing three priority areas of the ILO country programme should continue through the period 2008–2010 (ILO, 2010b). These priority areas were:

- productive employment opportunities;
- good governance; and
- rights and social protection.

The development of the DWCP 2008–2010 took into account these three priorities and the recommendations from the consultation workshop, although “rights” were eventually combined with the “good governance” priority area rather than with “social protection”. The DWCP was also adjusted to provide support for the constituents in their efforts to mitigate the impacts of the global economic crisis, which was one reason for the DWCP being finalized so late (in November 2009, with formal signature by constituents in January 2010).

The agreed version of the DWCP 2008–2010 for Cambodia featured three priority areas and four outcomes, which are outlined below. However, in line with the ILO global Strategic Policy Framework (2010–2015) and the programme and budget (P&B) for the 2010–2011 biennium, the number of outcomes was subsequently expanded to 11 (plus three predefined outcomes related to support for unions and employers as well as labour standards). Annex II illustrates how the “new” outcomes overlap with the outcomes contained in the DWCP. Essentially, the four broad DWCP outcomes were broken down into somewhat more focused outcomes for the 2010–2011 biennium; for example, the outcome related to labour governance under the DWCP (KHM 156) was divided into three outcomes (KHM 156, 160 and 161). Progress towards all 14 “new” outcomes was reviewed in as much detail as time permitted, and the findings (summarized in Annex IV) were used to inform section 3 and section 4 of this report.

**Priority area A:** Employment and skills development strategies for productive employment

**DWCP outcome 1:** Increased productive employment opportunities for women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas.

Under this priority area and outcome, the ILO aimed to support the development and implementing of and necessary capacity building for a national strategy on employment, which consisted of four dimensions:

- i) centralizing employment in economic and social policy;
- ii) training and skills development for enhanced employability;
- iii) support to micro and small enterprise development; and
- iv) promoting labour intensive infrastructure development.

An “underlying focus on low-income groups in rural areas” was planned, and the intention was to combine “upstream” policy development work at the national level with subnational and grass-roots interventions (projects and demonstration activities in selected locations).

In addition, certain initiatives were aimed at mitigating the impacts of the global economic crisis:

- a tracking study on 2,000 garment workers;
- further support to regional job centres;
- training on rights, responsibilities and life skills for garment workers; and
- support to the development of a national social protection strategy (particularly with regard to the inclusion of a social protection floor and a public works component).



**Priority area B: Labour governance and rights**

**DWCP outcome 2:** Improved respect for the rule of law, a more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards.

Good governance forms the core of Cambodia's NSDP and the Rectangular Strategy that it operationalizes. Under the DWCP, the ILO aimed to contribute towards improved governance by promoting a labour market that is governed by institutions and standards that promote decent work for women and men. Initiatives envisaged included:

- 1) Promoting industrial peace through the revision of laws and strengthened institutions  
This was to involve the provision of policy advice and technical assistance in drafting a revised trade union law as well as facilitating the required tripartite consultation processes. Further improvement of government conciliation and mediation services to relieve the burden on arbitration was also envisaged, as was building the capacity of social partners to engage in collective bargaining.
- 2) Compliance and competitiveness  
In the years prior to the DWCP 2008–2010, the ILO Better Factories Cambodia programme had helped establish a credible, transparent and independent monitoring system of all garment-exporting factories. This had enabled employers to win and retain export markets by demonstrating compliance with the national labour law and international labour standards. Under the DWCP, the ILO intended to continue to improve the monitoring and training methods and services adopted by the Better Factories Cambodia programme as well as support capacity building of local actors. The ILO also intended to “facilitate the transitioning of the Better Factories Cambodia project into an independent entity by 2010 as agreed by the programme partners” and planned to “document this process and the lessons learned for potential replication of the model in other countries” (ILO, 2010b).

**DWCP outcome 3:** Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples.

Dimensions of work envisaged under this outcome included:

- 1) Elimination of child labour  
Building on its earlier work, the ILO intended to continue to provide policy advisory services and technical assistance to the Government to: support the implementing of national plans of action on child labour and child trafficking; help make national and provincial coordinating mechanisms operational; and advocate for safe migration as a means to prevent trafficking. Through these actions, the ILO intended to assist the Government in achieving the child labour goals contained in the CMDGs and the Rectangular Strategy as well as working to eliminate the worst forms of child labour in the country by 2016 (in line with ILO global goal).
- 2) Combating the trafficking of women and children  
The intention here was to work with other agencies, such as the International Organization for Migration and United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), to assist the Government in developing and implementing a rights-based labour migration policy that would reduce exploitation and facilitate safe migration.
- 3) Promoting the rights of and respect for indigenous peoples  
The ILO aimed to support the Government to improve legislation and the protection of the rights of indigenous peoples and to support capacity building for indigenous peoples' representative institutions, complemented by awareness-raising on rights and representation.
- 4) Promoting women workers' rights and gender equality  
The ILO aimed to help the Government and social partners include a gender perspective in their policies and programmes. Promoting the rights of women workers in specific sectors (such as domestic workers) through organizing, advocacy and training was also an objective.

### **Priority area C:** Social protection enhanced for targeted groups

**DWCP outcome 4:** Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in the formal and informal sectors.

1) Institutional capacity for extending social security

The ILO intended to provide support to the Government and other actors to draft legislation, conduct financial studies and support the implementing of social safety nets and social insurance benefits.

2) Safety and health at work, especially in the informal sector

The ILO aimed to use existing good occupational safety and health (OSH) practices from Cambodia as a practical means to expand protection, with the possibility of supporting a broader programme of action as part of a national social security and protection project.

3) Protection against exposure to HIV

The plan was to continue with activities that had been implemented under the ILO HIV and AIDS workplace education programme, such as developing HIV workplace policies, surveys on risk behaviour and the training of trainers to promote HIV awareness at the workplace. Support for developing a national policy and enterprise-level interventions to prevent the spread of HIV and to prevent discrimination in formal enterprises were also envisaged.

The Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MOLVT) is ILO's line ministry counterpart for decent work, although the ILO also works with a range of line ministries and other government agencies. The primary social partners are the Cambodian Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA, established in 2000) and the national trade union confederations.

### 3. FINDINGS ON THE APPROPRIATENESS AND ADEQUACY OF THE PROGRAMME DESIGN, OUTREACH/PARTNERSHIP AND IMPLEMENTING PERFORMANCE

---

This section is based on the performance criteria prescribed in Annex I of the terms of reference (TOR). Six performance criteria are assessed in the following sections (each criterion featuring a number of subcriteria) and awarded a score, based on a scale also prescribed in Annex I of the TOR. An average score for all six criteria has been calculated, and a comparison is made with the scores awarded in the 2007 biennial country programme review. Recommendations are included where fitting.

#### 3.1 The role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage, and UN partnership approach

##### **National political, economic and social factors have shaped the country programme**

As noted, the NSDP is Cambodia's road map for implementing the development objectives contained with its Rectangular Strategy. The NSDP Update (2009–2013) was prepared to synchronize the NSDP with the term of the Parliament's fourth legislature and to ensure that the actions envisaged took into account the impact of the global economic crisis on the Cambodian economy. The Update's overall structure is very similar to the NSDP (2006–2010) that it succeeded.

The DWCP is most clearly linked with the third priority (Rectangle 3) of the Rectangular Strategy on private sector development and employment generation. The ILO's work is relevant (directly or indirectly) to all four subcomponents of this priority: i) strengthening the private sector and attracting investment; ii) creating jobs and ensuring improved working conditions; iii) promoting small and medium enterprises; and iv) creating social safety nets. Rectangle 3 is central to the Government's development philosophy, which is laid out in the introduction to the NSDP Update: "For the Royal Government, the most formidable development challenge has been and continues to be the development of the private sector, which is the engine of economic growth to achieve reduction of poverty and improve the livelihoods and quality of life of the rapidly growing Cambodian population."

The DWCP is also relevant to other major components of the Rectangular Strategy, including: i) the implementing environment (notably social order and partnerships with all stakeholders); ii) good governance (considered the strategy's score, particularly legal reform and with respect to the labour law); iii) capacity building and human resource development, particularly regarding the quality of education and the implementing of gender policies; and iv) the rehabilitation and construction of physical infrastructure, such as through labour-based public works programmes. The DWCP also has been shaped by more immediate economic factors, notably the global economic crisis.

In return, the ILO has helped influence the contents of the NSDP and other government planning and policy documents. As a result of advocacy on the part of the ILO in partnership with other agencies, the National Social Protection Strategy (2010), for example, specifically addresses the issue of child labour. Similarly, the approach outlined in the NSDP section dealing with the economic empowerment of women closely resembles the activities of the ILO Women Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality (WEDGE) project.

##### **Flexibility and ability in responding to emerging opportunities**

The ILO demonstrated a certain degree of flexibility and the capacity to respond to an emerging challenge in the case of the global economic crisis. The CO-Bangkok began responding with existing resources, which were later augmented by funding from the Regular Budget Supplementary Account (RBSA) to help support constituents through the Global Jobs Pact in Cambodia. ILO initiatives included: i) a tracking study on 2,000 garment workers, which later evolved into part of a multi-level research initiative in partnership with other organizations; ii) additional

assistance to regional job centres; iii) training on rights, responsibilities and life skills for garment workers; and iv) assistance in developing the National Social Protection Strategy. On the downside, the additional RBSA funding from the Global Jobs Pact arrived slowly, and some initiatives (such as for responsible closures) seem to have had little impact.

### **The ILO establishes priorities consistent with its capacities and comparative advantages**

This is generally the case. The DWCP priority areas and outcomes are well aligned with the ILO global Strategic Policy Framework (2010–2015); the fact that people interviewed during the review process were consistently praising the quality of ILO technical assistance suggests that the DWCP reflects good command of its technical capacities.

### **The ILO ensures that the Common Country Assessment addresses subjects that are priorities for decent work in the country and the ILO achieves overall policy coherence between ILO action and the United Nations Development Assistance Framework**

The ILO has been successful in participating in the Cambodia's UN Common Country Assessment (CCA) and the United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) processes to ensure that the decent work priorities are given due attention. The DWCP 2008–2010 was designed when the UNDAF 2006–2010 was in force and it is well aligned with the latter's priority areas, notably good governance and promoting and protecting human rights and capacity building and human resources development for the social sectors. The UNDAF 2006–2010 features some planned outputs that strongly suggest ILO influence, including: i) improved and implemented laws governing freedom of association and assembly; ii) enhanced capacities of workers' and employers' associations; and iii) the creation of a legal institution for dispute resolution.

The Joint Project Office (JPO) in Phnom Penh put a considerable amount of participating effort into the process for developing the UNDAF 2011–2015, and this has clearly paid off, given that the current UNDAF covers issues of concern to the ILO. The current UNDAF features five outcomes (each with several contributing country programme outcomes), as follows:

- 1) *Economic growth and sustainable development*: one country programme outcome relates to the ILO mandate here, which concerns increased employability and employment opportunities, particularly for youth and women.
- 2) *Health and education*: the relevant outcome here concerns the expansion of young people's access to quality life skills, including on preventing HIV infection and technical and vocational education and training.
- 3) *Gender equality*: the outcome pertaining to the ILO mandate here aims to progressively empower women to exercise their rights to decent work.
- 4) *Governance*: two outcomes are relevant here, one concerning the establishment and strengthening of mechanisms for dialogue and participation, the other involving the protection of people's rights and the dispensation of effective remedies for violations (with a particular focus on child labour, gender-based violence, people living with HIV, indigenous people and people with disabilities).
- 5) *Social protection*: all three country programme outcomes pertain to ILO work, reflecting the influence of the ILO in the drafting of this section of the UNDAF. The three outcomes involve: i) the development and implementing of a national social protection system; ii) improved social safety net programmes for the poor and vulnerable; and iii) improved social security coverage for both formal and informal sector workers.

## **OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 5 (SATISFACTORY)**

### **3.2 Tripartite participation and partnership**

**National tripartite constituents are active in national development planning forums and networks and tripartite constituents have improved capacities to influence national policy and resources within decent work areas**

During the course of the DWCP 2008–2010, the ILO helped to build the capabilities of constituents - particularly government agencies and trade unions - to engage in national processes concerning planning, legislation and policy formulation. Several people interviewed during the review commented (unprompted) on this increased capacity, as did some ILO staff who had been involved in the 2007 review process. A good example of the ILO work in this respect is the way in which support to employers and trade unions enabled both parties to participate in the development of the new trade union law, a process that was also facilitated by ILO support to the Government. It is notable that many people interviewed among all constituencies requested further capacity building; for example, on collective bargaining agreements (requested by both employers and trade unionists and already planned by the ILO).

A tripartite decent work coordinating committee could further enable constituents' effective engagement in planning processes and influence over policy development and resource allocation. Such a committee would also facilitate the design, implementing and monitoring of the next DWCP and generally improve communication between constituents and the ILO (which was a need highlighted by many people during the review process). Such a committee was envisaged in the DWCP 2008–2010, with the intention that it would participate in semi-annual tripartite consultations to assist in monitoring. The TOR for an inter-ministerial committee that would facilitate government reporting on the Core Conventions as well as perform a tripartite consultative function (with the addition of members from trade unions and employers' organizations) have been under discussion for the past 18 months; however, a sub-decree is required for such a committee to be established. Also, such a committee would need to refer to a higher body, such as the Council of Ministers. A national consultant will apparently need to examine the issues and make recommendations, but the MOLVT as yet has made no formal request for this. The committee may be established during the next biennium (2012–2013), but given the challenges involved, it would be advisable to also support the establishment of a temporary tripartite coordinating body in the form of the tripartite advisory body mentioned in the DWCP.

**Recommendation:** Continue to support the process of establishing the inter-ministerial coordination committee that has been discussed. As an interim measure, establish a temporary tripartite advisory body.

### **National tripartite constituents take ownership of the ILO's country programme**

The DWCP was developed through a lengthy consultation process that aimed to include the concerns of the Government as well as employers' and workers' organizations. This involved separate consultation meetings with the MOLVT, CAMFEBA and the unions by the then-Director of RO-Asia and the Pacific as well as Senior Specialists in Employers' and Workers' Activities. The DWCP design process was further extended by the need to incorporate responses to the impact of the global economic crisis.

Paradoxically, the majority of people interviewed during the review thought that the DWCP consultation process was not thorough enough and/or that they had been engaged too late in the process. Although some people may have been in different positions when the DWCP was being prepared and hence not invited to the consultation, the same point was made by people who certainly would have been consulted at the time. For example, a senior member of one constituent organization noted that he was first engaged in the consultation process when asked to review what he described as a "semi-final draft" of the DWCP. A number of other people said they first were aware of the DWCP structure following the ILO workshop on 12 January 2011.

The reasons for the discrepancy between the DWCP design process and peoples' views on the process are unclear. One ILO representative suggested that the extended nature of the design process (partly due to the global economic crisis and beyond ILO control) had a negative impact on participants' recollections of the process.

One of the consequences of people's perception that they were not adequately consulted is that their ownership of the DWCP appears weak, with the majority of people interviewed expressing only a basic understanding – at best – of its structure and components. Another factor that may have contributed to the low level of ownership is the lack of any communication strategy to specifically promote awareness of the DWCP (see section 3.6). Nevertheless, ownership of individual projects and other initiatives appear to be higher.

**Recommendation:** Make additional efforts to fully engage constituents and other actors from the beginning of the process to develop the next DWCP. Document the process thoroughly so that lessons can be drawn by the next DWCP review.

*Constituents have clear links to target groups*

ILO constituents appear in general to have clear links with the respective target groups, although links with workers in the informal economy are (as would be expected) more tenuous.

**OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 3 (MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY)****3.3 The focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies****Programme coherence supports an integrated approach to decent work**

The four DWCP outcomes are very broad, requiring a large number of outcomes under the implementing plan for the 2010–2011 biennium (see discussion below). DWCPs by their nature are strategic documents that are not always completely resourced: on one hand, this can assist in marshalling resources to fill the gaps while on the other it can lead to a DWCP becoming something of a “shopping list”, in the words of one person interviewed. Striking the right balance requires help from the quality assurance mechanism, which involves review by representatives at both the regional and headquarter levels. In the case of the DWCP 2008–2010, the balance seems to have tilted – albeit not too sharply – towards the shopping-list end of the scale.

**Recommendation:** ILO, together with tripartite constituents and other actors, should try to develop priority areas and, especially, outcomes for the next DWCP that are more focused and contextualized.

The ILO recommends no more than three outcomes per priority area; for the current 2010–2011 biennium, there are 11 outcomes for three priority areas. A relevant issue here is that for a country office initiative to be “visible” to ILO headquarters (notably for funding purposes) in the form of a programme and budget (P&B) indicator, a corresponding country programme outcome has to be created. This has been one factor behind the increase in the number of country programme outcomes to 11 (plus three predefined outcomes) for the current biennium, having previously been reduced to four for the 2008–2009 biennium on the principle that a smaller number of more tightly focused country programme outcomes are preferable (see section 3.4 for further discussion).

If the next DWCP were to be more tightly focused, it would make monitoring and evaluation easier and could assist with mobilizing resources by enabling the ILO to present to donors a more coherent country programme strategy (which is particularly desirable in light of the ongoing emphasis on aid effectiveness).

**Recommendation:** The next DWCP should try to follow ILO guidance in terms of the number of country programme outcomes, but the review team recognizes that the ILO global programme and budget systems impose some constraints in this regard.

**The country programme fits within the ILO strategic policy framework and programme and budget priorities and strategies**

As mentioned earlier, the fit with the strategic policy framework and P&B priorities and strategies was good.

**The country programme reflects a consensus between the country and the ILO on decent work priorities and areas of cooperation**

The DWCP reflected a reasonable consensus on decent work priorities and areas of cooperation. As one person interviewed noted, Cambodia is one of only three countries in the region (of 33 covered by the ILO) to have ratified all eight Core Conventions. This contributed to the country programme being demand-driven to a larger extent than in many other countries, as did the Government's request for assistance in responding to the impacts of the global economic crisis. In addition, the long involvement of the ILO in the country means that many actors are familiar with its mandate and areas of expertise, which fosters confidence in its work.



## **The country programme presents a strategy with the main means of action for delivering ILO support**

The DWCP document lays out clear and concise strategies for delivering ILO support in each of the priority areas.

### **Cross-cutting goals are integrated (non-discrimination and gender in particular and international labour standards in general)**

The ILO has a gender mainstreaming policy but its execution under the DWCP has been only partial. The DWCP document contains just one short paragraph on gender mainstreaming, lacking detail on how the policy is to be operationalized. Gender sensitivity and responsiveness of individual projects and technical advisers (other than gender specialists) is variable and sometimes low. A participatory gender audit of the Phnom Penh JPO was planned for June 2011, but the last time the ILO conducted gender training for the CO-Bangkok staff was in 2006, which suggests that additional support on the topic may be required from DWT-Bangkok and the Gender Bureau at headquarters. International labour standards are integrated into the DWCP.

**Recommendation:** The design process for the next DWCP needs to ensure that gender issues are considered in depth at each stage and that specific actions and targets are included in the final design. Gender sensitivity and responsiveness training should be provided for all CO-Bangkok staff and technical specialists.

### **The country programme is coherent, logical and captures opportunities for reinforcing each other [sic] in meeting objectives**

The DWCP constitutes a conceptually coherent and logical approach. In terms of actual implementation, however, there could be better integration of technical cooperation objectives and country programme outcomes to maximize their interactions.

### **Verification that ILO responds to recognized needs among constituents**

ILO initiatives respond to genuine needs, a fact confirmed by numerous people interviewed.

### **Resource mobilization is an integral part of strategies**

In theory at least, resources are marshalled through the ILO “pipeline” system. The level of effort actually devoted to mobilizing resources varies and often depends upon the individuals concerned.

## **OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **3.4 Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO contributions and support at the national level**

**The programme has defined clear outcome-level results against which it can be assessed** The DWCP defined clear outcome-level results, but these are generally broad and, in some cases, very challenging to measure (and hence assess progress towards).

#### **These results are documented and verifiable**

Progress towards DWCP outcome-level results was not systematically monitored and relevant data was not regularly compiled against the DWCP indicators (project-level M&E is significantly better due to donor requirements that have to be met). The quality of some of the DWCP outcome indicators was poor: some were actually outputs or even activities (for example, one indicator under DWCP outcome 1 is “Technical assistance provided to MOLVT in the strategic and logistical planning for upcoming regional job centre initiative and establishment of National Employment Agency (two work months for two consultants to work with MOLVT)”). In the case of some indicators, the review team found it difficult to locate the required data. The 2010–2011 biennium, however, includes the introduction of an outcome-based work-planning framework that should improve the operationalizing of the results-based management plan.

A relevant issue here is that for a country office initiative to be “visible” to ILO headquarters (notably for funding purposes) in the form of a P&B indicator, a corresponding outcome has to be created. This has been one factor behind the increase to 11 country programme outcomes (plus three predefined outcomes) for the 2010–2011 biennium; the number had been reduced to four for the 2008–2009 biennium because a smaller number of tightly focused outcomes was considered preferable. There is an obvious contradiction between these trends. Fewer outcomes may make coordination, integration and M&E easier. And several people interviewed thought that although a larger number of outcomes may bring in more funding from headquarters, the levels of such funding are likely to be limited while extra-budgetary funding from donors is likely to be more substantial and such donors may well be more likely to be favourably impressed by a more tightly focused DWCP with fewer outcomes. Additionally, some people noted that having a smaller number of outcomes does not necessarily limit the scope of work.

In a context in which their time is limited, there is an understandable tendency for outcome managers or technical specialists to view global P&B outcomes and associated indicators as most relevant, given their importance for budget allocation. When interviewed during the review, some managers and specialists could not recall relevant indicators in the DWCP, though they were well aware of the relevant P&B indicators and had a sound grasp of the status of their projects. DWCP outcome indicators tend to be neglected. The fact that DWCP indicators are often rather broad encourages this trend. Some people frankly told the review team that they viewed the DWCP largely as another layer of required reporting.

**Recommendation:** M&E systems need to be significantly improved for the next DWCP, a requirement that is closely linked with the design of the DWCP (especially the country programme outcomes).

### The outcomes justify the resources spent

The ILO was often able to leverage significant impact from limited resources during the implementing of the DWCP 2008–2010. The ILO’s technical specialists are due much of the credit for this, with the effective use of experienced consultants and partnerships with other agencies also representing significant contribution. A good example is the Labour Dispute Resolution Project, which secured significant achievements (such as a garment industry-wide agreement on collective bargaining) with a relatively modest budget.

Total resources from the regular budget for the period 2008–2010 amounted to US\$142,727, compared with US\$13,195,534 from extra-budgetary resources for technical cooperation (XBTC, including RBSA); this comparison emphasizes the critical importance of XBTC to the DWCP. The budget breakdown by DWCP outcome for the period 2008–2010 was as follows (NB: The breakdown excludes resources provided for predefined outcomes, which totalled US\$157,000):

**Table 3.1 Budget Breakdown by DWCP Outcome (2008–2010)**

	Regular budget (US\$)	XBTC (US\$)	Total
DWCP outcome 1 (employment)	65 000	2 449 426	2 514 426
DWCP outcome 2 (labour governance and law)	32 727	5 802 559	5 835 286
DWCP outcome 3 (rights)	2 000	4 430 799	4 432 799
DWCP outcome 4 (social protection)	36 000	394 964	430 964
	<b>135 727</b>	<b>13 077 748</b>	<b>13 213 475</b>

The most obvious insight generated by this breakdown is the much lower level of resources that were devoted to DWCP outcome 4 on social protection. Because the review team received the budget data at the end of its Phnom Penh visit, there was no time to discuss this issue with the various people interviewed.

Although a cost-benefit analysis is well beyond the scope of this review, the review team’s conclusion is that the DWCP generally offers good value for money in terms of the outcomes achieved.



## **The secondary effects, either positive or negative, are known and associated risks addressed**

Little if any attention is paid to these issues in the DWCP document, which contains no assessment of risks, risk management or a mitigation plan. Although ILO staff are likely to be aware of some of the major secondary effects related to their work, it does not appear that these are considered systematically. The current DWCP guidelines do not mention the need for risk assessments or management plans.

**Recommendation:** A risk assessment and risk management strategy should be incorporated into the next DWCP as well as in the next revision of the DWCP guidelines.

## **ILO has influenced thinking and action related to policy changes**

Under the DWCP, the ILO support to constituents has catalysed some significant advances in policy and legislation, such as the trade union law and the National Social Protection Strategy (NSPS).

Results are sustainable by partner institutions and at various levels (local, national, regional) Sustainability is difficult to assess, partly because it is too soon to be sure of the impacts of many DWCP 2008–2010 initiatives. Nevertheless, it is likely that many of the legal and policy reforms will have legacies at the national level because they will be part of the legal and policy framework for many years to come. Many capacity-building initiatives will also have sustainable impacts. A good example of this was provided by the trade union leaders who met with the review team and noted that ILO training had played a vital part in their rise from ordinary workers to trade union leaders. There are concerns over the sustainability of capacity-building initiatives at the local level in some cases, however (for example, some of the training of target populations under the Creative Industries Support Programme (CISP) seems to not have had a sustainable impact). There are also some specific challenges; for example, under outcome KHM 106, the job centres are currently staffed by individuals from the technical and vocational training centres (TVTCs), but there is a risk that they will leave, despite having been the target of considerable capacity building. This is because the job centre staff come under the National Employment Agency, which has performance-based staff contracts, which are regarded as less desirable; this is in contrast with the TVTCs in which staff have permanent contracts.

## **Successful demonstration and pilot interventions are expanded and replicated**

There is evidence that a number of ILO initiatives successfully piloted approaches and materials that have been replicated on a larger scale by other organizations. For example, the Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women (TICW) project (which finished on 31 October 2010) developed a range of tools and materials that have been adopted by government and non-governmental organizations (NGOs) in various Mekong region countries. Within Cambodia, some of the materials developed by the Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equity (WEDGE) project have been adopted by around 30 NGOs, including large international NGOs such as CARE and Plan International. Some of the WEDGE materials developed in the Cambodian context are being adapted for use in other countries, such as Lao PDR.

## **OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **3.5 The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO programme in Cambodia**

#### **The operations of the programme match the programme plan**

DWCP implementation has generally been in line with the DWCP plan. The national elections in July 2008 slowed work with the Government for three months around the election date. In addition, the global economic crisis caused employers, unions and the Government to re-order their priorities to some degree (ILO, 2011), although as discussed earlier, the ILO worked with constituents to develop a coordinated response to the impacts.

## **The ILO operates fairly and with integrity**

As noted in the “Keys to success” further on, the ILO is regarded by the majority of constituent representatives as a neutral party that can play the role of “honest broker”. Nevertheless, some people from the trade unions and employers’ organizations thought that, on occasion, the ILO favours the other party. For example, a small number of trade union representatives thought that the Better Factories Cambodia programme tends to favour employers’ interests, whereas some employers’ representatives said the programme tends to favour workers (because, in their view, it monitors only employers’ performance and not trade unions’ performance). That both employers and trade unions hold such views could be considered as evidence of an ILO neutral position. In addition, the ILO success in maintaining sound working relationships with all constituents despite the contentious nature of many of the issues involved provides further evidence that the ILO is generally seen as a well-intentioned, neutral party.

## **Credible, skilled specialists support the work**

People interviewed consistently acknowledged the high quality of the technical support provided by the ILO.

## **Resource mobilization is effectively and efficiently carried out**

Providing resources is a challenge, although the ILO has managed to grow the total country programme budget despite the global economic crisis and associated pressures on donor spending. The Regional Partnerships, Resource Mobilization and UN Reform Unit was recently established within the ILO RO-Asia and the Pacific to help generate resources.

## **Work processes are efficient and timely**

The lack of an in-country ILO country office represents a major constraint, particularly given the programme’s relatively large size. Most people interviewed noted that coordination between the ILO and various actors had improved since the establishment of the JPO in 2005 (prior to the period being reviewed) and, particularly, the creation of the National Coordinator position in 2008. However, many people also suggested that coordination and communication between the ILO and actors requires further improvement (the establishment of a tripartite coordinating body would assist in this regard, as discussed in section 3.2). Some people also noted that the lack of an in-country country office represented a constraint to mobilizing resources.

Concerning internal coordination, the regular heads of project meetings were characterized as useful in terms of both the sharing of information and management or administration issues, with some attention given to programmatic issues. But coordination across different outcomes and/or projects tends to result from individual technical specialists or project staff liaising with each other rather than from a systematic country (or regional) office process.

**Recommendation:** Systematic internal programming meetings and a regular exchange of information between CO-Bangkok management and technical specialists of DWT-Bangkok should be facilitated by the JPO and CO-Bangkok to better manage and monitor country programme implementation.

The capacity to participate in the CCA and UNDAF processes and joint UN programmes is critical for the CO-Bangkok because they represent a means through which the ILO can apply one of its main comparative advantages (the ability to provide high-quality technical advice) within a stable programmatic framework despite limited ILO funding. In addition, the primary focus of many donors is increasingly on the UNDAF (in line with the aid effectiveness agenda), so it is critical that ILO interests be represented there. That the UNDAF 2011–2015 includes most of the issues relevant to ILO reflects the amount of time and effort devoted by the National Coordinator, the JPO and project staff to participating in the UNDAF development process. This represented a very significant additional effort on the part of the JPO in particular, and there are limits to what can be achieved without additional funds for coordinating activities. For example, there is no permanent budget allocation for the programme assistant position yet (though this has been requested).

**Recommendation:** Given that it is highly unlikely that an in-country country office will be established, the ILO must ensure that the National Coordinator and the JPO have adequate (additional) financial resources to perform programmatic and administrative coordinating functions.

Other constraints raised regarding work processes include:

- Funds disbursement is sometimes not timely because approval has to be obtained from Bangkok.
- Some people interviewed pointed out that following the establishment of the CO-Bangkok, the division of roles and responsibilities among the Country Director, National Coordinator, Programme Officer and Chief Technical Advisors (CTA) and Project Managers/Coordinators is not well-defined. Some people said that in some instances they were not clear whom they should contact (both in the JPO and in CO-Bangkok) to follow up on certain issues. Developing an internal work organigram with corresponding descriptions of the roles and responsibilities of the various staff would help improve the situation.

**Recommendation:** Develop a work organigram of CO-Bangkok and the Joint Project Office and share it among all ILO staff and constituents.

## Keys to success

In the interviews conducted during the review process, several factors were highlighted as important to the successful implementing of programme work:

- The ILO is seen by the majority of constituents' representatives as a neutral party, able to play the role of "honest broker". This, allied to a sound reputation in general, was considered the reason the ILO can bring constituents to the negotiating table who might otherwise not have participated.
- ILO technical advice is consistently rated as high quality.
- The long ILO engagement in Cambodia and its good understanding of the country context are important for building and sustaining mutual confidence in its relations with constituents.
- Constituents must be engaged from the very beginning of any design process (be it for the DWCP or an individual project) and information must be shared with them in appropriate, easily accessible formats.
- High-quality research that convincingly demonstrates to employers the economic benefits of adopting certain practices (such as related to HIV prevention or women's health services) significantly strengthens their commitment in these areas.

## OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)

### 3.6 Knowledge management and sharing

#### M&E is part of the knowledge base

M&E data from some initiatives (Better Factories Cambodia and IPEC) are being captured, analysed and disseminated widely in appropriate formats and are thus informing initiatives elsewhere (both within Cambodia and further afield). In other cases, although M&E is generally being conducted at the project level to meet donor requirements, the data captured are not processed and managed so as to contribute to the broader knowledge base. The weaknesses in the DWCP M&E system (discussed in section 3.4) contribute to this problem.

**Recommendation:** Linked to the improvements in overall country programme coordination and DWCP M&E suggested previously, efforts should be made (in collaboration with other actors) to feed M&E findings into the knowledge base more systematically. Efforts should also be made to disseminate knowledge more effectively among DWCP actors and, where appropriate, more broadly (a quarterly newsletter was suggested as an appropriate method).

### **Office follows a communications and knowledge management strategy, making effective use of its web site and other tools for outreach**

There was no communications strategy dedicated to promoting awareness and understanding of the DWCP among constituents and other actors. The public visibility of initiatives successfully implemented by the ILO and its partners could generally be much higher. Many other international agencies have more modest achievements than the ILO yet maintain a higher public profile.

**Recommendation:** The ILO should develop a communications strategy specifically focused on the DWCP and should begin to implement this strategy during the design process for the next DWCP so that all actors are kept informed from the beginning of the process. More generally, the ILO should use its significant achievements in Cambodia as the basis of a campaign to raise its public profile.

The ILO's Cambodia country programme web site is informative and reasonably up-to-date, with links to web sites dedicated to some of the major country programme initiatives. However, the only web pages available in Khmer that the review team could locate during a quick search were those belonging to the Better Factories Cambodia web site, which is available in Khmer, Chinese and English, is very up-to-date and informative. All the publications available via the web site also appear to be in English only. Important internal information relevant to ILO staff should also be shared on the CO-Bangkok page of the Asia-Pacific Knowledge Sharing Platform.

**Recommendation:** Consider translating key sections of the ILO Cambodia web site into Khmer and providing links to Khmer language versions of publications and other documents (when available). Encourage staff to upload relevant internal information onto the CO-Bangkok page of the Asia-Pacific Knowledge Sharing Platform.

### **ILO knowledge development is used to improve national programmes and policies and benefit priority groups**

The quality of the information, education and communication (IEC) materials developed by the ILO was praised by most people interviewed, who considered them to be user-friendly and technically sound. For example, the WEDGE initiative has developed a range of materials that have been adopted by around 30 NGOs for their own programmes, magnifying the impact of the materials considerably.

Some knowledge generated by ILO-supported initiatives has clearly informed policy and other programmes; insights from the Better Factors Cambodia programme, for example, have informed law and policy development work. The tracking study performed under the Global Jobs Pact and the recent Labour and Social Trends in Cambodia 2010 (study and report) are both likely to inform programmes and policies in future.

## **OVERALL SCORE FOR THIS CRITERION: 3 (MODERATELY UNSATISFACTORY)**

## 4. ASSESSMENT OF PROGRESS MADE TOWARDS DWCP OUTCOMES

Progress towards attaining the DWCP outcomes could not be rigorously assessed because of the problems concerning M&E discussed in section 3.4 as well as the limited time available for the review. This section presents a summary assessment of progress towards each DWCP outcome, based on the reviews of each of the individual outcomes presented in Annex IV. The average score and performance rating (based on the criteria specified in the TOR) is provided for each outcome, although as stated in chapter 2, the team leader considers these to be highly subjective and of limited utility.<sup>2</sup> Also, outcome scores can be significantly influenced by factors external to ILO activities. The cutting of funding for KHM 802 by the Norwegian Government is a good example, in that it reduced the overall score (due to a low score for resource adequacy) for reasons completely unconnected with the quality of the ILO work under this outcome.<sup>3</sup>

**Recommendation:** The approach prescribed in the TOR for assessing progress towards DWCP outcomes should be revised. If it is mandatory to continue with some type of scoring system, such a system should at a minimum distinguish between the performance of the ILO (regarding factors within its control) and the influence of external factors (beyond ILO control). Currently, the overall score for each outcome conflates these factors.

### 4.1 Priority area A: Employment and skills development strategies for productive employment

**DWCP outcome 1: Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas**

In the Strategic Management Module-Implementation Plan (SMM-IP) for the 2008–2009 biennium, one outcome contributed to DWCP outcome 1: the KHM 104 (increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas). This outcome was retained under the SMM-IP for the 2010–2011 biennium but was augmented by two others: KHM 105 (skills development) and KHM 106 (sustainable enterprises). Progress towards each of these three outcomes is individually reviewed, as follows.

**KHM 104** Funding sources include the Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work in Developing Countries initiative as well as the Inclusion for People with Disabilities (INCLUDE) project and initiatives under the Global Jobs Pact. Still, funding gaps have been an issue, causing the delay of some components (implementing the Labour Force Survey, for example, although funding has now been secured). Further funding must be found for both the labour-based employment and National Employment Strategy components because both remain high priorities.

Delivery of some outputs was delayed by the need to respond to the global economic crisis, others by institutional factors (development of the National Employment Strategy was delayed partly because the inter-ministerial committee envisaged has not yet been established). Examples of outputs that have been delivered include:

- Demonstration activities to promote labour-based public works techniques, paving the way for further active ILO involvement under the NSPS in 2011.
- Technical and financial support in the designing, developing and piloting of the Labour Force Survey with the National Institute of Statistics (NIS) in 2009.
- Labour and social trends study conducted by the NIS with ILO support.
- The Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work in Developing Countries (MAP) initiative helped to identify gaps in the national statistical system in terms of compiling decent work indicators and monitoring progress on decent work.

<sup>2</sup> See footnote 1 on the different views among review team members on this.

<sup>3</sup> Significant achievements have been recorded under KHM 802, which responded to the Norwegian cuts by seeking funding from other sources (see section 4.4).

Outputs are generally highly valued and are used by partners and target groups. For example, technical advice provided has made an important contribution to the development of the NSPS, particularly the public works programme component and the conceptual framework of the social protection floor and social security staircase; models/approaches for public works programmes developed in Cambodia have been taken up by other countries in the Asia-Pacific region. INCLUDE's work (as well as earlier ILO initiatives in relation to disabled people) is clearly highly appreciated by Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth Rehabilitation counterparts.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- *The Labour and Social Trends in Cambodia 2010* report, based on the study, was completed, providing very important data on which to base policy and strategy on a range of issues.
- The Labour Force Survey (last done in 2001) was delayed but will be conducted in 2011.
- The tracking study on garment workers was implemented.
- The NSPS is awaiting final approval, and the draft includes labour-based methodologies (Employment-Intensive Investment Programme) advocated by the ILO.
- The Ministry of Rural Development has (in theory) mainstreamed the Employment-Intensive Investment Programme (EIIP), while tools and approaches are being applied in Meanchey, Battambang and Pailin provinces, thus meeting the targets set.
- Around 608 kilometres of rural roads were improved or maintained through labour-based technology and EIIP methodologies and 108,711 workdays were created, meeting targets.
- The establishment of an inter-ministerial steering committee for the development of a National Employment Strategy has not yet been achieved.

Looking to the future, the ILO has commenced the design of project proposals for implementing the NSPS public works component and is looking to establish partnerships with donors. These activities will be stepped up in 2011, following government approval of the finalized NSPS. Regarding disabled people, requests were received for more support for technical and vocational education and training (TVET) and the need to operationalize the employment quotas for disabled people laid out in the relevant law and policy was highlighted. M&E was highlighted as an area requiring attention regarding the implementing of the NSPS.

## AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4.4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)

**KHM 105** This outcome relied on limited funding under the Global Jobs Pact's job centres component. The lack of budget has been a major constraint for the National Employment Agency that was created with ILO support under this outcome, partly because it is such a new agency. The agency has indicated that the Government's budget provision (through the MOLVT) for the job centres increased substantially in 2011, which is a positive sign. The current phase of the RBSA funding finished in June 2011; a concept note will be submitted to potential donors (with the Government also encouraged to seek funding). The hope is that the job centres can generate at least a portion of their own funding in the future by charging private companies for the services provided; obviously, such services must be competitive in terms of quality and price.

The overall ILO assessment is that output delivery is currently around 80 per cent complete. People interviewed during the review process remarked on the high-quality technical assistance from the ILO in setting up the job centres, in developing the operational manual (not yet completed) and in the training of the job centres staff. The National Employment Agency provides two types of services: i) online services<sup>4</sup>; and ii) job centre support.

The success rate (in matching demand with supply) of the job centres is only about 10 per cent so far, though they only recently started operating and thus it is too early to assess their effectiveness. CAMFEBA has positive views on the job centres' service provision to date.

4 [www.nea.gov.kh](http://www.nea.gov.kh)



In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- Target of establishing five job centres not quite met; only four have opened.
- A technical and employment needs assessment for training was conducted for the MOLVT TVET staff, in line with the target.
- A National Employment Agency was established.

The job centres are staffed by individuals from technical and vocational training centres, but there is a risk that they will leave despite having been the target of considerable amounts of capacity building (because the job centre staff are part of the National Employment Agency, they are subject to performance-based staff contracts; this is in contrast with the vocational training centre staff who have more desirable permanent contracts). Some staff trained early in the initiative have already left.

Two primary challenges exist for the future: i) how to make TVET relevant to the needs of the market; and ii) how to link effectively with the private sector. There is particular need to ensure that the job centre services can be accessed by vulnerable groups and those who may not have access to the Internet. It is also important to get inputs from CAMFEBA regarding industries and sectors that can benefit from the job centre services. Future ILO support should also provide additional capacity building for the National Employment Agency and job centre staff (particularly once the centres have permanent staff), support actions to publicize the centres and continue mobilizing resources. Requests were made for ILO assistance (facilitated by the attachment of a longer-term expert at the National Employment Agency) in developing manuals/tools on career guidance and career counselling as well as labour market information data collection and analysis.

The National Employment Agency plans to set up job centres in all 24 provinces but there is no fixed time frame for doing so. For better integration and coherence, the agency should try to participate in the process of developing the National Employment Strategy and become part of the related inter-ministerial committee. The findings of the forthcoming Labour Force Survey should also be used by the jobs centres to inform their operations. The job centres need to mainstream gender responsiveness into policies and their day-to-day services; as an immediate step, more qualified women should be recruited to work in the centres.

## AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 3.8 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)

**KHM 106** Even including the technical cooperation projects (WEDGE, the Creative Industries Support Project and the Microfinance for Decent Work research initiative), resources are extremely limited. The KHM 106 component concerning governance and local economic development has experienced a slow delivery of some outputs, largely because the component is linked with the Government's Decentralization and Deconcentration programme, which involves numerous actors.

WEDGE has developed training infrastructure (GET Ahead for Women in Enterprise and Business Group Formation) and trained more than 40 lead trainers. WEDGE has also adapted and introduced ILO training materials on managing small business associations. With CAMFEBA and GIZ, the project delivered training of trainer courses for more than 60 managers and staff (60 per cent women) from 35 business associations. Follow-up technical support was provided to three local business associations. WEDGE also developed training materials on financial education and guidelines on the creation of self-help groups. These materials have been used to train more than 3,000 families of working children in cooperation with the IPEC time-bound programme (first phase).

The 40 lead trainers trained by WEDGE mentioned above have trained more than 6,000 micro-entrepreneurs (80 per cent women), including 78 instructors from MOLVT provincial training centres (TVET). Many of the materials developed by the WEDGE project have been adopted by around 30 NGOs – including CARE and Plan International – thus magnifying their impact considerably. Some of the WEDGE materials developed in the Cambodian context are being adapted for use in other countries, such as Lao PDR and Viet Nam. All three of the above-mentioned associations that received technical support have reportedly grown in membership and have increased their sales, profits and number of trading partners considerably in the past two years.

UN partners in the Creative Industries Support Project were positive about the ILO technical inputs but remarked that coordination across agencies had been a problem.

In terms of progress made against the relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The DWCP target aimed for 24 partner organizations (including the Government) to incorporate ILO tools for enterprise development and microfinance; this target was met.
- The target of 7,500 women workers who lost their job as a result of the global economic crisis initiate an enterprise with ILO support was not reached. In 2010, WEDGE intended to provide direct assistance to 2,000 women in collaboration with the Better Factories Cambodia programme. The MOLVT may also have reached more women through the WEDGE training of trainers.

The Microfinance for Decent Work is a global research initiative aiming to support 16 microfinance institutions worldwide to test innovations towards reducing decent work issues among their clients. In Cambodia, the action research envisages reducing over-indebtedness and multiple borrowing (exacerbated by the global economic crisis) by supporting two Cambodian microfinance institutions to deliver financial education training to their clients. The impact of the microfinance innovations will be assessed using a randomized control trial methodology. The results of this research will be shared among the microfinance community in Cambodia. If the impact is proven positive, it is expected that microfinance actors will replicate the innovations, not only in Cambodia but also in other countries.

Links with small business associations appeared to be limited, although the costs of joining may outweigh the benefits for very small entrepreneurs; the number of small business associations in rural Cambodia that serve rural micro-entrepreneurs is extremely limited. The Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy requested that the ILO continue its support to training on participatory gender audits and to prepare women from small and medium enterprises to access funds from microfinance institutions.

Although the Creative Industries Support Project has had positive impacts on its targeted groups, there is a general feeling that follow-up activities will be needed to ensure that the outcomes sustain. All UN agency partners (UNDP, FAO and UNESCO) have initiated consultation processes to explore future funding modalities. UNDP has indicated interest in expanding the intervention as an anti-poverty model connecting local intervention with provincial and national development policies. However, the question over sustainability suggests that the ILO should seriously consider engagement in an expanded initiative.

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 3.6 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **4.2 Priority area B: Labour governance and rights**

DWCP outcome 2: Improved respect for the rule of law, more effective labour law, and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards.

In the SMM-IP for the 2008–2009 biennium, one outcome contributed to DWCP outcome 2: KHM 156 (improved rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards). This outcome was renumbered to KHM 160 under the SMM-IP for the 2010–2011 biennium and was augmented by two others: a new KHM 156 (strengthened tripartism and labour market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations) and KHM 161 (working conditions and competitiveness in the garment sector is improved through compliance with international labour standards and national labour law as well as through promoting decent work). For simplicity's sake, the following reviews of progress towards the outcomes will use the numbering system for the 2010–2011 biennium.

**KHM 156** There are some resource gaps under this outcome due to the Labour Dispute Resolution Project nearing its end. This project has been efficient, however, securing significant achievements with a modest budget. Around US\$200,000 was received from the World Bank to follow up on the 28 September 2010 Memorandum of Understanding on Improving Industrial Relations in the Garment Industry (explained further on), although probably more than this will be required. Additional funding is likely to be sought from the RBSA.

The Labour Dispute Resolution Project delivered its planned outputs, including significant amounts of training and other forms of capacity building. The Arbitration Council benefitted from the capacity building for arbitrators and will continue using the tools/manuals developed with the World Bank resources. Constraints have included: i) a lack



of understanding among all parties on collective bargaining; ii) a large number of unions, many of which are not very representative and some of which refuse to engage in collective bargaining; iii) weak rule of law in general; iv) the national elections in July 2008, which slowed that work with the Government for around three months; and v) the global economic crisis, which caused employers, unions and the Government to some degree re-order their priorities (the project tried to support some of these new priorities within the parameters of its mandate).

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The Arbitration Council sustained as an independent, credible and effective dispute resolution body, dealing with an increased number of cases; the World Bank is funding the Council until 2013, beyond which its sustainability is uncertain. However, it is valued by all constituents, which should favour its continuation if funding constraints can be overcome. The Arbitration Council has resolved nearly 70 per cent of the collective disputes it received.
- The number of collective bargaining agreements increased by at least ten, which was the target. As of September 2009, the number of registered agreements had reached 107, compared with a total of 86 registered up to 2008 (though these agreements were of variable quality). As a result of the ILO efforts to provide collective bargaining training to unions with the most representative status and employers by the end of October 2010, there were around 30 high-quality, comprehensive collective bargaining agreements.

A major achievement in 2010 that was not envisaged in the DWCP was a garment industry agreement around collective bargaining (including binding arbitration) between workers and employers. This was partly a result of a high-level delegation facilitated by the ILO that brokered the agreement. Both CAMFEBA and six trade union confederations acknowledged the significant contribution made by the ILO to improve industrial relations. Nevertheless, representatives of both sides thought that in some instances the ILO had not been a neutral party but had favoured the other side (that both sides were not completely satisfied could be taken as further evidence of the ILO balanced approach). A CAMFEBA representative thought that the MOLVT is too dependent on the ILO for support and hence cannot be an authoritative party during industrial relations disputes. It should be stressed that this is CAMFEBA's own perception, which is presented here in the interest of reflecting key informants' opinions; the review team has insufficient data to comment on this perception.

Regarding future priorities: i) union negotiating capacity remains weak and needs to be developed; ii) training on collective bargaining for employers and unions will be required to support the implementing of the garment industry agreement; iii) the issue of productivity needs to be addressed; and iv) ILO efforts need to extend to non-garment sectors, including the hotel and construction sectors.

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

**KHM 160** The main project under this outcome was designed to assist the competitiveness of the Cambodian garment sector through improvements to the Cambodian labour law and industrial relations. There were very few resources beyond those from the project. Some RBSA funding is expected this year due to its 2011 target date.

The ILO provided significant support towards the new trade union law for consultancy inputs, consultation with constituents, drafting and reviewing. In the review interviews, the ILO support was characterized as important to all constituents in the drafting process.<sup>5</sup> The ILO advocated strongly to ensure that all social partners were fully engaged in the consultation process. The MOLVT appreciated the expertise the ILO provided, but a representative noted that materials provided were sometimes in a format or language too difficult for officials to understand. A CAMFEBA representative thought that the Government relied heavily on the ILO in the drafting of the labour legislation and its interpretation and stressed that it is important that the ILO does not "take over the job of the Government". Again, these statements from the MOLVT and CAMFEBA are included here only in the interest of reflecting key informants' opinions.

<sup>5</sup> Such a process is made even more difficult by relatively low levels of legal literacy and mutual trust.

In terms of progress made against the relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The DWCP targets of amending labour laws and amendments under discussion or consultation were achieved. The new trade union law was the topic of a final tripartite consultation workshop in January 2011; the final version will be sent to the ILO for informal opinion as requested by the International Labour Conference Committee on the Application of Standards. The law was to be sent to the Council of Ministers once comments were received from the ILO (March 2011).

In April 2008, the Cambodian Prime Minister agreed with a request from the Eighth Working Group (on industrial relations) of the Government-Private Sector Forum for a new trade union law to be developed. Trade unions participate in this body but not on an equal basis with employers. Some people interviewed during the review remarked that this raises possible doubts as to the extent to which it reflects a tripartite approach. Some people also noted that there is a risk that the ILO sometimes overestimates its capacity to effect change in laws (via advocacy and technical assistance to the Government), a difficult and time-consuming process.

Differences in the attitude of government ministry officials have become apparent. For example, one person reported that the Ministry of Women's Affairs has been pushing for the introduction of gender discrimination amendments into the labour law but the MOLVT has not yet taken action. Cambodia is now lagging behind in this respect, and a gender discrimination law should be a priority area for future action. The CAMFEBA representatives suggested that the application of the trade union law and the issue of employment contracts will need to be addressed. They also requested a comprehensive review of the labour law, considering the window of opportunity that has opened with the Prime Minister giving the issue his personal attention. The Prime Minister is also reportedly concerned about the Labour Court, which will be extremely important both in itself and because of the court's future relationship with the Arbitration Council. Various other aspects of the labour law need updating, but there is a significant amount of institutional inertia that needs to be overcome.

#### **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4.2 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

**KHM 161** This outcome encompasses a range of technical cooperation initiatives, including: the flagship Better Factories Cambodia programme; Socially Responsible Production in the Garment Industry; the Trade Facilitation and Competitiveness Project; Addressing the Economic Crisis in the Garment Industry, ILO-UNDP Tracking and Confidence; Improving Cambodian Garment Workers' Access to Health and Social Protection Services, Their Pre- and Post-Garment Life Skills and Economic Opportunities; and the Joint Programme for Children, Food Security and Nutrition in Cambodia. This outcome has been well resourced.

The independent monitoring and reporting on labour standards, coupled with management and training services, within the Better Factories Cambodia programme have been critical to the development of the garment industry. Ongoing monitoring of compliance with standards continued during the DWCP, and a new information management system was introduced. A three-stage tracking study on the impacts of the global economic crisis was completed and became part of a larger, multi-level study involving other organizations and donors. Also, as part of the global economic crisis response, innovative pilots were initiated to promote improved productivity and energy efficiency, with the long-term aim of helping the industry transition to a more sustainable and environmentally efficient growth model. The Better Factories Cambodia programme is also training workers and employers on socially responsible transitions, although people interviewed suggested that this training has had limited practical impact. Better Factories Cambodia also organized a series of trainings for workers on the garment industry and life skills. Informants also noted that the Global Jobs Pact funds for the global economic crisis response activities were slow in arriving.

As part of its shift to a post-crisis phase, the Better Factories Cambodia in December 2010 conducted a national Productivity Dialogue with garment industry actors to discuss the critical issue of labour productivity (an issue flagged by the Ministry of Commerce during a meeting with the review team). It is hoped that these discussions may provide a means to encourage employers' organizations and trade unions to develop a common strategic vision for the garment industry, something that is currently sorely lacking.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- In terms of local tripartite institutions taking over the monitoring role of the Better Factories Cambodia programme, the target of a well-functioning institution established with buyers representing over 50 per cent of the export volume using its services was not achieved. Reasons offered by people interviewed:
  - i) The Government (and employers) are concerned about buyers' responses if monitoring was transferred to a local institution.
  - ii) There is still some debate within the ILO about the proposed global Better Work initiative, under which the Better Factories Cambodia would exist as a kind of franchise that would make payments to the ILO.
  - iii) Some informants thought that the International Finance Corporation and the ILO are not prepared at the moment to advocate strongly enough to the Government to localize the monitoring.
  - iv) The impact of the global economic crisis has delayed the process.
- In terms of improved working conditions in Cambodian factories due to monitoring and documenting compliance with national labour law and international standards through remedial training, the target of average compliance levels recorded by summary synthesis reports in 2007 maintained or improved, the project representatives confirmed was achieved – although some fundamental rights issues remain.

The Better Factories Cambodia recently started partnering with Marie Stopes International (MSI), facilitating access for the latter to run women's health activities in factory infirmaries. This enables MSI to access a very vulnerable population; MSI aims to develop a toolkit that could allow the approach to be scaled up in the future.

A small number of trade union representatives who were interviewed thought that the Better Factories Cambodia programme tends to benefit employers and the Government rather than unions. Conversely, representatives from CAMFEB and the Garment Manufacturers Association of Cambodia strongly believe that the current ILO approach tends to favour trade unions, suggesting that this may possibly alienate employers from cooperating with the ILO in the future and that past capacity building of trade unions had contributed significantly to their perceived current militancy. These employers' organizations representatives thought that the monitoring associated with the project should also extend to the trade unions and not be limited to the employers; they raised this as one constraint to the proposed shift of monitoring functions to a local tripartite institution.

### **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4.8 (SATISFACTORY)**

DWCP outcome 3: Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples.

In the SMM-IP for the 2008–2009 biennium, one outcome contributed to DWCP outcome 3: KHM 151 (the Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, and indigenous peoples). This outcome was transformed under the SMM-IP for the 2010–2011 biennium into three outcomes: KHM 157 (the Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children), KHM 158 (the Government and social partners adopt and implement non-discrimination policies to improve and protect the rights of women, domestics workers and indigenous peoples) and KHM 159 (the Government and social partners develop and implement policies to manage migration, protect migrant workers and combat human trafficking in line with ILO principles). Progress towards each of these three outcomes is reviewed here.

**KHM 157** This outcome comes under the ILO's International Programme to Eliminate Child Labour (IPEC) and includes the Cambodia Support Project to the National Plan of Action against the Worst Forms of Child Labour–Phase II; it is well-resourced. However, the withdrawal of the supplementary salary for government officials has become a real concern for some actors because they think it could cause some constraints in implementation. Some key informants suggested that the ILO should be more flexible and may need to allocate more funds for certain activities, particularly in tourist towns (such as Siem Reap) where the cost of living is high.

Delivery has generally been smooth, though there was a half-year gap between the first and second phases, and there have been delays in the start-up of some activities. Links with WEDGE and the Workers' Education Project have produced synergies. Uptake of outputs has been good. In addition to constituents, IPEC has worked with a network

of civil society organizations active on relevant issues. The Government has committed to continuing the child labour monitoring, though some informants expressed concerns that the monitoring system may be too project specific and should instead linked with existing large scale systems, such as that developed by the Government with GIZ.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The targeted National Plan of Action on Child Labour was adopted and implemented in 2008, with Prime Minister approval providing high-level backing.<sup>6</sup> The Government also committed to the ILO global target of eliminating the worst forms of child labour by 2016.
- Seven provinces were targeted for incorporating the elimination of child labour into their plans of action; the target was exceeded, with 11 provinces implementing programmes to prevent child labour and withdraw children from exploitative work.<sup>7</sup> The Ministry of Education, Youth and Sport (MOEYS) mainstreamed the issue of child labour into its draft National Education Strategic Plan (2009–2013).
- It is difficult to assess whether the target of reducing the incidence of child labour to 10.6 per cent nationally (in accordance with targets of the National Strategic Development Plan 2006–2010) because no child labour survey has been conducted since 2001. However, the ILO is involved in a joint child labour and labour force survey in 2011. The aim is to reduce the incidence of child labour to 8 per cent by 2015.

The ILO engaged with the MOEYS and the Sector Working Group for Education for All (EFA) in advocating for the need to address child labour issues if EFA goals are to be achieved. ILO also worked with partners to ensure that the issue of child labour was explicitly addressed in the NSPS. A part of a global initiative, the ILO has worked with UNICEF and the World Bank to produce two *Understanding Children's Work* reports, which have provided valuable data and a platform for action.

Child labour will remain an important issue, and the review team received requests for the ILO to continue funding until at least 2016. The IPEC team estimates that Kep Province will be child labour free by June 2012, while the salt sector will be child labour free by the end of 2011. Provincial DOLVTs seem to be convinced that the Kep target is achievable due to its rather small size compared with other provinces and the fact that most child labour in Kep is concentrated in the fishing sector. The IPEC team estimates that around US\$100 million would be required to achieve the complete elimination of child labour in Cambodia, which would be a major achievement and may have significant broader benefits for the ILO globally. The implication is that resource mobilization efforts need to be focused at this level of funding. However, there was some scepticism on the part of some informants over the target to eliminate the worst forms of child labour by 2016. But other informants were more optimistic, noting the Government's strong commitment (as reflected in the establishment of a powerful inter-ministerial joint force) and the fact that the issue has been mainstreamed at all levels.

## AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 5 (SATISFACTORY)

**KHM 158** Includes the former ILO-Japan Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women (EEOW) project (which ended in mid-2008), the ILO-RBSA project on Decent Work, Gender Equality and Safe Migration (2009–2010) and the WEDGE and the Support to Indigenous Peoples projects; resources were adequate to meet the targets.

Regarding the outputs, the EEOW and WEDGE projects collaborated with other ILO initiatives, including IPEC, CISP, the Better Factories Cambodia Social Protection and Gender Project and INCLUDE. The EEOW project focused on poverty alleviation and promoting gender equality in the world of work by replicating good practices in gender mainstreaming policies and programmes, participatory approaches and economic empowerment of women in one municipality and 16 provinces. The RBSA project supported advocacy, consultations, capacity building and research to promote awareness about domestic work and to promote dialogue on the rights and need for protection of domestic workers.

<sup>6</sup> The work of supporting the development of the national plan of action was performed before the 2008–2010 DWCP period. Approval of the draft plan took around 18 months.

<sup>7</sup> Of these 11 provinces, nine are the IPEC TBP phase II's target provinces and two are the Winrock International's "Responsible Provinces", which are implementing programmes for preventing and withdrawal of child labour in agriculture sector. The development and implementation of these 11 Direct Support Action Programmes has happened between 2008 and 2010. Some of the work towards achieving these targets took place before the 2008–2010 period.

The Support to Indigenous Peoples (ITP) project experienced some delays with regard to facilitating communities' access to communal land titles due to the actions of an individual government official. The donor (DANIDA) was informed and discussed the matter with the Government, following which the official was assigned other duties and the delays ceased. An international study on standards setting in relation to domestic workers included national consultations in Cambodia and investigated issues identified by the IPEC project. At a workshop on indigenous peoples and traditional occupations in Siem Reap in 2010, the need to ratify the Indigenous and Tribal Peoples Convention, 1989 (No. 169), was discussed and the Ministry of Rural Development agreed to study the issue (with ILO support). Future initiatives should aim to further strengthen indigenous peoples' networks and also focus on rubber plantation workers. A Ministry of Interior (an ITP partner) representative said they were pleased with the level of partnership, having been involved in the design process.

Some people interviewed during the review suggested that the WEDGE materials may need to be updated or upgraded, though this process has in fact already started.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The indicator concerning initiatives undertaken by concerned agencies vis-à-vis legislative and policy to support indigenous people's entitlement to land ownership targeted ten initiatives. The indicator is not very precisely drafted, but the ILO succeeded in working with donors, the Government and NGO partners to facilitate the communal land titling process.
- Three indigenous communities were targeted for help in obtaining deeds to land. At the time of the review, 20 communities had been recognized as legal entities and 35 had been formally identified as indigenous communities by the Ministry of Rural Development (a necessary prerequisite for recognition as a legal entity and subsequent application for communal title to land). Three communities received a communal title to land.
- Five initiatives were targeted for mainstreaming gender responsiveness in the policies and programme of agencies and carrying out gender-specific action. To date, 15 of the 24 main ministries have a gender mainstreaming and action plan, though it is unclear to what extent this is directly attributable to ILO initiatives and/or broader advocacy. WEDGE and EOW directly supported the MOLVT and the Ministry of Industry, Mines and Energy (MIME) to formulate, implement and review their gender mainstreaming action plans. The WEDGE supported the implementing of participatory gender audits in the Siem Reap provincial MIME office and the MOLVT's National Technical Training Institute. WEDGE also worked with CAMFEBA to mainstream gender equality responses into its activities, in particular its youth employment project.

One representative of a key partner remarked during the review interview that the ILO promotes ownership of initiatives less than other UN agencies and tends to present prepared "packages" for adoption (with little adaptation to the local context). The informant thought closer partnership is needed. Consultants who are not gender specialists but specialize in other areas are often not very gender sensitive or responsive, in this person's view.

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 3.6 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

**KHM 159** This outcome includes the recently initiated Tripartite Action to Protect Migrants within and from the GMS from Labour Exploitation (TRIANGLE, 2010–2015), which is a successor in some ways to the long-running TICW project but with a broader focus (includes men as well as children and women). It also includes the (recently completed) Management of Cross-Border Movement of Labour in South-East Asia project, which helped to provide a basis for TRIANGLE, particularly in terms of policy development.

The second phase of the subregional TICW project ended in October 2008 and is thus relevant to the DWCP 2008–2010. TICW phase 2 focused on reducing the vulnerability of migrants to human trafficking and advocating for greater protection through the expansion of legal channels, better supervision of recruitment, better scrutiny of informal workplaces and improving migrants' access to legal and social services. A significant achievement of TICW was raising people's understanding of trafficking within the broader context of labour migration rather than



solely as a phenomenon linked to sexual exploitation. In Cambodia, TICW initiatives included: the child-safe tourism campaign; various initiatives involving collaboration with media; participation in the COMMIT National Task Force to counter human trafficking and support to the national plan of action; support to bilateral employment cooperation MOUs; and a range of research studies.

The Policy on Labour Migration for Cambodia was promulgated in June 2010 (following extensive ILO support), and includes an action plan. This was a major achievement under the Cross-Border Movement of Labour project. Other outputs under this project included: expansion of the knowledge base through research and information sharing; capacity building for constituents and other partners (including civil society organizations); and promoting the effective use of remittances and entrepreneurship development in migrants' home communities. The Policy on Labour Migration will provide a foundation for the Government's approach to labour migration in the years to come. Many of the TICW outputs built significant government and other actor capacity that is being applied by the trained individuals and organizations across a variety of sectors. The MOLVT is very satisfied with the support provided by ILO on the issue of migration.

**In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:**

- A 20 per cent increase in regular migration, compared with 2007 figures, was targeted. With regular migration channels significantly expanded (from a low base) in 2008–2009, it is likely that this target was achieved, even though reliable data are unavailable.

**AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4.2 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **4.3 Priority area C: Social protection enhanced for targeted groups**

*DWCP outcome 4: Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in the formal and informal sectors.*

In the SMM-IP for the 2008–2009 biennium, one outcome contributed to the DWCP outcome 4: KHM176 (increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in the formal and informal sectors). This outcome was retained under the SMM-IP for the 2010–2011 biennium but was augmented by KHM 177 (capacities enhanced, policies developed and committees established to reduce HIV vulnerabilities of women and men). Progress towards each of these two outcomes is reviewed here.

#### **KHM 176**

The outcome includes the European Union-funded Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment project and the Improving Cambodian Garment Workers' Access to Health and Social Protection Services, their Pre- and Post-Garment Life Skills and Economic Opportunities project. However, resources are lacking for some current activities, notably those in support of new schemes under the National Social Security Fund (NSSF) and NSSF-C and those aiming to improve the MIS of the NSSF.

The need to consult with multiple actors due to the nature of the issues is a challenge for implementing, requiring time and coordination. Technical assistance, a tripartite workshop and fellowship training on EIIP were delivered to tripartite constituents within the Korea Worker's Compensation and Welfare Service under the ILO-Korea partnership programme. Uptake of the outputs has been high, with ILO support assisting significantly in the development of the national social protection strategy in particular.

**In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:**

- The outcome targeted employment injury insurance scheme coverage of 50 per cent of formal sector women and men workers in Phnom Penh in enterprises with more than ten workers. There are challenges associated with obtaining the data required for this indicator, but progress is reportedly being made.
- The outcome targeted one decree, regulation and implementation plan drafted for new benefits and wider geographical coverage of employment injury insurance and health insurance for formal sector workers.

In terms of progress, a feasibility study is being conducted on health insurance options. In 2008, the Government started implementing an employment injury insurance scheme for workers in the private sector.

- One policy option paper on social safety nets and social insurance benefits was developed.
- The first occupational safety and health master plan was to be implemented in cooperation with workers and employers by the end of 2010. The plan is currently being implemented, and the ILO is providing support, especially capacity building.
- The outcome targeted 100 women and men workers in informal sector workplaces for training in Work Improvement for Safe Home (WISH) and related programmes by the end of 2010. More than 200 workers were trained under WISH, with others trained on the Work Improvement in Small Construction Sites (WISCON) programme.

Due to the global economic crisis, the development of a coherent social protection strategy became a high priority of the Government. A National Social Protection Strategy for the Poor and Vulnerable was finalized in April 2010 and is awaiting promulgation. Some people interviewed during the review thought that because social protection involves a range of issues and actors, there is a need for an ILO social protection specialist to be based in Cambodia.

Abortion and malnutrition are two health issues affecting the productivity of Cambodian workers. UNICEF suggested that the ILO should consider these issues if it expands its work related to productivity, as is planned under KHM 161 (Better Factories Cambodia). There are questions as to whether ILO's comparative advantage extends to such areas. Working with partners may be a solution, as is the case with the ongoing initiative with the Marie Stopes International Foundation under Better Factories Cambodia. Further work is required on extending occupational safety and health initiatives beyond Phnom Penh and other limited areas. The national policy framework needs to be further strengthened, as do inspection and enforcement. Direct training in hazardous sectors should also be a priority. Work on the link between social protection and employment will be continued; it is already reflected in the NSPS, as is the link between AIDS and social protection. Looking further ahead (perhaps to the next biennium), work on the informal economy needs to move along.

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **KHM 177**

Included under this outcome is the project on Integrating HIV/AIDS into Garment Factory Occupational Safety and Health Committees: Working Sensitization; funding from UNAIDS and PAF has been important. The ILO has taken steps to address the recent shifts in the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS by changing its own focus from garment workers to sex workers and improving their living and working conditions through such activities as integrating entertainment workers into trade unions and partnering with the Michael Kirby Centre for Public Health and Human Rights to develop a legal aid centre for sex workers.

Outputs have generally been delivered in line with the plans. Guidelines on HIV and AIDS in occupational safety and health responses in the workplace are in place and are being applied, thus providing practical guidance on how to establish and implement a programme on HIV and AIDS in the workplace. However, some people interviewed during the review suggested that the guidelines were based on the needs of the public sector more than the private sector and thus were less relevant to private sector enterprises. Some employers reportedly have established workplace HIV/AIDS committees only to comply with the law rather than genuine interest towards addressing the issue. Worker participation is often constrained because, for example, workers have little time to prepare for meetings and have low levels of education. Some people interviewed suggested that a study that convincingly demonstrated to employers the economic benefits of addressing the issue of HIV and AIDS in the workplace would encourage them to take the matter more seriously.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The outcome targeted 30 factories for in-depth technical assistance to integrate HIV issues into their work plans and to establish HIV/AIDS committees by the end of 2010. This was achieved, although the precise number of factories assisted could not be ascertained.

- An operational guideline on HIV and AIDS in occupational safety and health and the workplace was developed and applied by mid-2010.
- Some 250 enterprises were to be sensitized on the principles of the ILO Code of Practice on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work, as required by Prakas No.086. This was achieved, although the precise number of factories assisted could not be ascertained.
- The outcome looked to have tripartite members address the HIV vulnerabilities of female entertainment sector workers in their workplace programming. The outcome's focus was originally on garment workers rather than more at-risk entertainment sector workers. As noted, the programme shifted its focus to entertainment workers and has been collaborating with the Workers Education Programme to support the integration of beer promotion workers into trade unions.

A study of the impact of the global economic crisis on garment workers and the links to the sex work industry was completed in 2010, and a legal aid centre for sex workers is being established in partnership with UNAIDS and the Michael Kirby Centre.

Work on an action plan for the National Tripartite Committee on HIV/AIDS regarding comprehensive workplace programmes is ongoing and could possibly be completed within 2011. There is also a need to work at the policy level to ensure that HIV-positive workers' rights will be protected. In general, a more strategic approach should be taken, with more emphasis on workers' rights and on links with the social protection agenda. Some people interviewed identified rubber plantation workers as a group currently lacking coverage. Further capacity building is required for partners and for workplace committees (for example, on how to complete monitoring forms). An aim for the next phase should be for workplace HIV and AIDS committees to have the capacity to function effectively and independently.

Some organizations (such as the Cambodia Business Coalition on AIDS) that are employer-funded reported reductions in funding as a result of the global economic crisis and that funding levels have still not recovered. Other organizations (such as the Reproductive Health Association of Cambodia) that are donor funded have been less affected. Concerns were raised over monitoring systems because support from UNAIDS for the systems ceased in 2010 (and there are some doubts over the capacity of the Department of Occupational Safety and Health within the MOLVT to continue the monitoring). NGO partners see ILO support as important in that it strengthens their influence.

#### **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **4.4 Predefined outcomes**

As predefined outcomes, the SMM-IP for the 2008–2009 biennium featured outcome KHM 801 (strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations) and KHM 802 (strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations). These outcomes were retained for the 2010–2011 biennium and augmented by KHM 826 (strengthened capacity of member States to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations). These three outcomes are reviewed here.

#### **KHM 801**

**No technical cooperation funding was received for this outcome, but significant progress was made with limited resources.**

In 2009, the Bureau for Employers' Activities of the ILO (ACT/EMP) brought a trade union law specialist from South Africa to help build up the capacity of CAMFEBA to evaluate both opportunities and threats presented by development of the Trade Union Law. A two-day workshop was organized with the participation of the Singapore Employers' Federation for training CAMFEBA members on researching members' opinions on future directions. Statistical software for predictive analysis was purchased, and CAMFEBA members were trained and then supported in conducting the members' survey and analysing the results. Workshops on collective bargaining were conducted with CAMFEBA members; local training capacity was built up and a guidebook adapted to the local context was developed. A NSSF guidebook and IEC materials were developed.



One person interviewed during the review suggested that CAMFEBA is probably the most active organization in the Asia-Pacific region. Uptake of outputs has been satisfactory; for example, support provided by the ILO in 2010 resulted in the development of a new CAMBFEBA strategic plan that takes into account the organization's rapid growth; support from the ILO resulted in a 75–page submission from CAMFEBA as a contribution to the consultation process over the Trade Union Law. Plans are already in place to develop a handbook for foreign investors on the social and cultural aspects of investing in Cambodia.

In terms of progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The outcome targeted improved capacity of employers' organizations to serve constituents through better management and democratic practices. Although very broad, the review team considers (in light of the cited achievements) that the indicator has been achieved.

While recognizing ILO's contribution in terms of building the capacity of employers' organizations and helping to improve industrial relations, representatives of CAMFEBA and the Garment Manufacturers Association in Cambodia thought that they had not been consulted sufficiently in the development of the DWCP. A CAMFEBA representative suggested that the following major issues should be addressed by the next DWCP:

- labour productivity, including workforce skill levels;
- the need to reform the labour law;
- job creation (CAMFEBA will provide information on the available jobs to the National Employment Agency every three months);
- youth employment;
- occupational safety and health (employers need to receive OSH training as much as employees, in CAMBFEBA's view); and
- promoting small and medium enterprise development.

The employers' representatives also suggested that documents supplied to CAMFEBA for review should be provided in user-friendly, easily accessible formats.

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 4 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **KHM 802**

This outcome originally included funding from the Norwegian Government for the Workers' Education Assistance Project. However, the funding was cut in 2010 for reasons external to the WEP project, which forced the ILO to scale down the scope of major activities while alternative support was sought (under the Global Jobs Pact).

Significant support was extended to trade unions for the law and policy drafting processes. More than 2,000 workers gained awareness of and were trained on the roles of trade unions and the importance of sound industrial relations, which contributed to a nine-point Bilateral Agreement on Mature Industrial Relations (30 March 2010) and an MOU on Bipartite Agreement on Industrial Relations in the Garment Sector on (28 September 2010). With ILO support, a trade union position paper was prepared as part of the consultative process over the new trade union law. Final tripartite consultations are scheduled for mid-2011.

Some 400 trade union leaders were trained on effective union management, which helped consolidate the organizational integration and roles and responsibilities of five confederations.<sup>8</sup> Efforts were directed towards improving the communication and knowledge sharing between the ILO and the trade union confederations.<sup>9</sup>

<sup>8</sup> Cambodian Confederation of Trade Unions, the Cambodia National Labour Confederation, the Cambodian Labour Confederation, the Cambodia Confederation of Unions and the National Union Alliance Chamber of Cambodia.

<sup>9</sup> An ILO publication on The Growth and Decline of Political Unionism in India: A paradigm shift (2010) was translated into Khmer in 2010 to promote a new model of unionism in Cambodia. Research on union proliferation and unity is being conducted.

Gender issues have been better mainstreamed into trade union activities. Around 30 Women's Committees at the local and national union levels were established.

Efforts are ongoing to organize informal economy workers. The ILO-APHEDA Joint Project on Promoting Rights of Beer Promotion Workers (April 2010–March 2011) conducted a baseline survey on working conditions and decent work deficits for beer promotion workers from two companies: Cambrew and Cambodia Brewery Ltd in Phnom Penh and trained 300 new members. The trade union manual for organizing informal sector workers (2008) was translated into Khmer in 2010. The Cambodia Labour Confederation (with funding from the ILO) produced a booklet entitled *Basic of Organizing* in Khmer and distributed 2,500 copies. Overall, more than 1,000 new members were recruited by the Cambodia Labour Confederation, the National Union Alliance Chamber of Cambodia and the Cambodian Food and Services Workers Federation.

The quality of technical support provided by ILO seems high, with trade union representatives highlighting the ILO work in raising workers' awareness of their rights (notably to freedom of association) as particularly important (informants thought that this awareness has given workers more confidence in unions and encouraged workers to become members).<sup>10</sup> Work under outcome KHM 802 also facilitated union participation under other projects, such as IPEC. In coordination with KHM 156, a garment industry-wide agreement around collective bargaining between workers and employers was reached. Also in coordination with KHM 156, a significant increase in the number of collective bargaining agreements was realized. The trade union representatives praised the ILO capacity-building support. Several representatives noted how they had started out some years ago as ordinary workers but as a result of ILO capacity-building training had become union leaders and, in some cases, trainers. The quality of the IEC materials received highly positive reviews.

Regarding the DWCP indicator on improving the capacity of trade unions to serve constituents through better management and democratic practices:

- In response to the target of progress towards a joint council of trade unions, a trade union coordination mechanism was set up.
- The outcome targeted 1,000 new union members in the construction, entertainment and financial and banking sectors. Work towards this target is ongoing; in the entertainment industry, around 200 workers have been organized to date (in partnership with APHEDA). Reportedly, there is not yet any trade union in the financial and banking sectors.

The diversity (over 40 national union federations) and relative youth of the trade union movement presents a challenge in terms of coordinating, although it has improved. The affiliation of many unions to specific political parties is a source of further constraints. Lack of awareness on the role and importance of trade unions among a significant number of employers and government officials presents an additional challenge, as does the weak rule of law in general.

Some people interviewed suggested that there should be more consultation with unions prior to start-up at the project level. Although a number of trade unions now have gender-integrating strategies, implementing them remains a major challenge; ILO support on this issue should be a priority. During the review process, trade union representatives called for new unions to be included in future activities and for additional attention to be paid to non-garment sectors, notably construction (and the informal economy in general).

## **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 3.8 (MODERATELY SATISFACTORY)**

### **KHM 826**

There is no technical cooperation funding for this outcome but resource requirements are relatively light due to the nature of the work involved. The ILO should explore the possibility of leveraging funds and technical capacity from

<sup>10</sup> Freedom of association and collective bargaining were promoted through various activities, such as workshops, trainings and publications. Good practices of collective bargaining were disseminated, targeting ten new collective bargaining agreements by 2011. In addition, the Cambodian Confederation of Trade Unions, with ILO funding, printed and distributed a model collective bargaining agreement at a shoe factory.

existing technical cooperation projects, such as IPEC, to support the Government in reporting on relevant ratified Conventions (No. 138 and No. 182 in the case of IPEC).

The Labour Dispute Resolution Project (under KHM 156) and the Better Factories Cambodia project (under KHM 161) have assisted KHM 826 in that they helped to raise relevant issues related to the labour law and standards.

Regarding progress made against relevant DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators:

- The outcome targeted the submission of all reports on ratified ILO Conventions by 1 September 2010. The ILO estimated that around 50 per cent of the Government's obligations in this respect were achieved by the end of 2010 (though there is a chance that the remaining obligations will be achieved by the end of the current biennium, in December 2011).
- The outcome targeted the translating and submitting of 80 ILO Conventions and Recommendations to the National Assembly by 1 September 2010. The translation was completed, but the MOLVT has yet to propose to the Council of Ministers that the instruments be submitted to the National Assembly.
- The Committee of Experts noted one case of progress or interest.
- The outcome also targeted the ratification process initiated for the Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 144). Convention No. 144 has not yet been ratified but work to improve its ratification prospects has been included in the terms of reference drawn up for the planned Steering Committee on Decent Work.

Some people interviewed during the review process thought that the Better Factories Cambodia should continue in its present form for some time to come, given the limited local capacity in relevant areas. Other informants suggested that a more intense focus on tightening labour inspection would be more appropriate, which should lead to the ratification of Convention No. 81 (labour inspection) and Convention No. 144.

#### **AVERAGE SCORE FOR THIS OUTCOME: 3.4 (UNSATISFACTORY)**

Based on the SMM-IP outcome assessments, an overall summary of progress against indicators related to the four DWCP outcomes is presented in table 4.1 below.

**Table 4.1 Progress against indicators related to DWCP Outcomes (outcomes 1–4)**

DWCP outcome	Progress against indicators
1. Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas	12 indicators in total: 8 achieved or exceeded; 3 partially achieved; 1 not achieved
2. Improved respect for the rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards	5 indicators in total: 3 achieved or exceeded; 1 partially achieved; 1 not achieved
3. Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples	7 indicators in total: 6 achieved or exceeded; 1 could not be assessed due to lack of data
4. Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in formal and informal sectors	9 indicators in total: 5 achieved or exceeded; 2 partially achieved; 2 could not be assessed due to lack of data

## 5. PRELIMINARY SUGGESTIONS ON PRIORITY AREAS AND THEMES FOR THE DWCP 2011–2015

Representatives of the Government, trade unions, employers' organizations and other organizations (UN agencies and NGOs) used the afternoon portion of the review workshop to suggest, based on their particular perspectives, three priority areas and up to five major themes or issues to be addressed under each priority area in the next DWCP. To guide each of the four groups on the type - particularly the level - of output being sought, examples were provided, based on the findings of the labour and social trends study, but each group was asked to develop outputs based on their own relevant policies and priorities. Table 5.1 shows the examples provided

**Table 5.1 Examples of Outputs provided to groups by priority area**

Priority area 1: Industrial relations	Priority area 2: Rights and social protection of vulnerable groups	Priority area 3: Enabling environment for employment creation
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Finalization of the trade union law and its implementation</li> <li>Improvement of a dispute resolution mechanism</li> <li>Address industrial relations issues in sectors other than garments</li> <li>Implementation of industry-wide collective bargaining agreement</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Labour migration management</li> <li>Child labour and addressing youth unemployment</li> <li>Rights of indigenous communities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Development and implementation of National Employment Policy and National Social Protection Strategy</li> <li>Skills development, linked to labour market requirements</li> <li>Strengthen labour market information system and employment services</li> </ul>

Each group presented its suggestions at the end of the workshop; the priority areas selected by each group are summarized in table 5.2 below.

**Table 5.2 Priority areas suggested by groups**

	Priority area 1	Priority area 2	Priority area 3
Government	Industrial relations	Rights and social protection	Enabling environment for employment creation
Employers	Improving industrial relations in Cambodia	Gender-balanced skills development and job creation and increased labour productivity	Improving occupational safety and health
Trade unions	Improved industrial relations through better social dialogue and legal mechanisms	Rights and social protection of vulnerable groups	Enabling environment for job security and employment creation
Other agencies/organizations	Industrial relations	Social protection for vulnerable people	Enabling environment for employment creation

The priority areas suggested by the groups were generally very similar, although certain groups included additional details to emphasize their particular concern (for example, the trade union group added "job security" to the priority area concerned with creating an enabling environment for job creation). The major differences were found in the suggestions from the employers' group, which, although agreeing with the other three groups on the first priority area of industrial relations, differed for the other two areas. The employers' second priority area (gender-balanced skills development and job creation (and increased labour productivity)) could form part of the priority area mentioned by the other groups related to an enabling environment for job creation, and the labour productivity issue would also concern industrial relations to some extent. Similarly, the priority area presented by the employers on improving occupational safety and health could form part of the priority area presented by the other groups that covers rights and social protection. In short, if the employers' second and third priorities were exchanged with each other, a consensus would be reached that would have form as shown in table 5.3.

**Table 5.3 Emerging (potential) consensus on priority areas (based on the groups' outputs)**

Priority area 1: Improved industrial relations through better social dialogue and legal mechanisms	Priority area 2: Rights and social protection of vulnerable groups	Priority area 3: Enabling environment for employment creation
	NB: Would include “and improving occupational safety and health”.	NB: Would include “and gender-balanced skills development, job creation and increased labour productivity”.

The other agencies/organizations group also suggested two cross-cutting priority areas: gender equality/equity and raising awareness of green jobs/productivity.

The complete set of suggestions from each group (see Annex VI) reveal that the major themes or issues identified under each priority area were quite similar, which bodes well for reaching consensus on the outcomes under each area in the new DWCP. The outputs of the group work will form the starting point for the process (in 2011) to develop the next DWCP.

## 6. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

The following summarizes the findings on the appropriateness and adequacy of the programme design, outreach/partnership and implementing performance:

The role and relevance of the ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage, and UN partnership approach Performance regarding this criterion was rated as satisfactory. The DWCP is well aligned with the Government's National Strategic Development Plan and Rectangular Strategy; in fact, the ILO has had some success in influencing the contents of the NSDP and other government planning and policy documents. Certain elements of the DWCP (priorities regarding the reduction of HIV vulnerabilities) are less well aligned, however.

The ILO demonstrated a certain degree of flexibility and the capacity to respond to emerging challenges, such as with its response to the global economic crisis. The DWCP priority areas and outcomes are well aligned with ILO global Strategic Policy Framework (2010–2015), and the ILO has been successful in participating in the UN Common Country Assessment and UNDAF processes to ensure that priorities for decent work are given due attention.

### Tripartite participation and partnership

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately unsatisfactory. The ILO has helped to build up the capacity of constituents to engage in national processes concerning planning, legislation and policy formulation. However, the continuing lack of a tripartite coordination committee (the establishment of which was envisaged in the DWCP document) represents a constraint to maximizing constituents' engagement in national processes as well as DWCP implementation and monitoring.

**Recommendation 1:** Continue to support the process of establishing the inter-ministerial coordination committee that has been discussed; as an interim measure, establish a temporary tripartite advisory body.

The DWCP was developed by means of a lengthy consultation process. Nevertheless, the majority of people the review team interviewed thought that the DWCP consultation process was not thorough enough and/or that they had been engaged too late in the process. The reasons for the discrepancy between the lengthy nature of the DWCP consultation process and the informants' views on the process are unclear. One explanation offered by ILO representatives is that the extended nature of the design process (partly due to the occurrence of the global economic crisis, an event obviously beyond ILO control) had a negative impact on participants' recollections of the process.

One of the consequences of this perception that certain individuals were not adequately consulted is that ownership of the DWCP was fairly weak, with the majority of the people who were interviewed having only a basic understanding – at best – of its structure and components. Another factor that may have contributed to the low level of ownership is the lack of any communications strategy to specifically promote awareness of the DWCP. However, ownership of individual projects and other initiatives appears to be high.

**Recommendation 2:** Make additional efforts to fully engage constituents and other actors from the beginning of the process to develop the next DWCP. Document the process thoroughly so that lessons can be drawn by the next DWCP review.

### The focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies

The four DWCP outcomes that emerged from the DWCP design process were very broad and gave rise to a large number of outcomes under the implementing plan for the 2010–2011 biennium (see below for further discussion).

**Recommendation 3:** ILO, together with tripartite constituents and other actors, should try to develop priority areas and, especially, outcomes for the next DWCP that are more focused and contextualized.



The ILO recommends no more than three outcomes per priority area; for the current 2010–2011 biennium, there are 11 country programme outcomes for three priority areas. A relevant issue here is that in order for a country office initiative to be “visible” to ILO headquarters (notably for funding purposes) in the form of a P&B indicator, a corresponding country programme outcome has to be created. This has been one factor behind the increase to 11 outcomes (plus three predefined outcomes).

**Recommendation 4:** The next DWCP should try to follow ILO guidance in terms of the number of outcomes, but the review team recognizes that ILO global P&B systems impose some constraints. If the next DWCP were to be more tightly focused, it should make monitoring and evaluation easier and may also assist with mobilizing resources by enabling the ILO to present to donors a more coherent country programme strategy.

The ILO has a gender mainstreaming policy, but execution of the policy under the DWCP has been only partial. The DWCP document contains just one short paragraph on gender mainstreaming, lacking detail on how the policy is to be operationalized. Gender sensitivity/responsiveness of individual projects and technical Advisers (other than gender specialists) is variable and sometimes poor.

**Recommendation 5:** The design process for the next DWCP needs to ensure that gender issues are considered in depth at each stage of the design process and that specific actions and targets are included in the final DWCP design. Gender sensitivity and responsiveness training should be provided for all ILO country office staff and technical specialists.

#### **Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO contributions and support at the national level**

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately satisfactory. The DWCP had defined clear outcome-level results, but these were generally broad and, in some cases, were very challenging to measure (and thus assess progress towards). Progress towards DWCP outcome-level results was not systematically monitored, and relevant data was not regularly compiled against the DWCP indicators. The quality of some DWCP outcome indicators was poor: some were actually outputs or even activities. In a context in which their time is limited, there is an understandable tendency for outcome managers or technical specialists to view global P&B outcomes and associated indicators as most relevant, given their importance for budget allocation. Some people interviewed frankly told the review team that they regard the DWCP largely as another layer of required reporting.

**Recommendation 6:** M&E systems need to be significantly improved for the next DWCP, a requirement that is in turn closely linked with the design of the DWCP.

The ILO was often able to leverage significant impact from limited resources during the implementing of the DWCP. The ILO technical specialists are due much of the credit for this, with the effective use of experienced consultants and partnerships with other agencies also representing significant contributions. Although a cost-benefit analysis is well beyond the scope of this review, the review team’s conclusion is that the DWCP generally offers good value for money in terms of the outcomes achieved.

Little if any attention is paid to possible secondary effects (positive or negative) in the DWCP document, which also contains no assessment of risks or risk management or mitigation plan.<sup>11</sup>

**Recommendation 7:** A risk assessment and risk management strategy should be incorporated in the next DWCP as well as the next version of the DWCP guidelines.

Sustainability is difficult to assess, partly because it is too soon to be sure of the impacts of many DWCP 2008–2010 initiatives. It is likely that many of the legal and policy reforms will have sustainable legacies at the national level and many capacity-building initiatives will also have sustainable impacts. There are concerns, however, over the sustainability of capacity-building initiatives at the local level in some cases.

---

<sup>11</sup> The current DWCP guidelines do not mention the need for risk assessments or management plans.



## The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver ILO programmes in Cambodia

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately satisfactory. The DWCP implementation was generally in line with the DWCP plan. The majority of constituent representatives see the ILO as a neutral party that can play the role of “honest broker” (although some people interviewed from the trade unions and employers’ organizations thought that, on occasion, the ILO favours the other party). People interviewed consistently acknowledged the high quality of the technical support provided by the ILO. Mobilizing resources is a challenge, although the ILO has managed to grow the total country programme budget despite the global economic crisis and associated pressures on donor spending.

The lack of an in-country ILO country office represents a major constraint, particularly given the programme’s relatively large size. Most people interviewed noted that coordination between the ILO and various actors had improved since the establishment of the Joint Project Office in 2005 (prior to the period under review) and, particularly, the creation of the national coordinator position in 2008. However, many people also suggested that coordination and communication between the ILO and actors requires further improvement.

Concerning internal coordination, the regular meeting of heads of projects represents a step forward. However, coordination across different outcomes and/or projects tends to result from individual technical specialists or project staff liaising with each other rather than from a systematic country (or regional) office process.

**Recommendation 8:** The systematic exchange of information on a periodic basis between technical specialists (through regular meetings) should be facilitated by the country and/or regional offices.

The capacity to effectively participate in the UN Common Country Assessment and UNDAF processes and the joint UN programmes is critical for the Country Office because joint programmes represent a means by which the ILO can apply one of its main comparative advantages (the ability to provide high-quality technical advice) within a stable programmatic framework despite limited ILO funding. The fact that the UNDAF 2011–2015 includes most of the issues relevant to the ILO reflects the amount of time and effort the National Coordinator and the JPO and other ILO staff devoted to the UNDAF development process. However, this represented a very significant additional effort on the part of the JPO in particular, and there are limits to what can be achieved without additional funds to support coordinating activities.

**Recommendation 9:** Given that it is highly unlikely that an in-country Country Office will be established, the ILO must ensure that the National Coordinator and the JPO have adequate (additional) financial resources to perform programmatic and administrative coordination functions.

The division of roles and responsibilities among the Country Director, National Coordinator, Programme Officer and CTAS/Project Managers/Coordinators is not well-defined.

**Recommendation 10:** Develop a functional organigram of CO-Bangkok and the JPO and share it among all ILO staff and constituents.

### Knowledge management and sharing

Performance regarding this criterion was rated as moderately unsatisfactory. M&E data from some initiatives (Better Factories Cambodia and IPEC) are being captured, analysed and disseminated widely in appropriate formats and are thereby informing initiatives elsewhere (both within Cambodia and further afield). In other cases, although M&E is generally being conducted at the project level to meet donor requirements, the data captured are not being processed and managed in a way that contributes to the broader knowledge base.

**Recommendation 11:** Linked to the suggested improvements in overall country programme coordination and DWCP M&E, efforts should be made (in collaboration with actors) to feed M&E findings into the knowledge base more systematically. Efforts should also be made to disseminate knowledge more effectively among DWCP actors and, where appropriate, more broadly (a quarterly newsletter was suggested).

There was no communications strategy dedicated to promoting awareness and understanding of the DWCP among constituents and other actors. The public visibility of initiatives successfully implemented by the ILO and its partners could generally be much higher.

**Recommendation 12:** The ILO should develop a communications strategy specifically focused on the DWCP. More generally, the ILO should use its significant achievements in Cambodia as the basis of a campaign to raise its public profile.

The only web pages available in Khmer on the country programme appear to be those belonging to the linked Better Factories Cambodia website. All the publications available via the website also appear to be in English only.

**Recommendation 13:** Consider translating sections of the ILO Cambodia website into Khmer and provide links to Khmer language versions of publications and other documents (when available). Encourage staff to upload relevant internal information onto the CO-Bangkok page of the ILO Asia Pacific Knowledge Sharing Platform.

### Summary of scores and comparison with the 2007 biennial country programme review

The table 6.1 shows that the average performance score for the DWCP 2008–2010 was 3.8. In line with ILO guidance, this must be rounded to the nearest whole number, giving a final average score of 4 (moderately satisfactory). The table also presents a comparison of scores awarded during the 2007 biennial country programme review, which used similar criteria. The comparison reveals that the average score in 2007 was slightly higher (4.4 as opposed to 3.8), although after rounding, the rating is the same (moderately satisfactory). The 2007 review used a different methodology, however, thus the results of the two reviews are not strictly comparable.

**Table 6.1 Performance scores for the DWCP reviews 2007 and 2010**

Performance criterion	Score in 2010 review	Score in 2007 review*
1. The role and relevance of the ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage and UN partnership approach	5	5
2. Tripartite participation and partnership	3	4
3. The focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies	4	Not assessed as a specific criterion
4. Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO contributions and support at the national level	4	5
5. The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO programme in Cambodia	4	4
6. Knowledge management and sharing	3	4
<b>AVERAGE</b>	<b>3.8</b>	<b>4.4</b>

\* Rounded to nearest whole number

### Findings regarding progress towards DWCP outcomes

Section 4 of this report presents an assessment of progress towards the DWCP outcomes, assigning scores to each on the basis of criteria specified in the TOR. Progress could not be rigorously assessed because of the problems concerning DWCP M&E as well as the limited time available for the review. Additionally, the outcome scores can be significantly influenced by factors external to ILO activities. For these reasons, as highlighted previously, the review team leader considers the scores to be to be highly subjective and of limited utility.

**Recommendation 14:** The approach prescribed in the TOR for assessing progress towards DWCP outcomes should be revised. If it is mandatory to continue with some type of scoring system, at a minimum it should distinguish between the performance of the ILO (regarding factors within its control) and the influence of external factors (beyond ILO control). Currently, the overall score for each outcome conflates these factors.

The summary of progress towards DWCP indicators in the table 6.2 below indicates that overall progress has been good, with 67 per cent of indicators having been achieved or exceeded, compared with only 6 per cent that have not been met.

**Table 6.2 Summary of progress towards DWCP indicators**

Total No. of DWCP outcome indicators	No. indicators met or exceeded / %	No. indicators partially met / %	No. indicators not met / %	No. indicators that could not be assessed due to lack of data / %
33	22/67	6/18	2	3

Progress towards 12 of the 14 current SMM-IP outcomes was assessed as being moderately satisfactory, with the exception of:

- KHM 157 (government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children) and KHM 161 (working conditions and competitiveness in the garment sector is improved through compliance with international labour standards and national labour law as well as through promotion of decent work); progress towards both was assessed as satisfactory.
- KHM 826 (strengthened capacity of member States to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations); progress towards this outcome was assessed as unsatisfactory.

## REFERENCES

---

Asian Development Bank (ADB). 2010. *Key indicators for Asia and the Pacific 2010* (Manila).

Hughes, C. and Un, K. 2007. *Cambodia country governance assessment* (Birmingham, International Development Department, University of Birmingham).

International Labour Organization (ILO). 2007. *Biennial country programme review 2006-7 Cambodia: Final report* (Bangkok).

\_\_\_\_\_. 2010a. “Cambodia’s garment industry struggles in the face of the global economic downturn”, in *Better Factories Cambodia garment industry update*. Mar. (Phnom Penh).

\_\_\_\_\_. 2010b. *Decent Work country programme: Cambodia* (Phnom Penh).

\_\_\_\_\_. 2011. *LDRP termination report January 2011* (Phnom Penh).

Cambodian League for the Promotion and Defence of Human Rights (Licadho). 2007. *Human rights in Cambodia: The charade of justice* (Phnom Penh).

Ministry of Planning and United Nations Development Programme. 2007. *Cambodia human development report 2007: Expanding choices for rural people* (Phnom Penh).

National Institute of Statistics (NIS) and International Labour Organization (ILO). 2010. *Labour and social trends in Cambodia 2010* (Phnom Penh).

Royal Government of Cambodia. 2010. *National strategic development plan: Update 2009-2013* (Phnom Penh).

Royal Government of Cambodia. 2010a. *National social protection strategy for the poor and vulnerable*, Phnom Penh.

United Nations Development Programme (UNDP). 2009. *Human development report 2009 – Overcoming Barriers: Human mobility and development* (New York).

World Bank. 2010. *East Asia and the Pacific economic update* (Washington, DC).

# ANNEX I: TERMS OF REFERENCE

## Cambodia DWCP (2008–2010) review

### 1) Introduction

The first Cambodia country programme review was conducted in November 2007 with the participation of ILO tripartite constituents. The review assessed the adequacy and appropriateness of the design, outreach and implementation of the DWCP and made recommendations for improvement, especially in terms of results-based management. The findings and recommendations were appreciated by tripartite constituents; the Cambodia DWCP for 2008–2010 has continued to focus on three priorities: i) productive employment opportunities; ii) good governance; and iii) rights and social protection. The current Cambodia DWCP will close by the end of December 2010. CO-Bangkok has requested RO-Asia and the Pacific to help conduct a review of Cambodia's current DWCP programme before the next DWCP is designed.

The review will be coordinated by the RO-Asia and the Pacific in cooperation with CO-Bangkok. Consultations will be sought from relevant actors, including Cambodian tripartite constituents, other partners, RO-Asia and the Pacific management and DWT-Bangkok throughout the process.

The core review team will consist of an international consultant to act as team leader, together with an ILO evaluation officer from RO-Asia and the Pacific. CO-Bangkok and the ILO project officer in Phnom Penh will provide inputs and support to the review team. The ILO approach is to encourage participation of actors throughout the review process. The accuracy of the Cambodia country programme review will depend critically on the collaboration from the national constituents.

### 2) Background and context

The ILO has been a partner in Cambodia's economic and democratic recovery since the early 1990s. It supports the efforts of its tripartite constituents – Government, workers' organizations and employers' organizations – to expand opportunities for good-quality employment to improve the effectiveness of social dialogue between employers and workers and to improve social protection and equity for all Cambodians in a growing economy.

The Ministry of Labour and Vocational Training (MOLVT) is the main government counterpart for the ILO. The ILO also works with other ministries in carrying out its mandate, such as the Ministry of Commerce (MOC), the Ministry of Women's Affairs (MOWA), the Ministry of Rural Development (MRD), the Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth (MOSVY), the Ministry of Industry, Mines, and Energy (MIME), the Ministry of Education Youth and Sport (MOEYS), the Ministry of Public Works and Transport (MOPWT), the Ministry of Tourism (MOT), the Ministry of Interior (MOI) and the Ministry of Planning (MOP).

The Cambodia Federation of Employers and Business Associations (CAMFEBA) and the national trade union confederation groups are ILO social partners.

The outcomes of the Cambodia DWCP 2008–2010 reflects the priorities of the tripartite constituents, and they contribute to the UNDAF Cambodia (2006–2010) and the Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency (phase II).<sup>1</sup> The programmatic relationship between DWCP, UNDAF and the Rectangular Strategy is illustrated in Annex III.

In addition, the Cambodia DWCP (2008–2010) also responds to the economic crisis. There are three major priorities and four major outcomes, as follows:

<sup>1</sup> The Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency set out the Government's development priorities and strategy for meeting the Cambodia Millennium Development Goals and the National Poverty Reduction Strategy.

## Cambodia DWCP (2008–2010)

Priority sectors /areas	Country programme outcomes
1) Employment and skills development strategies for productive employment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas</li> </ul>
2) Labour market governance and rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Improved respect for the rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards</li> <li>Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples</li> </ul>
3) Social protection enhanced for target groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in formal and informal sectors</li> </ul>

## ILO main means of action for implementing DWCP 2008–2010

- 1) To promote productive employment opportunities, the ILO provides assistance to develop, implement and build capacity on four major areas: i) centralizing employment in economic and social policy; ii) training and skills development for enhanced employability; iii) support to micro and small enterprise development; and iv) promoting labour-intensive infrastructure development. The strategies that combine “upstream” policy development work (national level) with subnational and grass-roots interventions (projects and demonstration works) reflect the structure of the Cambodian economy and labour market because the underlying focus is on low-income groups in rural areas, where some of the greatest decent work challenges lie.
- 2) In the areas of labour governance, the ILO technically supports advisory committees on the revision of the labour law, offering drafting advice regarding proposed amendments based on international good practices and international labour standards and facilitates tripartite consultations on proposed amendments. The ILO also provides technical support and capacity building of conciliation and mediation services capable of handling disputes more effectively, strengthening the infrastructure of the Arbitration Council and enabling it to become self-sustaining. The ILO also facilitates the transfer of responsibilities under the Better Factories Cambodia programme to local actors for monitoring and improving working conditions in garment-exporting factories.
- 3) In the areas of rights, the ILO continues to provide policy advice and technical assistance to the Government and social partners so that national plan of action on child labour and child trafficking are effectively implemented at the national and provincial levels. The ILO also promotes safe migration as a means to prevent trafficking of women and children through a well-managed labour migration policy and regulation framework. The ILO supports the Government to create more opportunities for consultation and participation of disabled persons and indigenous people in the policy and legislative processes concerning them. The ILO also supports the integrating of gender responsiveness into government policies and programmes and redresses gender inequalities.
- 4) In the areas of social protection, the ILO provides technical assistance and policy advice to the Government and social partners on the legislative framework of the establishment of social security schemes and enhancing capacities of government officials for future implementation of the schemes. The ILO provides technical assistance to the implementation and capacity building of the national occupational safety and health programmes. The ILO also assists in capacity building of its tripartite constituents to implement existing policies and strategy to prevent discrimination against people living with HIV.

There have been approximately ten projects in Cambodia from January 2008–December 2011.

The ILO has no office in Cambodia, but there is a Joint Project Office with project staff. A National Coordinator was recruited in August 2008 to represent CO-Bangkok in liaising with Cambodian counterparts. The overall ILO work in Cambodia is under the responsibility of the director of CO-Bangkok, while technically the programme is backstopped by DWT-Bangkok.

Following ILO Strategic Policy Framework (2006–2009) and the new Strategic Policy Framework (2010–2015) and the programme and budget (P&B) 2008–2009 and P&B 2010–2011, the number of Country Programme outcomes have expanded to reflect the country programme's contribution to the global ILO programme framework. The mapping of the outcomes follows.

### Mapping of country programme outcomes

DWCP document	SMM/IP 2008–2009	SMM/IP 2010–2011
Priority1: KHM 100 – Employment and skills development strategies for productive employment		
1. Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas	KHM104: Increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas	KHM104: Increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas.
		KHM 105: Skills development that improve the employability of women and men workers, youth and people with disabilities in the rural areas of Cambodia
		KHM 106: Sustainable enterprises that create productive, equitable and decent work for women and men
Priority 2: KHM 150– Labour governance and rights		
2. Improved respect for the rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards	KHM156: Improved rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards	KHM 156: Strengthened tripartism and labour market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations
		KHM 160: Improved rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards
		KHM 161: Working conditions and competitiveness in the garment sector is improved through compliance with international labour standards and the national labour law as well as through the promotion of decent work



DWCP document	SMM/IP 2008–2009	SMM/IP 2010–2011
3. Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples	KHM151: Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, and indigenous peoples	KHM 157: Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children
		KHM 158: Government and social partners adopt and implement non-discrimination policies to improve and protect the rights of women, domestics workers and indigenous peoples
		KHM 159: Government and social partners develop and implement policies to manage migration, protect migrant workers and combat human trafficking in line with ILO principles
Priority 3: KHM175– Social protection enhanced for targeted groups		
4. Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in formal and informal economies	KHM176: Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in the formal and informal sectors	KHM 176: Increased social protection coverage for working women and men in the formal and informal sectors
		KHM 177: Capacities enhanced, policies developed and committees established to reduce HIV vulnerabilities of women and men
	KHM800: Strong and representative employers’ and workers’ organizations influencing economic, social and governance policies	
	KHM801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers’ organizations	KHM801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers’ organizations
	KHM802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers’ organizations	KHM802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers’ organizations
	KHM803: Increased capacities of employers’ and workers’ organizations to participate effectively in the development of a social and labour policy	
		KHM 825: Ratification and application of international labour standards
		KHM 826: Strengthened capacity of member States to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations

### 3) Client

The principal clients for the review are the ILO's national constituents, CO-Bangkok and national implementing partners, all of whom support national efforts to decent work and poverty reduction and who share responsibility for deciding on follow up to the findings and recommendations. The review is also intended for the CO-Bangkok by providing a basis for improved insights as to how to better design, implement, monitor and assess country programmes in the future.

### 4) Purposes and scope of the DWCP review

The purpose of the review of ILO Cambodia's DWCP for the 2008–2010 period is to provide an opportunity for reflection and lesson learning regarding how the ILO could improve the effectiveness of its operations in the next DWCP for Cambodia. The review has three purposes.

1. Assess the adequacy and appropriateness of the design, outreach and implementation of the ILO interventions; identify and make recommendations for improvement, especially in terms of results-based management.
2. Review through an operational assessment to report on progress being made on tangible outcomes directly resulting from ILO contributions.
3. Take stock of what has worked, what needs improvement and what is feasible and should be prioritized for continuation in the next DWCP, taking into account the crisis and the new national development plan.

#### Scope

The country programme review for Cambodia (2008–2010) will cover all interventions planned and carried out during January 2008 to December 2010. The review will also examine the strategy, capacity and resources available to deliver the DWCP outcomes or milestones set for the 2008–2009 and 2010–2011 biennia. The review scope has two main components. The first involves a review of the appropriateness and adequacy of the programme design, outreach and partnership and implementation performance. The second component of the review is an operational assessment to report on progress being made on tangible outcomes directly resulting from ILO contributions. In summary, the scope of the work is as follows:

1. Assess the overall relevance of the programme to national development challenges, national priorities (the Rectangular Strategy for Growth, Employment, Equity and Efficiency; the National Poverty Reduction Strategy; the National Strategic Development Plan 2006–2010), the UNDAF, ILO priorities and the CMDGs.
2. Assess the programme formulation process and the focus, coherence and logical fit of the outcomes, outputs and strategies.
3. Analyse programme implementation:
  - a) effectiveness of interventions in producing results, with particular attention to synergies/coherence across interventions;
  - b) sustainability, with particular attention to capacity/institutional development and the creation of an enabling environment (changes in laws, policies and behaviours);
  - c) factors of success and constraints encountered (internal and external);
  - d) adaptation/adjustments to the changing situation (emerging opportunities and threats); evidence of the application of lessons learned;
  - e) partnership approach, the role/effectiveness of partners in promoting decent work and coordination among partners;
  - f) knowledge management: communication strategy (internal and external), use of knowledge and incorporation of M&E into the knowledge base;
  - g) organizational arrangements (managerial, administrative and business processes);

- h) resource availability; and
- i) efficiency of programme execution (time and costs).

4. Assess progress towards the outputs and outcomes (with data-supported evidence and using the scale and matrix in TOR Annex II ) including the assessment of milestones set for the 2008–2009 and 2010–2011 biennia.

The depth of achievement of the objectives will be commensurate with the number of days allocated to consultation processes.

## 5) Proposed methodology

The review exercise is an assessment of the three-year ILO programme. The methodology will entail an extensive desk review of relevant documentation. It also will include an in-country mission by the review team for information gathering. That process will include a series of meetings/interviews between the review team and the Government, workers' and employers' organizations, other UN agencies, major donors and national partners, as appropriate. A review workshop will be organized as a platform for relevant internal and external colleagues to analyse and discuss the ILO work in the country.

An external consultant will be hired to facilitate the review process and to prepare the review report. The TOR will be finalized to take into account inputs from ILO constituents.

The external consultant will draft the review report, based on the inputs from the consultations with relevant actors and with members of the review team. The draft report will be submitted to RO-Asia and the Pacific, who will share the draft report with partners for their inputs.

RO-Asia and the Pacific will also share the draft report with relevant ILO staff and specialists for comments. RO-Asia and the Pacific will consolidate all the comments and submit them to the external consultant for consideration to incorporate them in the revised report.

The core review team will consist of an international consultant to act as team leader; the ILO evaluation officer from RO-Asia and the Pacific will participate. A regional programme analyst from RO-Asia and the Pacific may also join as part of the review team.

The CO-Bangkok director, programme officer and the Cambodian National Coordinator will help facilitate the review process. In addition, ILO specialists and other staff may be asked to contribute to the exercise, including through participation in the review process.

## Preparation

1) CO-Bangkok will provide the following documents to the review team:

- Portfolio of projects during 2008–2009 and 2010–2011 and its extra-budgetary resources.
- Up-to-date total allocation and expenditure (RB, RBTC, PSI, XBTC and RBSA) during 2008–2009 and 2010–2011 by outcomes.
- Summary of relevant countries' policies, such as employment, migration, education, social security and labour protection.
- Other relevant background information, including project progress reports and project evaluations as well as evidence of major outputs and other performance-related information.

2) CO-Bangkok will schedule meetings for the review team with the following:

- RO-Asia and the Pacific management, DWT-Bangkok's Director and relevant specialists
- Government (Ministry of Labour, Ministry of Planning, etc.)
- workers' organization

- employers' organizations
  - UN agencies
  - possible major donors
  - other partners
- 3) CO-Bangkok will facilitate logistical arrangement and inform/invite tripartite constituents for consultation during the review process, which includes inputs to the draft TOR, discussions during the review mission, participation in the review workshop and inputs to the draft report.

### Actual review

The external consultant will facilitate group meetings/discussions (with internal ILO staff, tripartite constituents, relevant ministries, UN agencies and donors) commensurate with the time allocated.

## 6) Outputs

- The external consultant will present the preliminary findings and recommendations in the tripartite constituent's review workshop after the review mission.
- The external consultant will prepare a draft and final report, based on the scope of the work in this TOR and in line with the objectives of the review. The report should include:
  - analysis from the review of documentations;
  - analysis of the responses given by constituents;
  - findings from the interviews of tripartite constituents and actors; and
  - inputs from the tripartite review workshop.

Draft and final reports will be produced in English and should not exceed 30 pages, excluding Annexes.

- The lessons learned and recommendations should include how to better design, implement, monitor and assess country programmes in the future as well as strategies for the future DWCP of Cambodia, but not limited to the following:
  - ILO role and relevance, its niche and comparative advantage;
  - the alignment of technical cooperation projects and country programme;
  - capacity building and sustainability;
  - partnership approach;
  - cost containment and efficiency;
  - risks and ways of managing them;
  - knowledge management;
  - organizational arrangements;
  - resource mobilization; and
  - exit or transition strategy.

## 7) Provisional work plan and schedule

This timetable is based on the scope of work and methodology set out above and resources available for the review.

### Proposed time table:

Task	Time frame	Responsible unit/ person	Consultations
Draft TORs prepared	November 2010	RO-Asia and the Pacific	CO-Bangkok
Identification of external facilitator	November 2010	RO-Asia and the Pacific	CO-Bangkok
Internal and external consultations to finalize terms of reference	November-December 2010	RO-Asia and the Pacific	CO-Bangkok, DWT-Bangkok and Tripartite constituents
Preparation documents and summary performance profiles by outcomes	15 December 2010	CO-Bangkok	CO-Bangkok, project staff and ILO staff in Cambodia
An itinerary scheduled for the review team to get inputs from national stakeholders (government, workers and employers' organizations, UN agencies etc.), and DWT Bangkok	15 December 2010	CO-Bangkok	DWT-Bangkok Tripartite constituents and key partners
Documents reviewed by the review team	January 2010	Consultant and other review team members	Documents should be shared with national stakeholders
Field mission/consultations - missions to ILO RO-Asia and the Pacific by consultant - meeting/ interview with actors in Cambodia	10–11 January 2010 Bangkok 12–21 January 2010 Cambodia	Review team CO-Bangkok	RO management CO-Bangkok DWT team Project staff National tripartite actors, national partners, UN agencies
Review workshop	21 January 2010	Review team	Tripartite constituents and CO-Bangkok Project staff relevant DWT specialists
First draft report	7 February 2010	Consultant/ review team	RO-Asia and the Pacific and CO-Bangkok
Sharing draft report for comments/ inputs and consolidation of comments to consultant	7–18 February 2010 (comments consolidated and sent to consultant on 22 February)	RO-Asia and the Pacific	All actors
Final report submitted	25 February 2010	Consultant/ RO-Asia and the Pacific	
Follow up on the recommendations	March 2010	CO-Bangkok	

## 8) Resources

RO-Asia and the Pacific will provide funds for hiring external collaborator for Cambodia DWCPreview and other costs relevant to the review process.

### TOR Annex I: Performance criteria for Cambodia DWCP review

The scoring categories are below

1	2	3	4	5	6
Very unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Moderately unsatisfactory	Moderately satisfactory	Satisfactory	Very satisfactory

#### The role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage and UN partnership approach

Performance criteria:

- National political, economic and social factors have shaped formulation of a country programme.
- There is flexibility and ability to respond to emerging opportunities.
- ILO establishes priorities consistent with its capacities and comparative advantages.
- ILO ensures CCA addresses subjects that are priorities for decent work in the country.
- ILO achieves overall policy coherence between ILO action and the UNDAF.
- PRSPs/ MDGs: ILOcountry programme links to and supports/influences national PRSs.

#### Tripartite participation and partnership

Performance criteria:

- National tripartite constituents are active in national development planning forums and networks.
- National tripartite constituents take ownership of the ILOcountry programme.
- Tripartite constituents have improved capacities to influence national policy and resources within decent work areas.
- Constituents have clear links to target groups.

#### The focus and coherence of programme's design and strategies

Performance criteria:

- Programme coherence supports an integrated approach to decent work.
- Country programme fits within ILO's Strategic Policy Framework and programme and budget priorities and strategies.
- Country programme reflects a consensus between the country and the ILO on decent work priorities and areas of cooperation.
- Presents a strategy with main means of action for delivery of ILO support.
- Cross-cutting goals are integrated (non-discrimination and gender, and international labour standards in general).
- Current programme is coherent, logical and captures opportunities for reinforcing each other in meeting objectives.
- Partnerships and tripartite constituents build national capacities and support policy change.
- That ILO responds to recognized needs among constituents is verified.
- Resource mobilization is an integral part of strategies.



**Evidence of the direct and indirect results of ILO contributions and support at the national level**

## Performance criteria:

- The programme has defined clear outcome-level results against which it can be assessed.
- These results are documented and verifiable.
- The outcomes justify the resources spent.
- The secondary effects, either positive or negative, are known and associated risks addressed.
- ILO has influenced thinking and action related to policy changes.
- Results are sustainable by partner institutions and at various levels (local, national, regional).
- Successful demonstration and pilot interventions are expanded and replicated.

**The efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO programme in Cambodia**

## Performance criteria:

- The operations of the programme match the programme plan.
- The ILO has operated fairly and with integrity.
- Credible, skilled specialists support the work.
- Resource mobilization is effectively and efficiently carried out.
- Work processes are efficient and timely.

**Knowledge management and sharing**

## Performance criteria:

- M&E is part of the knowledge base.
- Office follows a communications and knowledge management strategy, making effective use of its web site and other tools for outreach.
- ILO knowledge development used to improve national programmes, policies and benefit priority groups.

**TOR Annex II: Summary of specific outcome performance profile****Performance factors and related questions for outcome-specific findings regarding progress and performance****A. Resource adequacy**

- Is the plan adequately resourced? What is under-resourced and why?

**B. Delivery of outputs**

- Were all the planned outputs delivered by the end of 2010?
- Was the quality and quantity of outputs delivered satisfactory/acceptable?

**C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups**

- Were the outputs delivered by the ILO also used by the partners/ target groups?

**D. Progress made (against outcome indicators/milestones)**

- Was there progress or /changes in the country in the past three years (taking into account the milestones set)?
- If not, why did it not happen?

**E. Emerging risks and opportunities**

- What are emerging risks and/or opportunities that affected the progress of this specific outcome?
- Did the country programme take into consideration those risks and opportunities and adjust the outcome and/or its strategies?

The scoring categories are below

1	2	3	4	5	6
Very unsatisfactory	Unsatisfactory	Moderately unsatisfactory	Moderately satisfactory	Satisfactory	Very satisfactory

#### Outcome-specific findings regarding progress and performance

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents/ partners
A. Resource adequacy		
B. Delivery of outputs		
C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups		
D. Progress made (against outcome indicators)		
E. Emerging risks and opportunities		
Total score		

### TOR Annex III: Programmatic relationship between DWCP, UNDAF and Rectangular Strategy

DWCP outcome	UNDAF outcome	Rectangular Strategy	Programmatic relation
1. Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas	2.2 Increased and equitable access to and utilization of land, natural resources, markets and basic services to enhance livelihood  2.3 The rural poor and vulnerable using their enhanced skills, abilities and rights to increase productivity	Rectangle 2: Further rehabilitation and construction of the physical infrastructure  Rectangular 3: Private sector development and employment	The DWCP supports the UNDAF and Rectangular Strategy by providing technical assistance and necessary capacity building on employment strategy, with a focus on rural areas on training and skills development for enhanced employability; support to micro-and small enterprise development; and promoting labour intensive infrastructure development.  The ILO also develops an action plan to help the country mitigate the negative impact of the financial crisis.

DWCP outcome	UNDAF outcome	Rectangular Strategy	Programmatic relation
2. Improved respect of the rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards	<p>1.1 Increased participation of civil society and citizens in decision-making for the development, implementation and monitoring of public policies</p> <p>1.2 Improved public access to information related to management of public resources, judicial decisions, laws and rights</p> <p>1.3 Effective, independent and impartial justice system set up and equal access increased</p> <p>1.5 Increased efficiency and effectiveness of the public administration and decentralized governance structure to deliver basic services</p>	Good governance as prerequisite of socio-economic development and social justice focused on fighting corruption, legal and judicial reform, public administration reform including decentralization and deconcentration, and reform of the Royal Cambodian Armed Forces	The DWCP supports the UNDAF and the Rectangular Strategy by promoting industrial peace through the revision of laws and strengthened labour institutions that demonstrate compliance with the national labour law and international labour standards and by promoting collective bargaining and social dialogue between employers and workers organizations.
3. Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women and migrant workers and indigenous peoples	<p>1.1 Increased participation of civil society and citizens in decision-making for the development, implementation and monitoring of public policies</p> <p>1.5 Increased efficiency and effectiveness of the public administration and decentralized governance structure to deliver basic services</p> <p>3.3 Significant reduction in all forms of violence against women and children and trafficking of women and children</p>	Good governance as the core focus on fighting corruption, legal and judicial reform, public administration reform including decentralization and deconcentration, and reform of the Royal Cambodian Armed Forces	The DWCP supports the UNDAF and the Rectangular Strategy by providing policy advisory services to the Government and social partners on the national plan of action against the worst forms of child labour, on the prevention of trafficking of women and children through a well-managed labour migration regulatory framework and on the promotion of the rights and participation of disabled, indigenous peoples and women workers in policy and legislative processes concerning them.

DWCP outcome	UNDAF outcome	Rectangular Strategy	Programmatic relation
4. Increased social protection coverage for working women and men in the formal and informal sectors	<p>3.1 Increased equitable access to and use of quality social services</p> <p>3.2 Increased awareness and empowerment of the population, particularly women, children and youth, to their rights to social services</p>	Rectangular 4: Capacity building and human resource development, including enhancing health services	The DWCP supports the UNDAF and the Rectangular Strategy by providing technical assistance to the Government and social partners on the legislative framework for the establishment and implementation of social security schemes, on finalizing and implementing national OSH programmes and strengthening national OSH capacities; and on strengthening the capacity of tripartite constituents to implement policies and strategies to prevent discrimination against people living with HIV and on the creation of HIV/AIDS working groups or committees.

## ANNEX II

### Mapping of country programme outcomes

DWCP document	SMM/IP 2008–2009	SMM/IP 2010–2011
Priority area A: KHM 100 – Employment and skill development strategies for productive employment		
country priority outcome 1. Increased productive employment opportunities of women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas	KHM104: Increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities, particularly in the rural areas	KHM104: Increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas
		KHM 105: Skills development that improve the employability of women and men workers, youth and people with disabilities in the rural areas of Cambodia
		KHM 106: Sustainable enterprises that create productive, equitable and decent work for women and men
Priority area B: KHM 150– Labour governance and rights		
country priority outcome 2. Improved respect for the rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards	KHM156: Improved rule of law, more effective labour law, and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards.	KHM 156: Strengthened tripartism and labour market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations
		KHM 160: Improved rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards
		KHM 161: Working conditions and competitiveness in the garment sector is improved through compliance with international labour standards and the national labour law as well as through promotion of decent work

DWCP document	SMM/IP 2008–2009	SMM/IP 2010–2011
CP outcome 3. Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, migrant workers and indigenous peoples	KHM151: Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children, women, and indigenous peoples	KHM 157: Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children
		KHM 158: Government and social partners adopt and implement non-discrimination policies to improve and protect the rights of women, domestics workers and indigenous peoples
		KHM 159: Government and social partners develop and implement policies to manage migration, protect migrant workers, and combat human trafficking in line with ILO principles
Priority area C: KHM175– Social protection enhanced for targeted groups		
CP outcome 4. Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in formal and informal sectors	KHM176: Increased social protection coverage to men and women workers in formal and informal sectors	KHM 176: Increased social protection coverage for working women and men in formal and informal sectors
		KHM 177: Capacities enhanced, policies developed and committees established to reduce HIV vulnerabilities of women and men
	KHM800: Strong and representative employers’ and workers’ organizations influencing economic, social and governance policies (predefined)	
	KHM801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers’ organizations	KHM801: Strengthened institutional capacity of employers’ organizations
	KHM802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers’ organizations	KHM802: Strengthened institutional capacity of workers’ organizations
	KHM803: Increased capacities of employers’ and workers’ organizations to participate effectively in the development of social and labour policy	
		KHM 825: Ratification and application of international labour standards (predefined)
		KHM 826: Strengthened capacity of member states to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations



## ANNEX III

### Persons consulted

Date of meeting	Persons met	Position/organization	Remarks
10 January 2011 08.30 – 11.30	Mr Jiyuan Wang Ms Suradee Bhadasiri Mr William Salter Mr Guy Thijs  Ms Thetis Mangahas  Ms Karin Klotzbuecher Mr Chris Donnges Ms Sukti Dasgupta  Mr Huynh Phu Ms Carmela Torres	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director CO-Bangkok</li> <li>Programme Officer</li> <li>Director DWT-Bangkok</li> <li>Deputy Regional Director (management and Administration)</li> <li>Deputy Regional Director (Policy and Programme)</li> <li>Chief – RPS</li> <li>Senior Specialist on Employment Intensive</li> <li>Senior Specialist on Employment and Labour Market Policy</li> <li>Labour Market Information Officer</li> <li>Senior Skills Development Specialist</li> </ul>	1. ILO
10 January 2011 13.00 – 16.00	Ms Sandra Yu Ms Annemarie Reerink Ms Valerie Breda Ms E. Pozzan  Mr John Ritchotte  Ms Simrin Singh Ms Nellen Haspels	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Local Strategies for Decent Work Specialist</li> <li>Chief Technical Adviser (WEDGE)</li> <li>Microfinance Expert</li> <li>Coordinator of the Project on Promoting the Employability and Employment of Peoples with Disabilities</li> <li>Specialist in Labour Administration and Labour Relations</li> <li>Senior Specialist on Child Labour</li> <li>Senior Specialist in Gender and Women Workers Issues</li> </ul>	2. ILO
11 January 2011 09.00 – 15.00	Mr Kenichi Kamae  Mr Nilim Baruah Mr Tim De Meyer  Mr John Ritchotte  Mr Tsuyoshi Kawakami  Ms Valarie Schmitt Mr Richard Howard Mr Dragan Radic Mr Pong-Sul Ahn	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Chief Technical Adviser and Project Coordinator ILO/Japan Multi-bilateral Programme</li> <li>Chief Technical Adviser (TRIANGLE)</li> <li>Senior Specialist in International Labour Standards and Labour Law</li> <li>Specialist in Labour Administration and Labour Relations</li> <li>Senior Specialist in Occupational Safety and Health</li> <li>Social Security Specialist</li> <li>Senior Regional HIV/AIDS Specialist</li> <li>Senior Specialist in Employers' Activities</li> <li>Senior Specialist in Workers' Activities</li> </ul>	3. ILO
13 January 2011 10.00 – 12.00	Mr Huy Vuthy  Ms Khiev Ratana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Business Development Manager of CBCA</li> <li>Programme Officer of RHAC</li> </ul>	CBCA: Cambodia Business Coalition on AIDS 4. RHAC: Reproductive Health Association of Cambodia
13 January 2011 13.45 – 15.15	Ms Heng Seltik Mr Sek Sophorn Mr Khleang Rim	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>NPC of WEDGE, ILO</li> <li>NPC of ITP, ILO</li> <li>NPC of TRIANGLE, ILO</li> </ul>	NPC: National Project Coordinator WEDGE: Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equality ITP: Supporting Indigenous People

Date of meeting	Persons met	Position/organization	Remarks
13 January 2011 15.30 – 17.00	Ms Undraa Suren Ms Por Chuong Ms Ok Malika Mr Chea Sophal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>SPG Specialist, ILO</li> <li>HIV/AIDS Focal Point, ILO</li> <li>NPO of SEC-SOC, ILO</li> <li>NPC of MDGF, ILO</li> </ul>	SPG: Social Protection and Gender NPO: National Programme Officer
13 January 2011 15.30 – 17.00	Mr MP Joseph Mr Ouk Sisovan Mr Theng Chhovrith Mr Un Vuthy Mr Sao Kosal	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CTA of IPEC, ILO</li> <li>Senior Programme Officer, ILO</li> <li>Programme Officer, ILO</li> <li>Programme Officer, ILO</li> <li>Field Coordinator, ILO</li> </ul>	CTA: Chief Technical Adviser IPEC: International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour
13 January 2011 15.30 – 17.00	Mr Chhieu Veyara Mr Yim Serey Vathanak	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>NPC of LDRP, ILO</li> <li>NPC of WEP, ILO</li> </ul>	LDRP: Labour Dispute Resolution Project WEP: Worker Education Project
14 January 2011 9.00 – 12.00	Mr Srey Kimheng Mr Rott Mony Ms Heng Chenda  Ms Khat Sophy Mr Soy Seyha Mr Neak Nuon Mr Sok Sovanndeith Mr Sok Chhun Oeung Mr Kim Chan Samnang Ms Sok Thach Mr Reim Bora	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary General of FTUWKC</li> <li>President of CCTUF</li> <li>President of Women's Committee of CCAWDU-CLC</li> <li>Vice President of CIFUF</li> <li>Secretariat of CCTU</li> <li>Secretary General of NIFTUC-CNC</li> <li>President of BWTUC-CLC</li> <li>Vice President of IDEA</li> <li>President of TUWFPD-NACC</li> <li>Secretary General of CUF-CCTU</li> <li>President of FUKDW</li> </ul>	FTUWKC: Free Trade Union of Workers of the Kingdom of Cambodia CCTUF: Cambodia Construction Trade Union Federation CCTU: Cambodian Confederation of Trade Unions NIFTUC: National Independent Federation Textile Union of Cambodia BWTUC: Building and Wood Workers Trade Union Federation of Cambodia CLC: Cambodian Labour Confederation IDEA: Independent Democratic of Informal Economic Association TUWFPD: Trade Union Workers Federation of Progress Democracy NACC: National Union Alliance Chamber of Cambodia CUF: Cambodian Union Federation FUKDW: Federation Union of Khmer Democracy Workers
14 January 2011 13.30 – 15.30	Mr Sok Somith	Director of FLD	FLD: Farmer Livelihood Development
14 January 2011 16.00 – 17.00	H.E. Mean Sophea	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Adviser to the Ministry of Commerce &amp; Director of Trade Preferences System Department, Ministry of Commerce</li> </ul>	
14 January 2011 16.00 – 17.00	H.E. Hong Chouen Mr Nuon Rithy Mr Soung Sangva Vuthy	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Head of NEA</li> <li>Consultant</li> <li>Chief of Planning and Cooperation Unit</li> </ul>	NEA: National Employment Agency

Date of meeting	Persons met	Position/organization	Remarks
14 January 2011 16.00 – 17.00	Mr Seng Thuy Mr Pisey Pich Mr Inariddh VAR Mr Khleang Rim	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>NPC of CISP-MDGF, FAO</li> <li>PM of CISP-MDGF, UNDP</li> <li>NPC of CISP-MDGF, UNESCO</li> <li>NPC of CISP-MDGF, ILO</li> </ul>	CISP: Creative Industry Support Project PM: Programme Manager
17 January 2011 9.00 – 11.00	H.E Morm Vannak Sath Samuth H.E. Mao Sambath H.E. Lao Him  Mr Hou Vuthy Mr Heang Veasna Mr Hoeung Sophon  Mr Pen Noreakvuth  Mr Nguy Rith  Mr Houn Soeu  Mr Heng Saroeun  Mr Han Nopk <sup>o</sup> un Mr Ho Bunthon  Mr Chum Nimol	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary of State</li> <li>Undersecretary of State</li> <li>Undersecretary of State</li> <li>Director General of TVET</li> <li>Deputy Director General of Labour</li> <li>Director of Department of International Cooperation</li> <li>Director of Department of Market Labour Information</li> <li>Deputy Director of NSSF</li> <li>Deputy Director of International Cooperation Department</li> <li>Deputy Director of Department of Labour Dispute</li> <li>Chief of Office</li> <li>Deputy Chief of Office OSH</li> <li>Department of Labour Inspection</li> <li>Official of Department of Child Labour</li> </ul>	TVET: Technical Vocational Education and Training NSSF: National Social Security Fund OSH: Occupational Safety and Health
17 January 2011 12.30 – 13.30	Mr Tuomo Poutanen Ms Catherine Vaillancourt La Flamme Ms Nou Pheary	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>CTA of BFC, ILO</li> <li>Training Specialist, ILO</li> <li>National Programme Officer, Social Protection and Gender, ILO</li> </ul>	BFC: Better Factories Cambodia
17 January 2011 13.30 – 14.30	Ms Che Katz  Ms Mina Barling  Mr Chum Thou	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program Director, Marie Stopes International Cambodia</li> <li>Programming and Technical Consultant</li> <li>Director Grants</li> </ul>	
17 January 2011 15.00–17.00	Mr Van SOU IENG Mr Ken LOO Mr Som Chamnan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>President of CAMFEBA/GMAC</li> <li>Secretary General of GMAC</li> <li>Executive Manager of CAMFEBA</li> </ul>	CAMFEBA: Cambodian Federation of Employers & Business Associations GMAC: Garment Manufacturers Association in Cambodia
18 January 2011 9.00 – 12.00	Mr Nou Nim  Mr Chan Sokhom Cheta  Mr Hang Prakop	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director of Municipal Department of Labour and Vocational Training, Phnom Penh</li> <li>Director of the Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training from Siem Reap</li> <li>Deputy Director Provincial Department of Labour and Vocational Training-Banteay Meanchey</li> </ul>	
18 January 2011 9.00 – 10.00	H.E. Kem Gunawadh	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director General of TVK, Ministry of Information</li> </ul>	TVK: Television of Cambodia

Date of meeting	Persons met	Position/organization	Remarks
18 January 2011 14.00 – 15.00	H.E. Drlng Kantha Phavi Ms Chuth Leang Vanny	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Minister of Woman's Affairs</li> <li>Deputy Director General, Gender Equality and Economic Development of General Direction</li> </ul>	
18 January 2011 14.00 – 15.00	Mr Joel Conkle	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Nutrition Specialist of UNICEF</li> </ul>	
18 January 2011 15.30 – 17.00	H.E. Leng Vy Mr Am Veasna	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director General of DOLA</li> <li>Official of Association Management</li> </ul>	DOLA: Department of Local Administration
19 January 2011 8.30 – 10.00	H.E. Phork Sovanrith	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Secretary of State</li> </ul>	
19 January 2011 8.30 – 10.00	H.E. Chhay Than H.E. San Sy Than	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Senior Minister of Planning</li> <li>Director General, National Institute of Statistics</li> </ul>	
19 January 2011 10.00 – 11.00	H.E. Koet Chuoen	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>MOSAVY Adviser</li> </ul>	MOSAVY: Ministry of Social Affairs, Veterans and Youth
19 January 2011 10.30 – 12.00	Mr David John Welsh Mr Sok Lor Mr Siv Sothea	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Country Director of ACILS</li> <li>Executive Director of ACF</li> <li>NPC of BWI</li> </ul>	ACILS: American Center for International Labor Solidarity ACF: Arbitration Council Foundation
19 January 2011 14.00 – 17.00	Ms Meas Savry Ms Duy Sareth Mr Heang Sarim Mr Nhu Kamsanh Mr Tep Tim	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director of KWHA</li> <li>Director of PWHA</li> <li>Director of Can-Do</li> <li>Vice-President of HA</li> <li>Organizer of OPKC</li> </ul>	
20 January 2011 9.00 – 10.00	H.E. Ngy Ngy Chanphal H.E. Sann Vathana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2nd Vice-Chairman of CARD</li> <li>Deputy Secretary General of CARD</li> </ul>	CARD: Council of Agriculture and Rural Development
20 January 2011 9.00 – 10.00	Mr Sorn Seng Hok	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Director of Department of Legislation, MOEYS</li> </ul>	MOEYS: Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports
20 January 2011 9.30 – 10.30	Ms Elisa Sabbion Mr Ngo Natharoun	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Programme Analyst-Poverty Reduction Unit of UNDP</li> </ul>	
20 January 2011 11.00 – 12.00	Mr Naoko Arakawa	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>UNESCO</li> </ul>	

## ANNEX IV

### Progress towards outcomes

Outcome: KHM104 – Increased employment opportunities and employability of women and men, youth and people with disabilities particularly in the rural areas		
Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	3	<p>Includes the Monitoring and Assessing Progress on Decent Work in Developing Countries (MAP) initiative as well as the Inclusion for People with Disabilities (INCLUDE) project and initiatives under the Global Jobs Pact.</p> <p>Funding gaps have been an issue, causing the delay of some components (e.g. implementation of the Labour Force Survey, although funding has now been secured for this – see below).</p>
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	5	<p>Delivery of some outputs (national employment policy/strategy based on research and studies) were delayed, partly by the need to respond to the global economic crisis. Other outputs, however, were in general delivered according to plan, including the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Demonstration works to promote labour based public works techniques, paving the way for further ILO involvement under the NSPS in 2011.</li> <li>▪ Technical and financial support in the design, development and piloting of the Labour Force Survey with the National Institute of Statistics in 2009.</li> <li>▪ Cambodia Labour and Social Trends 2010 report developed by NIS and published in November 2010 through tripartite consultation and endorsement and with ILO financial and technical assistance.</li> <li>▪ MAP project help identify gaps in the national statistical system in terms of compiling decent work indicators and monitoring progress on decent work.</li> </ul>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	6	<p>Technical assistance and training (training of trainers on training and employment needs assessment, training of local contractors on labour-based maintenance) is being applied by partners and is highly valued by them. Technical advice provided has made an important contribution to the development of the NSPS, particularly the public works programme component and the conceptual framework of the social protection floor and social security staircase. ILO understanding of the Cambodian context was highlighted as a factor for success. The long partnership with ILO is clearly appreciated by those who have been involved, such as CARD informant who was previously with the MRD.</p> <p>Models/approaches developed in Cambodia have been taken up by other countries in the Asia-Pacific region.</p> <p>INCLUDE's work (as well as earlier ILO initiatives in relation to disabled people) is clearly highly appreciated by MOSAVY counterparts.</p>
Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners

<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Labour and Social Trends in Cambodia 2010 report completed, proving very important data on which to base policy and strategy on a wide range of issues.</li> <li>▪ Labour Force Survey (last done in 2001) will be conducted in 2011 by National Institute of Statistics (already piloted in December 2009).</li> <li>▪ Tracking study on garment workers implemented.</li> <li>▪ NSPS awaiting final approval.</li> <li>▪ NSPS includes labour-based methodologies (EIIP) was achieved.</li> <li>▪ Ministry of Rural Development and three provinces integrate Labour-Based Infrastructure Development and Employment Intensive Investment Programme (EIIP) tools, approaches and methodologies into infrastructure development policies, strategies, development projects. MRD mainstreamed (in theory) EIIP, while tools and approaches are being applied in Banteay Meanchey, Battambang and Pailin provinces.</li> <li>▪ 100,000 work days through routine maintenance of 600 kilometres of roads in three provinces; 600 km of rural roads developed and maintained through LBT/EIIP methodologies. 608 km of rural roads were improved/maintained; 108,711 workdays have been created.</li> <li>▪ The establishment of an inter-ministerial steering committee for the development of a National Employment Strategy was not yet achieved and is a contributory factor to the delay in developing the NES.</li> <li>▪ The INCLUDE project has made progress in facilitating the inclusion of disabled persons in other initiatives, notably related to entrepreneurship development (under WEDGE).</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>Data and research component was reoriented somewhat as a result of the global economic crisis, such as conducting a three-stage tracing study of garment factory workers, which has become part of a comprehensive, multi-level study on the garment industry performed in collaboration with other partners (including the World Bank). The ILO's Global Jobs Pact provided additional support for many initiatives in response to the global economic crisis, including induction and life skills training (10,000 workers reached; work ongoing towards target of 30,000).</p> <p>More support was requested for TVET for disabled people.</p> <p>Support to operationalize the employment quotas for disabled people laid out in the relevant law and policy is required.</p> <p>M&amp;E was highlighted as a key area requiring development with regard to the implementation of the NSPS.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	22	
<b>Average score</b>	4.4	

**Outcome: KHM105 – Skills development improves the employability of women and men workers, youth and people with disabilities in the rural areas of Cambodia**

Performance area	Rating
A. Resource adequacy	3
B. Delivery of outputs	4
C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups	4
D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)	4
E. Emerging risks and opportunities	4
Total score	19
Average score	3.8

**Outcome: KHM 106 – Sustainable enterprises that create productive, equitable and decent work for women and men**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	2	Even including technical cooperation projects (Women's Entrepreneurship Development and Gender Equity (WEDGE), Creative Industries Support Project (CISP) and the Microfinance for Decent Work research initiative), resources are extremely limited.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	<p>KHM 106 component concerning governance and local economic development has seen slow delivery of some outputs, largely because this component is linked with the Government's Decentralization and Deconcentration programme, which involves numerous actors.</p> <p>ILO provided support to the training of officials of the MIME on entrepreneurship and gender in four provinces. Following technical recommendations from the ILO, the MIME has now categorized entrepreneurship trainees by specific criteria (including gender) in order to respond better to their needs.</p> <p>WEDGE developed training infrastructure on GET Ahead for Women in Enterprise" and "Business Group Formation and trained more than 40 lead trainers. WEDGE also adapted and introduced the ILO training materials on Managing Small Business Associations. With CAMFEBA and GIZ the project delivered TOT courses for more than 60 managers and staff (60 per cent women) from 35 business associations.</p> <p>Follow-up technical support was provided to three local business associations. WEDGE also developed training materials on financial education and guidelines on the creation of self-help groups. These materials were used to train more than 3,000 families of working children in cooperation with IPEC TBP (first phase).</p> <p>The quality of ILO technical assistance is regarded as very good in terms of expertise and tools.</p>



Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	4	<p>The 40 lead trainers trained by WEDGE mentioned above have trained more than 6,000 micro-entrepreneurs (80 per cent women), including 78 instructors from MOLVT Provincial Training Centres (TVET). Many of the above-mentioned materials developed by the WEDGE project were adopted by around 30 NGOs – including CARE and Plan International – thus magnifying their impact considerably. Some of the WEDGE materials developed in the Cambodian context are being adapted for use in other countries, such as Lao PDR and Viet Nam. All three of the above-mentioned associations that received technical support have reportedly grown in membership and have increased their sales, profits and number of trading partners considerably in the past two years.</p> <p>UN partners in CISP were positive about the ILO technical inputs but admitted that coordination across agencies had been a problem. They thought that important lessons had been learned concerning inter-agency collaboration.</p>
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>24 partner organizations (including government) to incorporate ILO tools for enterprise development and microfinance. WEDGE supported around ten NGOs to use business group formation training materials and trained over 40 trainers who in turn trained over 6,000 micro-entrepreneurs (80 per cent women) using GET Ahead methodology (including 78 instructors from MOLVT provincial TVET centres).</li> <li>7,500 women workers who have lost their jobs as a result of the crisis initiate their enterprises with ILO support. This target was not reached. In 2010, WEDGE had planned to provide direct assistance to 2,000 women in collaboration with Better Factories Cambodia. MOLVT may also have reached more women through WEDGE TOTs (in October–December 2009) for their PTC instructors on how to use WEDGE GET Ahead basic business skills training materials.</li> </ul> <p>The DWCP does not include outcome indicators specifically related to KHM 106 activities concerning governance and local economic development. These activities are linked with the Government's Decentralization and Deconcentration programme, which represents – at least in theory – an opportunity for local communities to strengthen their representation and participation and also offers the potential of devolving functions and budgets to local levels to increase quality, efficiency and effectiveness in social service delivery to the rural poor. The reforms also have the potential to enable local economic development planning, thus reducing socio-economic disparities between regions. Progress on the ILO local economic development element has been slow.</p> <p>Microfinance for Decent Work in Asia-Pacific is a research initiative aiming to reduce over-indebtedness and multiple borrowing (often exacerbated by the global economic crisis) that is working with two Cambodian microfinance institutions. Depending on the impact of the pilots, the microfinance initiative may be scaled up in the future.</p>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>Links with small business associations appeared to be limited, though the costs of joining may outweigh the benefits for very small entrepreneurs and the number of small business associations in rural Cambodia that serve rural micro-entrepreneurs is extremely limited. The MIME requested that ILO continue providing support to training on participatory gender audits and to prepare women from small and medium enterprises to access funds from micro finance institutions.</p> <p>Having the INCLUDE project has meant that managers and specialists in other projects / fields have a resource person to approach for advice on how to facilitate disabled persons' participation in their projects.</p> <p>Microfinance work is being adopted by many other organizations as well as the Cambodian Microfinance Association.</p> <p>The global economic crisis helped actors realize the potential of meeting local demand with domestically produced goods (rather than imports) and of alternative models to that of export-led development.</p> <p>In collaboration with FAO, the ILO delivered quality technical assistance for its component under the Creative Industries Support Programme (CISP), reportedly resulting in increased decision-making power of women entrepreneurs in the targeted communities concerning the production and sale of cultural products. The technical assistance included study tours to observe local markets and share market information; training on small business management, financial literacy trainings and training in an exporting company. There is, however, a general feeling that follow-up activities will be needed to ensure sustainability of outcomes. A more fundamental issue is how to connect direct intervention at the commune or village level with broader local economic development while still paying due attention to the cultures and needs of the implementing partners (balancing the aims of cultural preservation and commercialization).</p>
<b>Total score</b>	18	
<b>Average score</b>	3.6	

**Outcome: KHM 156 – Strengthened tripartism and labour market governance contribute to effective social dialogue and sound industrial relations**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	3	There are some resource gaps because the Labour Dispute Resolution Project (LDRP) is nearing its end. However, the project was efficient and secured significant achievements with a modest budget.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	LDRP effectively delivered planned outputs, including significant amounts of training and other forms of capacity building. Constraints included: a lack of understanding among all parties on the topic of collective bargaining; a large number of unions, many of which are not very representative and some of which refuse to engage in collective bargaining; weak rule of law in general.
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	4	<p>Two major constraints were encountered: i) the national elections in July 2008 and the creation of a new government, which meant that work with the Government naturally slowed for one month prior to the elections and around two months afterwards; and ii) the global economic crisis, which also began to take effect from the second half of the year 2008, had an important impact on the main drivers of the Cambodian economy – garments, tourism and construction/real estate.</p> <p>While the project was able to continue to implement its workplan, the crisis caused employers, unions and the Government to some degree to re-order their priorities. The project tried to support some of these new priorities within the parameters of its mandate.</p> <p>The Arbitration Council benefitted from the capacity building for arbitrators and will continue using the tools/manuals developed with World Bank resources.</p>
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Arbitration Council sustained as an independent, credible and effective dispute resolution body, dealing with an increased number of cases. The World Bank is funding the Arbitration Council until 2013, beyond which its sustainability is uncertain. However, it is valued by all constituents, which should favour its continuation. The Arbitration Council has resolved nearly 70 per cent of the collective disputes it has received.</li> <li>Number of collective bargaining agreements (CBAs) increased by at least ten. Not only achieved, but as of September 2009, the number of registered CBAs had reached 107, compared with a total of just 86 registered up to 2008 (though these CBAs are of variable quality). As the result of ILO efforts to provide collective bargaining training to most representative status unions as well as to employers, by the end of October 2010, there were around 30 high-quality, comprehensive CBAs.</li> </ul> <p>With the notable exception of the disputes over the setting of the minimum wage in 2010, industrial relations have in general been improving in the garment sector.</p>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>A major achievement in 2010 that was not envisaged in the DWCP was a garment industry-wide agreement around collective bargaining (including binding arbitration) between workers and employers. This was partly a result of a high-level ILO delegation that brokered the agreement.</p> <p>Both CAMFEBA and six trade union confederations acknowledged the significant contribution made by the ILO to improved industrial relations. However, both thought that in some instances the ILO had not been a neutral party but had favoured the other side. CAMFEBA thought that the MOLVT is too dependent on ILO for support and hence cannot be an authoritative party during industrial relations disputes.</p> <p>CAMFEBA also thought that the ILO should, when appropriate, abandon its policy of neutrality in terms of public comments and make pronouncements upon industrial disputes, based on the relevant legal provisions.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	20	
<b>Average score</b>	4	
<b>Outcome: KHM 157 – Government and social partners adopt and implement policies to improve and protect the rights of children</b>		
Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	5	This outcome comes under the ILO's International Programme to Eliminate Child Labour (IPEC) and includes the Cambodia Support Project to the National Plan of Action against the Worst Forms of Child Labour – Phase II.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	5	Delivery was generally smooth, though there was a half-year gap between the first and second phases, and there were delays in the start-up of some activities. Links with WEDGE and Workers' Education Project produced synergies (WEDGE's approaches were applied to a larger number of participants).
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	5	Uptake of outputs was good. In addition to constituents, IPEC worked with a network of civil society organizations active on relevant issues. The Government committed to continuing the child labour monitoring, though some informants expressed concerns that the monitoring system may be too project specific.
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	6	<p>Targets in DWCP were exceeded in several respects:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ National Plan of Action on Child Labour adopted and implemented. This was achieved in 2008, with the Prime Minister's approval providing high-level backing. The Government also committed to the ILO global target of eliminating the worst forms of child labour by 2016.</li> <li>▪ Seven provinces incorporate elimination of child labour into their plan of action and implement programmes to prevent child labour and withdraw children from exploitative work. This was exceeded in that at least 11 provinces have implemented programmes.</li> <li>▪ Incidence of child labour reduced to 10.6 per cent nationally (in accordance with targets of the National Strategic Development Plan 2006–2010). This progress is difficult to assess because no child labour survey has been conducted since 2001. However, the ILO will be involved in a joint child labour/labour force survey in 2011. The aim for 2015 is to reduce the incidence of child labour to 8 per cent.</li> </ul>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>The ILO participated (with other UN agencies and other actors) in initiatives to respond to the global food price rises and the global economic crisis. The ILO engaged with the Ministry of Education and the Sector Working Group for Education for All (EFA) in advocating for the need to address child labour issues if EFA goals are to be achieved. ILO also worked with partners to ensure that the issue of child labour was explicitly addressed in the National Social Protection Strategy. The ILO worked with UNICEF and the World Bank to produce two Understanding Children's Workreports, which provided valuable data and a platform for action.</p> <p>One informant thought that the child labour monitoring systems developed could be more strategic and risk being unsustainable; they should be linked with existing large scale systems, such as that developed by the Government with GIZ.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	25	
<b>Average score</b>	5	
<b>Outcome: KHM 158 – Government and social partners adopt and implement non-discrimination policies to improve and protect the rights of women, domestics workers and indigenous peoples</b>		
Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	4	<p>The outcome includes the former ILO-Japan Expansion of Employment Opportunities for Women (EEOW) project (which ended in mid-2008), the ILO-RBSA project on Decent Work, Gender Equality and Safe Migration (2009–2010) and the WEDGE and Support to Indigenous Peoples (ITP) projects; resources were adequate to meet targets.</p>
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	<p>Regarding outputs, the EEOW and WEDGE projects collaborated with a number of other ILO initiatives, including IPEC, CISP, the Better Factories Cambodia Social Protection and Gender Project and INCLUDE. The EEOW project focused on alleviating poverty and promoting gender equality in the world of work by replicating good practices in gender mainstreaming policies and programmes, participatory approaches and economic empowerment of women, in one municipality and 16 provinces in Cambodia. The RBSA project supported advocacy, consultations, capacity building and research to promote awareness about domestic work and to promote dialogue on the rights and need for protection of domestic workers.</p> <p>The ITP experienced some delays with regard to facilitating communities' access to communal land title as a result of the actions of an individual government official. The donor (DANIDA) was informed and discussed the matter with the Government, following which the official was assigned other duties and the delays ceased.</p> <p>Ministry of Interior (an ITP partner) said they were pleased with level of partnership, having been involved in the design process.</p>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	3	<p>WEDGE has been working with various clusters within the MOLVT. The vocational training and child labour clusters have received a substantial amount of support and can apply gender analysis tools (for example) in their work, but ILO thinks that the clusters concerned with the labour law, dispute resolution and social security require more capacity building with regard to gender issues (including gender analysis).</p>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<p>With regard to the DWCP indicators:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Indicator concerning initiatives undertaken by concerned agencies vis-à-vis legislative and policy to support indigenous people's entitlement to land ownership: target was ten initiatives/registrations. The indicator is not very precisely drafted, but the ILO succeeded in working with donors, the Government and NGO partners to facilitate the communal land titling process.</li> <li>Numbers of indigenous communities have obtained deeds to land. The target was three communities with land titles. At the time of the review, 20 communities had been recognized as legal entities and 35 had been formally identified as indigenous communities by the Ministry of Rural Development (a necessary prerequisite for recognition as a legal entity and subsequent application for communal title to land). Three communities had actually received communal title to land.</li> <li>Initiatives undertaken by concerned agencies to mainstream gender in their policies and programme and carry out gender-specific action. The target was five initiatives; to date, 15 of the 24 main ministries have a Gender Mainstreaming and Action Plan, though it is unclear to what extent this is directly attributable to ILO initiatives and/or broader advocacy. WEDGE and EOW directly supported the MOLVT and MIME to formulate, implement and review their Gender Mainstreaming Action Plans. WEDGE supported the implementation of Participatory Gender Audits in the Siem Reap provincial MIME office and the MOLVT National Technical Training Institute. WEDGE also worked with CAMFEBA to mainstream gender equality in its activities, in particular its youth employment project.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	3	<p>An international study with regard to standard setting in relation to domestic workers included national consultations in Cambodia and investigated issues identified by the IPEC project.</p> <p>At a workshop on Indigenous Peoples and Traditional Occupations in Siem Reap in 2010, the need to ratify Convention No. 169 on indigenous and tribal peoples was discussed and the MRD agreed to study the issue (with ILO support).</p> <p>One informant (a partner) thought that the ILO promotes ownership of initiatives less than other UN agencies and tends to present pre-prepared "packages" for adoption (with little adaptation to the local context). Closer partnership is required in the view of this informant. Consultants who are not gender specialists but specialize in other areas are often not very gender sensitive/responsive, in this informant's view.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	18	
<b>Average score</b>	3.6	

**Outcome: KHM 159 – Government and social partners develop and implement policies to manage migration, protect migrant workers, and combat human trafficking in line with ILO Principles**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	5	The outcome includes the recently-initiated Tripartite Action to Protect Migrants Within and From the GMS from Labour Exploitation (TRIANGLE), a successor in some ways to the long-running TICW project but with a broader focus (including men as well as children and women). Also includes the (recently completed) Management of Cross-Border Movement of Labour in SEA project, which helped to provide a basis for TRIANGLE, particularly in terms of policy development.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	<p>The second phase of the subregional TICW project ended in October 2008 and is thus relevant to the DWCP 2008–2010. TICW Phase 2 focused on reducing the vulnerability of migrants to human trafficking and advocating greater protection through the expansion of legal channels, better supervision of recruitment and informal workplaces, scrutiny of informal workplaces and improving migrants' access to legal and social services. A significant achievement of TICW was raising stakeholders' understanding of trafficking within the broader context of labour migration rather than solely as a phenomenon linked to sexual exploitation. In Cambodia, TICW initiatives included: the child-safe tourism campaign, various initiatives involving collaboration with media, participation in the COMMIT National Task Force to counter human trafficking and support to the National Plan of Action, support to bilateral employment cooperation MOUs, plus a range of research studies.</p> <p>The Policy on Labour Migration for Cambodia was promulgated in June 2010, (following extensive ILO support), and includes an action plan. This was a major achievement under the Cross-Border Movement of Labour project. Other outputs under this project included: expansion of the knowledge base through research and information sharing; capacity building for constituents and other partners (including civil society organizations); promoting the effective use of remittances and entrepreneurship development in migrants' home communities.</p>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	5	The Policy on Labour Migration will provide a foundation for the Government's approach to labour migration in the years to come. Many of the TICW outputs built significant government and other stakeholder capacity that is being applied by the individuals and organizations across a variety of sectors. MOLVT is very satisfied with the support provided by ILO on the issue of migration.
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<p>DWCP indicator:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>20 percent increase in regular migration, compared with 2007 figures. Regular migration channels were significantly expanded (from a low base) in 2008/2009, so even though reliable data are unavailable, it is likely that this target was achieved.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	3	<p>The cross-border project output concerning the promotion of the effective use of remittances and the development of entrepreneurship development in migrants' home communities achieved less than was originally envisaged, though the precise reasons for this were not identified by the review. Limited funds may have been one reason.</p> <p>According to one informant, ongoing political tensions between Cambodia and Thailand have not had a significant impact on the activities of labour recruitment agencies.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	21	
<b>Average score</b>	4.2	



**Outcome: KHM 160 – Improved rule of law, more effective labour law and labour market institutions and practices that comply with international labour standards**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	3	The project To Assist the Competitiveness of the Cambodian Garment Sector through Improvements to Cambodian labour law and industrial relations is the main project under this outcome. The outcome is under-resourced. The work being performed tends to be very intensive in terms of human resource requirements.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	5	The ILO provided significant support in the preparation of the new trade unionlaw, in the form of consultancy inputs, consultation with constituents, drafting and reviewing.
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	4	<p>ILO support was important to all constituents in the trade unionlaw drafting process, and the ILO advocated strongly to ensure that all social partners are fully engaged in the consultation process.</p> <p>MOLVT appreciates the expertise provided by ILO. However, the MOLVT noted that materials provided were sometimes in a format or style of language too difficult for officials to understand.</p> <p>CAMFEBA thought that the Government relied rather heavily on the ILO in the drafting of labour legislation and its interpretation. CAMFEBA stressed that it is important that ILO does not “take over the job of the Government”.</p>
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	5	<p>DWCP target:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Labour Law amended in one area and amendments under discussion or consultation in two other areas was achieved. The new trade union law (drafted with considerable support from ILO) will be the topic of a final tripartite consultation workshop in January 2011, following which it is expected that the final version of the trade union law will be sent to the ILO for informal opinion as requested by the ILO Committee on the Application of Standards. The law will then be sent to the Council of Ministers once comments are received from the ILO (end of March 2011).</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>In April 2008, the Prime Minister agreed with a request from the Eighth Working Group (on Industrial Relations) of the Government-Private Sector Forum for the new trade unionlaw to be developed. Trade unions participate in this body but not on an equal basis with employers. Some informants remarked that this raises possible doubts as to the extent to which it reflects a tripartite approach. Some informants noted that there is a risk that ILO sometimes overestimates its capacity to effect changes in laws (via advocacy and technical assistance to government), a difficult and time-consuming process.</p> <p>Differences in the attitude of government ministries have become apparent. For example, one informant reported that MOWA has been pushing for the introduction of gender discrimination amendments into the labour law, but the MOLVT has not yet taken action. Cambodia is now lagging behind in this respect, and a gender discrimination law should be a priority area for future action.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	21	
<b>Average score</b>	4.2	

**Outcome: KHM 161 – Working conditions and competitiveness in the garment sector is improved through compliance with international labour standards and the national labour law as well as through promotion of decent work**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	6	<p>This outcome encompasses a wide range of technical cooperation initiatives, including: the flagship Better Factories Cambodia programme (including GMAC, trade unions, the Government and NZAID contributions); Socially Responsible Production in the Garment Industry; Trade Facilitation and Competitiveness Project; Addressing the Economic Crisis in the Garment Industry, ILO-UNDP Tracking and Confidence; Improving Cambodian Garment Workers' Access to Health and Social Protection Services, Their Pre- and Post-Garment Life Skills and Economic Opportunities; Joint Programme for Children, Food Security and Nutrition in Cambodia.</p>
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	5	<p>Ongoing monitoring of compliance with standards continues, and a new information management system was introduced that enables factories to grant third-party access (for buyers) to compliance reports available via the Internet.</p> <p>The three-stage tracking study on the impacts of the global economic crisis was completed and became part of a larger, multi-level study involving other organizations/donors. In late 2010, this support was extended to include innovative pilots to promote improved productivity and energy efficiency in the factories during the recovery. The long-term aim of this is to help the industry transition to a more sustainable and environmentally efficient growth model for the future. Better Factories Cambodia is also training workers and employers on socially responsible transitions.</p> <p>Better Factories Cambodia devised and organized a series of trainings for workers on induction to the garment industry and life skills for garment workers.</p> <p>As part of its shift to a post-crisis phase, in December 2010 Better Factories Cambodia conducted a national Productivity Dialogue with actors from the garment industry, to discuss ways to address one of the critical challenges in the post-crisis era: labour productivity. The major focus was on how to raise the two components of labour productivity: (a) the capacity to work (through skills training and new production technology) and (b) the will to work (through improved management styles, channels for communication and dispute resolution mechanisms). Productivity was raised for discussion frequently by the project prior to the global economic crisis, but the impacts of the global economic crisis helped provide momentum.</p>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	5	<p>The Better Factories Cambodia programme's independent monitoring and reporting on labour standards, coupled with a broad portfolio of management and training services, were critical to the development of the garment industry – Cambodia's most important industry.</p> <p>Recently, the research into the global economic crisis's impacts has enabled constituents and other stakeholders to better understand the impacts at the industry, enterprise and worker levels and has provided information for policy-makers in a variety of areas, including industrial relations, employment policy and social protection.</p>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<p>Indicators in the DWCP:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Local tripartite institution(s) takes over monitoring role of Better Factories Cambodia programme and well-functioning institution established with buyers representing over 50 per cent of the export volume using its services.</li> </ul> <p>This has not been achieved yet. Reasons offered by informants included:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>i) The Government (and employers) are concerned about buyers' responses if monitoring was transferred to a local institution.</li> <li>ii) There is still some debate within the ILO about the proposed global Better Work initiative, under which Better Factories Cambodia would exist as a kind of franchise that would have to make payments to the ILO.</li> <li>iii) Some informants think that the IFC and the ILO are not prepared at the moment to advocate sufficiently strongly to the Government for the localization of monitoring.</li> <li>iv) The impact of the global economic crisis delayed the process.</li> </ul> <p>The handover issue will involve a very sensitive decision, to be taken at senior or prime minister level (according to the MOC).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Working conditions in Cambodian factories are improved through monitoring and documenting compliance with the national labour law and international standards through remedial training. Target: Average compliance levels recorded by summary synthesis reports in 2007 are maintained or improved. Better Factories Cambodia programme representatives confirmed that this target has been met, although some fundamental rights issues remain.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>Better Factories Cambodia recently started partnering with Marie Stopes International (MSI), facilitating access for the latter to run women's health activities in factory infirmaries. This enables MSI to access a very vulnerable population, and MSI aims to develop a toolkit that could allow the approach to be scaled up in the future. Enterprise-based unions are not involved in the implementation of the activities, though this is an approach that could be explored in future.</p> <p>A small number of union informants thought that the Better Factories Cambodia programme tends to benefit employers and government rather than unions. Conversely, CAMFEBA and GMAC strongly thought that ILO current approach tends to favour unions, suggested that this may possibly alienate employers from cooperating with ILO in the future and that past capacity building of unions had contributed significantly to their perceived current militancy. These employers' organizations thought that the monitoring associated with the Better Factories Cambodia programme should also extend to the unions and not be limited to the employers, and they raised this as one constraint to the proposed shift of Better Factories Cambodia monitoring functions to a local tripartite institution.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	24	
<b>Average score</b>	4.8	

**Outcome: KHM 176 – Increased social protection coverage for working women and men in formal and informal sectors**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	3	This outcome includes the European Union-funded Improving Social Protection and Promoting Employment project and the Improving Cambodian Garment Workers' Access to Health and Social Protection Services, their Pre- and Post-Garment Life Skills and Economic Opportunities project. However, resources are lacking for some current activities, notably those in support of new schemes under NSSF and NSSF-C and those aiming to improve the MIS of NSSF.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	The need to consult with multiple actors due to the nature of the issues is a challenge for implementation, requiring time and coordination. Technical assistance, a tripartite workshop and fellowship training on EIIP were delivered to tripartite constituents to COMWEL (Korea Worker's Compensation and Welfare Service) under the ILO-Korea partnership programme.
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	5	Uptake of outputs was high, with ILO support assisting significantly in the development of the National Social Protection Strategy in particular.
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<p>Targets contained in the DWCP are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 50 per cent of formal sector women and men workers in Phnom Penh working for enterprises with more than 10 workers covered by employment injury insurance scheme. There are problems with the data required for this indicator, but progress is reportedly being made.</li> <li>▪ One decree, regulation and implementation plan drafted for new benefits and wider coverage, for example, on wider geographical coverage of employment injury insurance and on health insurance for formal sector workers. In terms of progress, a feasibility study is currently being conducted into health insurance options. In 2008, the Government started the implementation of an employment injury insurance scheme for workers in the private sector.</li> <li>▪ One policy option paper on social safety nets and social insurance benefits developed. Achieved.</li> <li>▪ The first OSH master plan implemented in cooperation with workers and employers by the end of 2010. This plan is currently being implemented, and the ILO is providing support, especially capacity-building.</li> <li>▪ 100 women and men workers in informal economy workplaces trained by Work Improvement for Safe Home (WISH) and related programmes by the end of 2010. More than 200 workers were trained under WISH, with others being trained under Work Improvement in Small Construction Sites (WISCON) programmes.</li> </ul>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>In response to the economic crisis, the development of a coherent social protection strategy for the poor and the vulnerable became a high priority of the Government. A national forum on social safety nets was organized in July 2009 by the Council for Agricultural and Rural Development (CARD) supported by the World Bank in collaboration with a range of agencies and donors, including the ILO. MOSAVY (which oversees a number of social safety net programmes as well as social insurance benefits for civil servants and informal sector workers) formally requested the ILO in July 2009 to provide a wide range of technical assistance, while MOLVT (through NSSF) requested the ILO to provide IT-related assistance on employment injury insurance. A National Social Protection Strategy for the Poor and Vulnerable was finalized in April 2010 and is awaiting promulgation.</p> <p>Some informants thought that because social protection involves a wide range of issues and stakeholders, there is a need for an ILO social protection specialist to be based in Cambodia.</p> <p>Abortion and malnutrition are two health issues affecting the productivity of Cambodian workers. UNICEF suggested that the ILO should consider these issues if it expands its work related to productivity, as is planned under KHM 161 (Better Factories Cambodia). However, there are questions as to whether ILO's comparative advantage lies in such areas. Working with partners may be a solution, as is the case with the ongoing initiative with the Marie Stopes International under Better Factories Cambodia.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	20	
<b>Average score</b>	4	

**Outcome: KHM 177 – Capacities enhanced, policies developed and committees established to reduce HIV vulnerabilities of women and men**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	4	Included under this outcome is the Integrating HIV/AIDS into Garment Factory Occupational Safety and Health Committees: Working Sensitization project. Funding from UNAIDS/PAF was important in enabling the ILO to meet its targets.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	Outputs were delivered in line with plans. Different groups of workers (hotel versus garment workers) require different approaches regarding training/awareness raising because they often have very different levels of education and life experience.
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	4	Guidelines on HIV/AIDS in the workplace are being applied. However, some informants suggested that they were based on the needs of the public sector more than the private sector and hence were less relevant to private sector enterprises. Some employers reportedly established workplace HIV/AIDS committees only to comply with the law, rather than through any real motivation towards addressing the issue. Real participation by workers is often constrained, for example, because workers have little time to prepare for meetings and have low levels of education.
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	Targets in the DWCP are as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ 30 factories provided with in-depth technical assistance to integrate HIV issues into their work plans and to establish HIV/AIDS committees by end of 2010. Achieved, though the precise number of factories assisted could not be ascertained.</li> <li>▪ An operational guideline on HIV/AIDS in OSH and the workplace developed and applied by first half of 2010. Achieved.</li> <li>▪ 250 enterprises sensitized on key principles of the ILO Code of Practice on HIV/AIDS and the World of Work in furtherance of Prakas No. 086. Achieved, though the precise number of factories assisted could not be ascertained.</li> <li>▪ HIV vulnerabilities of female entertainment sector workers are being addressed by the tripartite members in their workplace programming. The outcome's focus was originally on garment workers, rather than more at-risk entertainment sector workers. However, as noted, the programme shifted its focus to entertainment workers and is collaborating with the Workers' Education Programme to support the integration of beer promotion workers into trade unions.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	The ILO took steps to address the recent shifts in the National Strategy on HIV/AIDS by changing its own focus to one of improving the living and working conditions of sex workers through such activities as integrating entertainment workers into trade unions and partnering with the Michael Kirby Centre to develop a legal aid centre for sex workers.  Some organizations (CBCA) that are employer-funded reported reductions in funding as a result of the global economic crisis and that funding levels have still not recovered. Other organizations (RHAC) that are donor-funded have been less affected.
<b>Total score</b>	20	
<b>Average score</b>	4	

**Outcome: KHM801 – Strengthened institutional capacity of employers' organizations**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	3	No technical cooperation funding was received for this outcome. Significant progress was made with limited resources.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	<p>In 2009, ACTEMP brought a trade union law specialist from South Africa to build the capacity of CAMFEBA to evaluate both opportunities and threats presented by the trade union law development.</p> <p>A two-day workshop was organized with the participation of the Singapore Employers' Federation for training CAMFEBA members on researching members' opinions on future directions. SPSS software was purchased, CAMFEBA members were trained and then supported in conducting a members' survey and analysing the results.</p> <p>Workshops on collective bargaining were conducted with CAMFEBA members; local training capacity was built and a guidebook adapted to the local context developed. A NSSF guidebook and IEC materials were developed.</p>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	5	One informant suggested that CAMFEBA is probably the most active such organization in the Asia-Pacific region. Uptake of outputs has been satisfactory; for example, support provided by ILO in 2010 resulted in the development of a new CAMFEBA strategic plan that takes into account the organization's rapid growth; support from ILO resulted in a 75 page submission from CAMFEBA as a contribution to the consultation process over the trade union law.
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	5	<p>DWCP indicator is:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Capacity of employers' organizations to serve constituents is improved through better management and democratic practices. Although very broad, the review team considers (in light of the cited achievements) that this indicator was achieved.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	3	While recognizing ILO's contribution in terms of building the capacity of employers' organizations and helping to improve industrial relations, CAMFEBA and GMAC both thought that they had not been consulted sufficiently in the development of the DWCP.
<b>Total score</b>	20	
<b>Average score</b>	4	



**Outcome: KHM802– Strengthened institutional capacity of workers' organizations**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	2	This outcome originally included funding from the Norwegian Government for the Workers' Education Assistance Project. However, the funding was cut in 2010 for reasons external to the WEP project, which forced the ILO to suspend most activities while alternative support was sought (under the Global Jobs Pact).
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	<p>Significant support was given to trade unions regarding law and policy drafting processes (see below). Over 2,000 workers gained awareness of and were trained on the positive roles and functions of trade unions and the importance of sound industrial relations. Some 400 trade union leaders were trained on effective union management and 30 Women's Committees were established at the local and national union levels. Supported by the Global Jobs Pact, efforts are ongoing to begin organizing informal economy workers. A book on a new model of trade union development was translated and is being discussed with trade union representatives.</p> <p>The quality of technical support provided by the ILO is high, with union informants highlighting ILO work in raising workers' awareness of their rights (notably freedom of association) as particularly important.</p>
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners and target groups</b>	5	<p>With ILO support, a trade union position paper was prepared as part of the consultative process over the new trade union law; the quality of the draft was significantly improved from a trade union perspective. Final tripartite consultations were due to take place in January 2011. Work under this outcome also facilitated union participation under other outcomes/projects, such as IPEC.</p> <p>In coordination with KHM 156, a garment industry-wide agreement around collective bargaining (including binding arbitration) between workers and employers was reached. This was partly a result of a high-level ILO delegation that brokered the agreement. Also in coordination with KHM 156, a significant increase in the number of collective bargaining agreements was realized: as of September 2009, the number of registered collective bargaining agreements reached 107 compared with a total of 86 registered up to 2008 (although these agreements are of variable quality). As the result of ILO efforts to provide collective bargaining training to most representative status unions as well as to employers by the end of October 2010, there were around 30 high-quality, comprehensive collective bargaining agreements.</p> <p>Raised awareness of their rights has, in the view of union representatives, given workers more confidence in unions and encouraged workers to become members.</p> <p>ILO capacity-building was also praised by trade union representatives. A number of representatives noted how they had started out some years ago as ordinary workers but as a result of ILO capacity-building had become union leaders and, in some cases, trainers. The quality of ILO IEC materials received universal positive reviews.</p>

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	4	<p>DWCP indicator: Capacity of trade unions to serve constituents is improved through better management and democratic practices.</p> <p>Targets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Progress towards a joint council of trade unions. A trade union coordination mechanism was set up.</li> <li>▪ 1,000 new union members in construction, entertainment and financial and banking sectors. Work towards this target is ongoing; in the entertainment industry, around 200 workers have been organized to date (in partnership with APHEDA). Reportedly, there are not yet any trade unions in the financial and banking sectors.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	4	<p>The diversity (over 40 national union federations) and relative youth of the trade union movement presents a challenge in terms of coordination. The affiliation of many unions to specific political parties is a source of further constraints. Lack of awareness of the role and importance of trade unions on the part of a significant number of employers and government officials presents an additional challenge, as does the weak rule of law in general.</p> <p>Some informants suggested that there should be more consultation with unions prior to the start-up at the project level.</p>
<b>Total score</b>	19	
<b>Average score</b>	3.8	

**Outcome: KHM 826 – Strengthened capacity of member states to ratify and apply international labour standards and to fulfil their reporting obligations**

Performance area	Rating	Comments by ILO / tripartite constituents / partners
<b>A. Resource adequacy</b>	4	There is no technical cooperation funding for this outcome in Cambodia, but resource requirements were relatively light due to the nature of the work involved.
<b>B. Delivery of outputs</b>	4	The Labour Dispute Resolution Project (under KHM 156) and the Better Factories Cambodia programme (under KHM 161) have assisted KHM 826 in that they helped to raise issues related to the labour law and standards.
<b>C. Use of outputs by partners/ target groups</b>	4	
<b>D. Progress made (against related DWCP 2008–2010 outcome indicators)</b>	2	<p>There are four targets laid out in the DWCP:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ All reports on ratified Conventions due by 1 September 2010 submitted to the ILO. ILO estimated that around 50 per cent of the Government's obligations were met by the end of 2010 (though there is a chance that the remaining obligations will be met by the end of the current biennium in December 2011).</li> <li>▪ 80 ILO Conventions and Recommendations translated and submitted to the National Assembly by 1 September 2010. Translation was completed, but the MOLVT has yet to propose to the Council of Ministers that the instruments be submitted to the National Assembly.</li> <li>▪ One case of progress or interest noted by the Committee of Experts.</li> <li>▪ Ratification process initiated for one convention, in this case the Tripartite Consultation (International Labour Standards) Convention, 1976 (No. 144). Convention No. 144 has not yet been ratified but work to improve its ratification prospects has been included in the terms of reference drawn up for the planned Steering Committee on Decent Work.</li> </ul>
<b>E. Emerging risks and opportunities</b>	3	Some informants thought that Better Factories Cambodia should continue in its present form for some time to come, given the limited local capacity in relevant areas. Other informants suggested that a more intense focus on tightening labour inspection would be more appropriate, which should lead to the ratification of Convention No. 81 (labour inspection) and Convention No. 144.
<b>Total score</b>	17	
<b>Average score</b>	3.4	

# ANNEX V

## Plenary feedback on the preliminary findings during the DWCP review workshop

### Sophorn Tun

Slide 10: alignment should be to UNDAF 2006–2010 and not to UNDAF 2011–2015

The country programme review of November 2007 indicated that the priorities should remain the same, informing the selection of the current DWCP.

The DWCP was ready to be signed in 2008 but due to the global economic crisis, the signing was delayed in order to respond to the impact of the crisis.

Implementing the DWCP with the constituents was done prior to the signing of the document.

In terms of advocacy and the 90th anniversary of the ILO, the theme was partnership between the ILO and Cambodia for social and economic development. The event covered the achievements and the work of the ILO since 1992, an example of the advocacy work to promote the DWCP.

### Union representative

No links or coordination between ILO projects, such as WEP, LDRP and Better Factories Cambodia. The ILO should provide information on its website on issues regarding abuse of workers' rights.

There should be a public relations officer who can deal with the issues relating to labour and employment issues to avoid having to go to different ILO project offices to raise issues.

### CARE

On why the score is low for section 2 on tripartite participation and partnership and the same low score for section 6: If there was not much sharing, the implementers will also get higher score. The low-scores on criteria are not due to faults of the partners. In fact, for criteria 2, the main reason is more of the CO-Bangkok's lack of consultation with the constituents. The same applies for section 6; the low score results from an internal problem within the office regarding no communication strategy.

As an organization with vast knowledge, the CO-Bangkok should promote the successes of its work. The knowledge has been shared within project partners but not so much with a larger audience.

### CARD

Aware of the role of the ILO in the ILO Social Protection Strategy, recommendations should also include how the CO-Bangkok can get involved in implementing its technical advice and recommendations.

The question is how the ILO can assist government officials to use the information provided by the ILO. Relating to knowledge sharing section of the review, the ILO should work together with relevant government offices to promote the use of the knowledge.

There is a need for the ILO to promote the relevance and comparative advantage, making this criteria getting the score of 6.

Organizational arrangement within the ILO, such as the national capacity-building plan across the country. For example, does the ILO know the number of participants benefiting from its capacity development activities? Perhaps it also coming with common capacity building.

## **LMI**

With regard to the two low-rated criterion of the country programme review, the ILO needs to have better data to assess its DWCP. It is still not clear about the definition of decent work and its DWCP. The same was true of gender, in which most government officials at the beginning also understood very little about this matter. The ILO should provide informally about what has been done, formally or informally.

The concept of decent work was only introduced in 2007, and there is limited understanding in the country on the concept of decent work.

## **Dragan Radic**

The constituents should take the opportunity to get involved in the design of the next cycle of DWCP, particularly focusing on achieving results to promote productive and decent employment in the country. It is important that the constituents pay particular attention on what changes need to be made.

A weakness of the DWCP is that the current programme is simply an amalgamation of all ongoing projects in the country at the beginning of the DWCP design process in 2008.

## **MOWA**

In various projects, gender is a small component. Many projects do not really implement gender equality issues in the project activities. Not only should they mainstream gender but they really should put gender concerns into practice, such as involving female decision-makers in project implementation. In addition, the CO-Bangkok should also develop projects relating to domestic workers.

Clarifications on the tripartite involvement by Khun Suradee.

The consultation for the current DWCP began with the workshop presenting the findings and recommendations of the CPR, followed by individual consultations with the Government, employers' and workers' organizations.

(Notes taken by Oktavianto Pasaribu, Programme Analyst, ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific)

## ANNEX VI

### Suggested priority areas and themes or issues for the DWCP 2011–2015 from the review workshop

#### *Government group*

##### **Priority area 1: Industrial relations**

- Promote and improve compliance of labour legislation (labour law, trade union law, *prakas*)
- Adopt and implement the trade union law
- Strengthen the dispute resolution mechanism
- Address industrial relations issues in sectors other than garments
- Establish Labour Court
- Enhance women's leadership in professional organizations

##### **Priority area 2: Rights and social protection**

- Extend coverage of social protection
- Promote the rights of vulnerable groups (women, youth, disabled, HIV-positive people, indigenous peoples)
- Labour migration management, especially women migrant workers
- Eliminate child labour and the worst forms of child labour
- Address youth employment

##### **Priority area 3: Enabling environment for employment creation**

- Develop and implement NEP and NSPS
- Link skills development with labour market needs
- Strengthen and further develop labour market information and employment services
- Promote gender equality in TVET and employment

#### *Employers' group*

##### **Priority area 1: Improving industrial relations in Cambodia**

- Increase the capacity of social partners to dialogue
- Develop and improve mechanisms for a genuine social dialogue
- Develop and improve existing legislation (labour law, trade union law)
- Ensure rule of law
- Help constituencies to provide relevant trainings in collective bargaining, workplace cooperation, labour law and the trade union law

##### **Priority area 2: Gender balanced skills development and job creation (and increased labour productivity)**

- Develop national skills strategy
- Develop a comprehensive and genuine system to certify training providers
- Introduce national vocational certification system
- Review primary education programme to ensure we are developing "core skills", such as problem solving, IT, English, maths, literacy
- Strengthen labour market information system
- Review and share/explore good practices on occupational safety on all the above
- Encourage ongoing on-the-job training (internal training) provided by employers and subsidized by the Government

**Priority area 3: Improving OSH**

- Review (by involving workers and employers) the national OSH strategy to enhance OSH implementation
- Improve information collection on OSH to prevent and reduce accidents and disease
- Promote OSH culture at enterprise level, including setting the enterprise OSH systems (workers and employers)
- Develop specific SME OSH strategy
- Provide training in OSH (such as CAMFEBA, but subsidized by the Government)

***Trade unions group*****Priority area 1: Improved Industrial relations through a better social dialogue and legal mechanism**

- Finalize the trade union law and its implement widely and effectively
- Establish and implement collective bargaining for all industries and all sectors
- Establish a mechanism of labour resolution and its implementation for all industries/sectors
- Strengthen labour inspection mechanism
- Establish the social dialogue mechanism for the formal and informal sectors

**Priority area 2: Rights and social protection of vulnerable groups**

- Develop unemployment funds and scheme
- Improve domestic and international labour migration management
- Eliminate child labour for creation of jobs for youth
- Promote social, economic, educational and cultural rights of indigenous communities
- Establish social security funds for informal economy workers

**Priority area 3: Enabling environment for job security and employment creation.**

- Link skills development with the labour markets for formal and informal economies
- Establish and implement the national employment policy and planning
- Strengthen labour market information system and services
- Promote easy access to credit and microfinance for jobs creation
- Promote cooperatives for the increase of women employment

***Other actors (including UN agencies and NGOs)*****Priority area 1: Industrial relations**

- trade union law and its implementation
- Revise and develop regulations
- Improve labour dispute resolution mechanism
- Address industrial relation issues in garment tourism, construction, agriculture and including informal sectors
- Implement industry-wide collective bargaining agreement
- Productivity and enhancement

**Priority area 2: Social protection for vulnerable groups**

- Labour migration, internal and external migrant workers
- Child labour and youth employment
- Rights of indigenous communities
- Health of workers in both formal and informal sectors
- New law on disabilities and its implementation
- Rural women



**Priority area 3: Enabling environment for employment creation**

- Social security (health insurance, pension schemes)
- Develop and implement national employment policy, focusing on youth employment and national social protection strategy
- Maternity protection
- Skills development and employability
- Strengthen the labour market information system and employment services, both with national and provincial levels (labour centre)
- Raise awareness of green jobs and productivity

**Crossing-cutting priority areas**

- Gender equality and equity
- Raise awareness of green jobs and productivity



## **Report on the review of the ILO Decent Work Country Programme: Cambodia (2008–2010)**

The ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific and the ILO Country Office Bangkok organized a review of the Cambodia DWCP (2008–2010) to take stock of the progress achieved, the constraints encountered, lessons learnt, and to identify where and how improvements can be made for future programming. The extensive and participatory consultations with ILO constituents and other partners were held throughout the review process.

The criteria used for the review of the overall performance of the DWCP includes the role and relevance of ILO in Cambodia, its niche and comparative advantage, tripartite participation and partnership, the focus and coherence of the programme's design and strategies, the evidence of direct and indirect results of ILO's contributions and support at national level, the efficiency and adequacy of organizational arrangements to deliver the ILO's programme in Cambodia, and knowledge management and sharing.

In addition to the overall performance, the review also looks at the progress and performance of the four specific outcomes using five criteria i.e. resource adequacy, delivery of outputs, use of outputs by partners and target groups, progress made against outcome indicators/milestones and the emerging risks and opportunities.

**ILO Regional Office for Asia and the Pacific**  
United Nations Building, 11<sup>th</sup> floor  
Rajdamnern Nok Avenue, Bangkok 10200, Thailand  
Tel: +662 288 1234, Fax: +662 288 3062  
Email: [BANGKOK@ilo.org](mailto:BANGKOK@ilo.org)

[www.ilo.org/asia](http://www.ilo.org/asia)



ISBN 978-92-2-125551-2